E/2004/22
E/C.12/2003/14

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

REPORT ON THE THIRTIETH AND THIRTY-FIRST SESSIONS

(5-23 May 2003, 10-28 November 2003)

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

OFFICIAL RECORDS, 2004

SUPPLEMENT No. 2

UNITED NATIONS

E/2004/22
E/C.12/2003/14

COMMITTEE ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS

REPORT ON THE THIRTIETH AND THIRTY-FIRST SESSIONS

(5-23 May 2003, 10-28 November 2003)

ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL

OFFICIAL RECORDS, 2004

SUPPLEMENT No. 2

UNITED NATIONS
New York and Geneva, 2004

NOTE

Symbols of United Nations documents are composed of capital letters combined with figures. Mention of such a symbol indicates a reference to a United Nations document.

E/2004/22
E/C.12/2003/14

CONTENTS

Paragraphs *Page*

Abbreviations 7

Chapter

I. ORGANIZATIONAL AND OTHER MATTERS .... 1 - 22 8

A. States parties to the Covenant 1 8

B. Sessions and agenda .... 2 - 7 8

C. Membership and attendance .... 8 - 11 9

D. Pre-sessional working group .... 12 - 14 10

E. Election of Officers 15 11

F. Organization of work .... 16 - 19 11

G. Next sessions 20 12

H. States parties' reports scheduled for consideration by the Committee at its upcoming sessions .... 21 - 22 13

II. OVERVIEW OF THE PRESENT WORKING METHODS OF THE COMMITTEE .... 23 - 54 14

A. General guidelines for reporting 25 14

B. Examination of States parties' reports .... 26 - 37 14

1. Work of the pre-sessional working group .... 26 - 32 14

2. Consideration of the report .... 33 - 36 15

3. Postponement of the consideration of reports 37 16

C. Follow-up procedure in relation to the consideration of reports .... 38 - 41 17

D. Procedure in response to non-submitted and considerably overdue reports .... 42 - 44 18

CONTENTS (*continued*)

Chapter			*Paragraphs*	*Page*
II. *(cont'd)*	E.	Day of general discussion	45	19
	F.	Other consultations	46 - 47	19
	G.	Participation of non-governmental organizations in the work of the Committee	48 - 49	19
	H.	General comments	50 - 53	20
	I.	Statements adopted by the Committee	54	21
III.		SUBMISSION OF REPORTS BY STATES PARTIES UNDER ARTICLES 16 AND 17 OF THE COVENANT	55 - 57	22
IV.		CONSIDERATION OF REPORTS SUBMITTED BY STATES PARTIES UNDER ARTICLES 16 AND 17 OF THE COVENANT	58 - 558	23

Thirtieth session

Luxembourg .... 62 - 107 24

Brazil .... 108 - 173 28

New Zealand .... 174 - 211 35

Iceland .... 212 - 243 39

Israel .... 244 - 290 42

Thirty-first session

Republic of Moldova .... 291 - 343 49

Yemen .... 344 - 392 55

Guatemala .... 393 - 442 59

Russian Federation .... 443 - 509 64

Democratic People's Republic of Korea .... 510 - 558 71

CONTENTS (*continued*)

Paragraphs *Page*

Chapter

V. SUBSTANTIVE ISSUES ARISING IN THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANT ON ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS .... 559 - 601 77

A. Cooperation with specialized agencies: first meeting of the Joint Expert Group UNESCO (Committee on Conventions and Recommendations)/Economic and Social Council (Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights) on the Monitoring of the Right to Education .... 559 - 576 77

B. Day of general discussion: the right to work (art. 6 of the Covenant) .... 577 - 601 82

VI. DECISIONS ADOPTED AND MATTERS DISCUSSED BY THE COMMITTEE AT ITS THIRTIETH AND THIRTY-FIRST SESSIONS .... 602 - 614 89

A. Action taken by the Committee on information on economic, social and cultural rights received from sources other than the States parties .... 602 - 607 89

B. Cooperation with specialized agencies 608 90

C. Day of general discussion 609 90

D. General comments 610 90

E. Secretary-General's proposals on the United Nations human rights treaty bodies system 611 91

F. Cooperation with special procedures' mechanisms of the Commission on Human Rights 612 91

G. Workshop on follow-up action to the Committee's concluding observations .... 613 - 614 91

VII. ADOPTION OF THE REPORT 615 92

CONTENTS (*continued*)

Page

Annexes

I. States parties to the Covenant and status of submission of reports 93

II. Members of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 106

III. A. Agenda of the thirtieth session of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (5-23 May 2003) 107

B Agenda of the thirty-first session of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (10-28 November 2003) 107

IV. Recommendations of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights on reform of the treaty body system and the Secretary-General's proposals 109

V. List of general comments adopted by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 112

VI. List of statements adopted by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 114

VII. Days of general discussion held by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights 116

VIII. A. List of States parties' delegations which participated in the consideration of their respective reports by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights at its thirtieth session 117

B. List of States parties' delegations which participated in the consideration of their respective reports by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights at its thirty-first session 120

IX. A. List of documents of the Committee at its thirtieth session 126

B. List of documents of the Committee at its thirty-first session 127

ABBREVIATIONS

AIDS	acquired immunodeficiency syndrome
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
GNP	gross national product
HIV	human immunodeficiency virus
ILO	International Labour Office International Labour Organization
IMF	International Monetary Fund
Roster	Roster of organizations that do not have general or special consultative status*
UNAIDS	Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UN-Habitat	United Nations Human Settlements Programme
UNHCR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
WHO	World Health Organization
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organization
World Bank	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
WTO	World Trade Organization

---

* In conformity with Economic and Social Council resolution 1996/31 of 25 July 1996, these are organizations "that the Council, or the Secretary-General, in consultation with the Council or its Committee on Non-Governmental Organizations, considers can make occasional and useful contributions to the work of the Council or its subsidiary bodies or other United Nations bodies within their competence […]. This list may also include organizations in consultative status or a similar relationship with a specialized agency or a United Nations body. These organizations shall be available for consultation at the request of the Council or its subsidiary bodies. The fact that an organization is on the Roster shall not in itself be regarded as a qualification for general or special consultative status should an organization seek such status".

CHAPTER I

Organizational and other matters

A. States parties to the Covenant

1. As of 28 November 2003, the closing date of the thirty-first session of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, 148 States had ratified or acceded to the Internation Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, which was adopted by the General Assembly in resolution 2200 A (XXI) of 16 December 1966 and opened for signature and ratification in New York on 19 December 1966. The Covenant entered into force on 3 January 1976 in accordance with the provisions of its article 27. A list of States parties t the Covenant and the status of submission of their reports are contained in annex I to the pres report.

B. Sessions and agenda

2. The Committee, at its twelfth session, requested the Economic and Social Council to authorize the holding of two annual sessions of the Committee, in May and November-December, each of three weeks' duration, in addition to a pre-sessional working group of five members to meet for five days immediately after each session to prepare the list issues for consideration at the subsequent session. The Council, by its resolution 1995/39 of 25 July 1995, endorsed the Committee's recommendation.

3. At the request made by the Committee at its twentieth session (1999), the Economic and Social Council adopted on 30 July 1999 decision 1999/287, consequently approved by General-Assembly resolution 54/251 (Part IV) of 23 December 1999, concerning the holding two additional three-week extraordinary sessions of the Committee, as well as corresponding pre-sessional meetings of the working group of one week's duration during 2000 and 2001, respectively. The Council also requested that those sessions be entirely used for the consideration of reports of the States parties in order to reduce the backlog of reports, and requested the Committee to consider ways and means to improve the efficiency of its workin methods and to report to the Council in 2001 on the actions taken in this regard.

4. At its twenty-fifth session, in response to the Economic and Social Council request, th Committee discussed ways and means to improve the efficiency of its working methods and submitted its conclusions to the Council at its substantive session in 2001.[1]

5. Two extraordinary sessions held by the Committee in 2000 and 2001 allowed it to cle up the backlog of reports pending consideration and, as from 2002, the Committee reverted t original two sessions per year programme of work.

---

[1] See *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 2002, Supplement No. 2* (E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/1 chap. VI, paras. 1016 et seq.

6. Accordingly, in 2003, the Committee held its thirtieth session from 5 to 23 May, and its thirty-first session from 10 to 28 November. Both sessions were held at the United Nations Office at Geneva. The agenda for each session is shown in annex III to the present report.

7. An account of the Committee's deliberations at its thirtieth and thirty-first sessions is contained in the relevant summary records (E/C.12/2003/SR.1-29 and E/C.12/2003/SR.30-56, respectively).

C. Membership and attendance

8. All members of the Committee, except Mr. Kenneth Osborne Rattray, attended the thirtieth session. (For a list of members of the Committee, see annex II below.) All members of the Committee, except Mr. Ariranga Govindasamy Pillay and Mr. Kenneth Osborne Rattray, attended the thirty-first session.

9. The following specialized agencies and United Nations organs were invited to be represented by observers at the thirtieth and thirty-first sessions: FAO, ILO, IMF, UNAIDS, UNCTAD, UNDP, UNFPA, UNEP, UNESCO, UNHCR, UNICEF, WHO, WIPO, World Bank and WTO.

10. The following non-governmental organizations in consultative status with the Economic and Social Council were represented by observers:

At the thirtieth session:

Special consultative status: American Association of Jurists, Association of Organizations for Social and Educational Assistance, Center for Economic and Social Rights, Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions, Habitat International Coalition, Inclusion International, International Commission of Jurists, International Federation of Human Rights Leagues, International League for the Rights and Liberation of Peoples, International Organization for the Development of Freedom of Education, Latin American Committee for the Defence of Women's Rights, Oxfam GB, Rights and Democracy, World Organization Against Torture;

Roster: American Association for the Advancement of Science, FIAN-Foodfirst Information and Action Network.

At the thirty-first session:

Special consultative status: Association of Indigenous Peoples of the North, Siberia and Far East of the Russian Federation (RAIPON), Centre on Housing Rights and Evictions, Habitat International Coalition, Inclusion International, International Association of Democratic Lawyers, International Commission of Jurists, International Federation of Human Rights Leagues, International Federation Terre des Hommes, International

Organization for the Development of Freedom of Education, International Service for Human Rights, Women's International League for Peace and Freedom, World Organization Against Torture;

Roster: American Association for the Advancement of Science, FIAN-Foodfirst Information and Action Network.

11. The following national and international non-governmental organizations were represented by observers at the thirtieth and thirty-first sessions: Arab Association for Human Rights, Brazilian Platform on Economic, Social and Cultural Human Rights, Center for Religious Statistics and Social Concern of the National Conference of Bishops of Brazil, Center for the Development of Democracy and Human Rights (Russian Federation), Civic Democratic Initiatives Support Foundation (Yemen), Consortium of Women's Non-Governmental Associations (Russian Federation), Contextos Latinoamericanos para la Promoción de los Derechos Económicos, Sociales y Culturales (Switzerland), Coordinación de ONG y Cooperativas (Guatemala), Coordinadora Nacional de Organizaciones Campesinas (Guatemala), Coordinadora por la Exigibilidad de los Derechos Económicos, Sociales y Culturales (Guatemala), Derechos Humanos Económicos, Sociales y Culturales en Guatemala, Femina (Tatarstan Republic, Russian Federation), Helsinki Committee for Human Rights (Moldova), Human Rights Foundation for Civil Society (Russian Federation), International Anti-Poverty Law Center (United States of America), International Network for Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (United States of America), International Women's Rights Action Watch (United States of America), Justice and Peace Commission (Brazil), Liga Guatemalteca de Higiene Mental, "Memorial" (Komi Republic, Russian Federation), National Council of Women (Moldova), NOCHLEZHKA St Petersburg Regional Charitable Organisation for the Homeless, Palestinian Independent Commission for Citizens' Rights, Pastoral de la Tierra Interdiocesana (Guatemala), Regional Council for the Palestinian Bedouin of the Unrecognized Villages, Sisters Arabic Forum for Human Rights (Yemen), Women Affairs Support Center (Yemen).

D. Pre-sessional working group

12. The Economic and Social Council, in its resolution 1988/4 of 24 May 1988, authorized the establishment of a pre-sessional working group composed of five members to be appointed by the Chairperson to meet for up to one week prior to each session. By decision 1990/252 of 25 May 1990, the Council authorized the meetings of the working group to be held one to three months prior to a session of the Committee.

13. The Chairperson of the Committee, in consultation with the members of the Bureau, designated the following individuals as members of the pre-sessional working group to meet:

Prior to the thirty-second session:

Mr. Clément ATANGANA

Ms. Rocío BARAHONA-RIERA

Ms. Maria Virginia BRAS GOMES

Mr. Yuri KOLOSOV

Mr. Waleed M. SADI

Prior to the thirty-third session:

Ms. Virginia BONOAN-DANDAN

Mr. Dumitru CEAUSU

Mr. Azzouz KERDOUN

Mr. Giorgio MALINVERNI

Mr. Álvaro TIRADO MEJÍA

14. The pre-sessional working group held its meetings at the United Nations Office at Geneva from 1 to 5 December 2003. All members of the working group attended its meetings. The working group identified issues that might most usefully be discussed with the representatives of the reporting States and lists of such questions were transmitted to the permanent missions of the States concerned. The pre-sessional working group designated for the thirty-third session will hold its meetings from 17 to 21 May 2004.

E. Election of Officers

15. In accordance with rule 14 of the Committee's rules of procedure, the Committee, at its first meeting of its thirtieth session on 5 May 2003, elected the members of its Bureau, as follows:

Chairperson:	Ms. Virginia BONOAN-DANDAN
Vice-Chairpersons:	Mr. Azzouz KERDOUN
	Mr. Jaime MARCHÁN ROMERO
	Mr. Eibe RIEDEL
Rapporteur:	Mr. Dumitru CEAUSU

F. Organization of work

Thirtieth session

16. The Committee considered its organization of work at its 1st meeting on 5 May 2003. In connection with this item, the Committee had before it the following documents:

(*a*) Draft programme of work for the thirtieth session, prepared by the Secretary-General in consultation with the Chairperson of the Committee (E/C.12/2003/L.1);

(*b*) Reports of the Committee on the work of its previous sessions:* first (E/1987/28-E/C.12/1987/5), second (E/1988/14-E/C.12/1988/4), third (E/1989/22-E/C.12/1989/5), fourth (E/1990/23-E/C.12/1990/3 and Corr.1), fifth (E/1991/23-E/C.12/1990/8 and Corr.1), sixth (E/1992/23-E/C.12/1991/4 and Add.1), seventh (E/1993/22-E/C.12/1992/2), eighth and ninth (E/1994/23-E/C.12/1993/19), tenth and eleventh (E/1995/22-E/C.12/1994/20 and Corr.1), twelfth and thirteenth (E/1996/22-E/C.12/1995/18), fourteenth and fifteenth (E/1997/22-E/C.12/1996/6), sixteenth and seventeenth (E/1998/22-E/C.12/1997/10), eighteenth and nineteenth (E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26), twentieth and twenty-first (E/2000/22-E/C.12/1999/11 and Corr.1), twenty-second, twenty-third and twenty-fourth sessions (E/2001/22-E/C.12/2000/21), twenty-fifth, twenty-sixth and twenty-seventh sessions (E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17), and twenty-eighth and twenty-ninth sessions (E/2003/22-E/C.12/2002/13).

17. In accordance with rule 8 of its rules of procedure, the Committee, at the same meeting, considered the draft programme of work for its thirtieth session and approved it, as amended during consideration (E/C.12/2003/4).

Thirty-first session

18. The Committee considered its organization of work at its 30th meeting on 10 November 2003. In connection with this item, the Committee had before it the following documents:

(*a*) Draft programme of work for the thirty-first session, prepared by the Secretary-General in consultation with the Chairperson of the Committee (E/C.12/2003/L.2);

(*b*) Reports of the Committee on the work of its previous sessions (see paragraph 16 (*b*) above).

19. In accordance with rule 8 of its rules of procedure, the Committee, at the same meeting, considered the draft programme of work for its thirty-first session and approved it, as amended during consideration (E/C.12/2003/13).

G. Next sessions

20. In accordance with the established schedule, the thirty-second and thirty-third sessions would take place from 26 April to 14 May and from 8 to 26 November 2004, respectively.

---

* Published as *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council*.

H. States parties' reports scheduled for consideration by the Committee at its upcoming sessions

21. In accordance with rule 61, paragraph 2, of the rules of procedure of the Committee, the reports submitted by States parties under article 16 of the Covenant are scheduled for consideration in the order in which they have been received by the Secretary-General. The Committee, at its 30th meeting, on 10 November 2003, decided to consider the reports of the following States parties at its thirty-second session:

Initial reports

Lithuania	E/1990/5/Add.55
Greece	E/1990/5/Add.56
Kuwait	E/1990/5/Add.57
Second periodic reports	
Ecuador	E/1990/6/Add.36
Fourth periodic reports	
Spain	E/C.12/4/Add.11

22. In addition to the reports listed in paragraph 21 above, the Committee received as at 28 November 2003, closing date of the thirty-first session, the following reports which were tentatively scheduled for consideration at its upcoming sessions:

Thirty-third session (8-26 November 2004)

Malta	Initial report	E/1990/5/Add.58
Denmark	Fourth periodic report	E/C.12/4/Add.12
Italy	Ditto	E/C.12/4/Add.13
Azerbaijan	Second periodic report	E/1990/6/Add.37
Chile	Third periodic report	E/1994/104/Add.26
Thirty-fourth session (25 April-13 May 2005)		
China	Initial report	E.1990/5/Add.59
Zambia	Ditto	E/1990/5/Add.60
Serbia and Montenegro	Ditto	E/1990/5/Add.61

CHAPTER II

Overview of the present working methods of the Committee

23. This chapter of the Committee's report aims at providing a concise and up-to-date overview and explanation of the ways in which the Committee carries out its various functions. It is designed to make the Committee's current practice more transparent and readily accessible so as to assist States parties and others interested in the implementation of the Covenant.

24. Since its first session, in 1987, the Committee has made a concerted effort to devise appropriate working methods that adequately reflect the nature of the tasks with which it has been entrusted. In the course of its 31 sessions it has sought to modify and develop these methods in the light of its experience. These methods will continue to evolve.

A. General guidelines for reporting

25. The Committee attaches major importance to the need to structure the reporting process and the dialogue with each State party's representatives in such a way as to ensure that the issues of principal concern to it are dealt with in a methodical and informative manner. For this purpose, the Committee has adopted detailed reporting guidelines[2] with a view to assisting States in the reporting process and improving the effectiveness of the monitoring system as a whole. The Committee strongly urges all States parties to report to it in accordance with the guidelines to the greatest extent possible. The Committee keeps its guidelines under review and they are updated when appropriate.

B. Examination of States parties' reports

1. Work of the pre-sessional working group

26. A pre-sessional working group meets, for five days, prior to each of the Committee's sessions. It is composed of five members of the Committee nominated by the Chairperson, taking account of the desirability of a balanced geographical distribution and other relevant factors.

27. The principal purpose of the working group is to identify in advance the questions that will constitute the principal focus of the dialogue with the representatives of the reporting States. The aim is to improve the efficiency of the system and to ease the task of States' representatives by facilitating more focused preparations for the discussion.[3]

28. It is generally accepted that the complex nature and diverse range of many of the issues raised in connection with the implementation of the Covenant constitute a strong argument in

---

[2] *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 1991, Supplement No. 3* (E/1991/23-E/C.12/1990/8), annex IV.

[3] Ibid., *1998, Supplement No.4* (E/1988/14-E/C.12/1988/4), chap. IV, para. 361.

favour of providing States parties with the possibility of preparing in advance to answer some of the principal questions arising out of their reports. Such an arrangement also enhances the likelihood that the State party will be able to provide precise and detailed information.

29. With regard to its own working methods, the working group, in the interests of efficiency, allocates to each of its members initial responsibility for undertaking a detailed review of a specific number of reports and for putting before the working group a preliminary list of issues. The decision as to how the reports should be allocated for this purpose is based in part on the areas of expertise of the member concerned. Each draft by a country rapporteur is then revised and supplemented on the basis of observations by the other members of the working group and the final version of the list is adopted by the working group as a whole. This procedure applies equally to both initial and periodic reports.

30. In preparation for the pre-sessional working group, the Committee has asked the secretariat to place at the disposal of its members a country analysis as well as all pertinent documents containing information relevant to each of the reports to be examined. For this purpose, the Committee invites all concerned individuals, bodies and non-governmental organizations to submit relevant and appropriate documentation to the secretariat. It has also asked the secretariat to ensure that certain types of information are regularly placed in the country files.

31. The lists of issues drawn up by the working group are given directly to a representative of the States concerned, along with a copy of the Committee's most recent report and with a note stating the following:

> "The list is not intended to be exhaustive and it should not be interpreted as limiting or in any other way prejudging the type and range of questions which members of the Committee might wish to ask. However, the Committee believes that the constructive dialogue which it wishes to have with the representatives of the State party is greatly facilitated by making the list available in advance of the Committee's session. In order to improve the dialogue that the Committee seeks, it strongly urges each State party to provide in writing its replies to the list of issues and to do so sufficiently in advance of the session at which its report will be considered to enable the replies to be translated and made available to all members of the Committee."

32. In addition to the task of formulating the lists of issues, the pre-sessional working group is also entrusted with a variety of other tasks designed to facilitate the work of the Committee as a whole. These have included: discussing the most appropriate allocation of time for the consideration of each State report; considering the issue of how best to respond to supplementary reports containing additional information; examining draft general comments; considering how best to structure the day of general discussion; and other relevant matters.

2. Consideration of the report

33. In accordance with the established practice of each of the United Nations human rights treaty monitoring bodies, representatives of the reporting States should be present at the meetings of the Committee when their reports are examined in order to ensure a constructive

dialogue with the Committee. The following procedure is generally used: the representative of the State party is invited to introduce the report by making brief introductory comments and introducing any written replies to the list of issues drawn up by the pre-sessional working group. The Committee then considers the report by clusters of articles (usually 1-5, 6-9, 10-12, 13-15), taking particular account of the replies furnished in response to the list of issues. The Chairperson will normally invite questions or comments from Committee members in relation to each issue and then invite the representatives of the State party to reply immediately to questions that do not require further reflection or research. Other questions remaining to be answered are taken up at a subsequent meeting or, if necessary, may be the subject of additional information provided to the Committee in writing. Members of the Committee are free to pursue specific issues in the light of the replies thus provided, although the Committee has urged them not to (*a*) raise issues outside the scope of the Covenant; (*b*) repeat questions already posed or answered; (*c*) add unduly to an already long list on a particular issue; or (*d*) speak more than five minutes in any one intervention. Representatives of relevant specialized agencies and other international bodies may also be invited to contribute at any stage of the dialogue.

34. The final phase of the Committee's examination of the report consists of the drafting and adoption of its concluding observations. For this purpose, the Committee usually sets aside a brief period in closed session, immediately after the conclusion of the dialogue, to enable its members to express their preliminary views. The country rapporteur then prepares, with the assistance of the secretariat, a draft set of concluding observations for consideration by the Committee. The agreed structure of the concluding observations is as follows: introduction; positive aspects; factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant; principal subjects of concern; and suggestions and recommendations. At a later stage, the Committee then discusses the draft, again in private session, with a view to adopting it by consensus.

35. The concluding observations, once formally adopted, are usually not made public until the final day of the session. As soon as they are made public - at 6 p.m. of the closing day of the session - they are available to all interested parties. They are forwarded as soon as possible to the State party concerned and included in the Committee's report. If it so wishes, the State party may address any of the Committee's concluding observations in the context of any additional information that it provides to the Committee.

36. In general, the Committee devotes three meetings (of three hours each) to its public examination of States parties' reports. In addition, it generally devotes between two and three hours towards the end of the session, in private, to its discussion of each set of concluding observations.

3. Postponement of the consideration of reports

37. Last-minute requests by States to postpone the consideration of a report that has been scheduled for examination at a particular session are extremely disruptive for all concerned and have caused major problems for the Committee in the past. Accordingly, the Committee's long-standing policy is not to grant such requests and to proceed with its consideration of all scheduled reports, even in the absence of a representative of the State party concerned.

C. Follow-up procedure in relation to the consideration of reports

38. At its twenty-first session,[4] the Committee decided that:

(*a*) In all concluding observations, the Committee will request the State party to inform the Committee, in its next periodic report, about steps taken to implement the recommendations in the concluding observations;

(*b*) Where appropriate, the Committee may, in its concluding observations, make a specific request to a State party to provide more information or statistical data at a time prior to the date that the next periodic report is due to be submitted;

(*c*) Where appropriate, the Committee may, in its concluding observations, ask the State party to respond to any pressing specific issue identified in the concluding observations prior to the date that the next report is due to be submitted;

(*d*) Any information provided in accordance with (*b*) and (*c*) above will be considered by the next meeting of the Committee's pre-sessional working group;

(*e*) In general, the working group could recommend that the Committee take one of the following measures:

(i) That the Committee take note of such information;

(ii) That the Committee adopt specific additional concluding observations in response to that information;

(iii) That the matter be pursued through a request for further information; or

(iv) That the Committee's Chairperson be authorized to inform the State party, in advance of the next session, that the Committee will take up the issue at its next session and that, for that purpose, the participation of a representative of the State party in the work of the Committee would be welcome;

(*f*) If the information requested in accordance with (*b*) and (*c*) is not provided by the specified date, or is patently unsatisfactory, the Chairperson, in consultation with the members of the Bureau, could be authorized to follow up the matter with the State party.

39. In situations in which the Committee considers that it is unable to obtain the information it requires on the basis of the above-mentioned procedures, it may decide to adopt a different approach instead. In particular, the Committee may request that the State party concerned accept a mission consisting of one or two members of the Committee. The purposes of such an on-site visit would be: (*a*) to collect the information necessary for the Committee to continue its constructive dialogue with the State party and to enable it to carry out its functions in relation to

---

[4] On 1 December 1999 (53rd meeting).

the Covenant; (*b*) to provide a more comprehensive basis upon which the Committee might exercise its functions in relation to articles 22 and 23 of the Covenant concerning technical assistance and advisory services. The Committee would state specifically the issue(s) with respect to which its representative(s) would seek to gather information from all available sources. The representative(s) would also have the task of considering whether the programme of advisory services administered by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights could be of assistance in connection with the specific issue at hand.

40. At the conclusion of the visit, the representative(s) would report to the Committee. In the light of the report presented by its representative(s), the Committee would then formulate its own conclusions. Those conclusions would relate to the full range of functions carried out by the Committee, including those relating to technical assistance and advisory services, to be provided by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights.

41. This procedure has already been applied in relation to two States parties and the Committee considers the experience to have been a very positive one in both instances. In a case where the State party concerned does not accept the proposed mission, the Committee will consider making whatever recommendations might be appropriate to the Economic and Social Council.

D. Procedure in response to non-submitted and considerably overdue reports

42. The Committee believes that a situation of persistent non-reporting by States parties risks bringing the entire supervisory procedure into disrepute, thereby undermining one of the foundations of the Covenant.

43. Accordingly, the Committee resolved at its sixth session to begin in due course to consider the situation concerning the implementation of the Covenant in respect of each State party whose reports are very significantly overdue. At its seventh session it resolved to begin scheduling consideration of such reports at its future sessions and to notify the States parties concerned. It began to apply this procedure at its ninth session.

44. The Committee has adopted the following procedure:

(*a*) To select States parties whose reports are very significantly overdue on the basis of the length of time involved;

(*b*) To notify such State party that the Committee intends to consider the situation with respect to that country at one of its succeeding sessions;

(*c*) To move, in the absence of any report, to consider the status of economic, social and cultural rights in the light of all available information;

(*d*) To authorize its Chairperson, in situations where the State party concerned indicates that a report will be provided to the Committee and upon a request from the State party, to defer consideration of the situation for one session.

E. Day of general discussion

45. At each session, the Committee devotes one day, usually the Monday of the third week, to a general discussion of a particular right or of a particular aspect of the Covenant. The purpose is threefold: such a general discussion assists the Committee in developing in greater depth its understanding of the relevant issues; it enables the Committee to encourage inputs into its work from all interested parties, and helps to lay the basis for a future general comment. The issues that have been the focus of discussions held to date by the Committee may be found in annex VII to the present report.

F. Other consultations

46. The Committee has sought to coordinate its work with those of other bodies to the greatest extent possible and to draw as widely as it can on available expertise in the fields of its competence. The Committee has also sought to draw on the expertise of the relevant specialized agencies and United Nations bodies, both in its work as a whole and, more particularly, in the context of its general discussions. It has also consistently invited individuals such as special rapporteurs of the Commission on Human Rights and of the Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights, chairpersons of Commission working groups and others to address it and engage in discussions.

47. In addition, the Committee has invited a variety of experts who have a particular interest in, and knowledge of, some of the issues under review to contribute to its discussions. These contributions have added to its understanding of some aspects of the questions arising under the Covenant.

G. Participation of non-governmental organizations in the work of the Committee

48. In order to ensure that the Committee is as well informed as possible, it provides opportunities for non-governmental organizations to submit relevant information to it.[5] They may do this in writing at any time prior to the consideration of a given State party's report. The Committee's pre-sessional working group is also open to the submission of information in person or in writing from any non-governmental organization, provided that it relates to matters on the agenda of the working group. In addition, the Committee sets aside part of the first afternoon at each of its sessions to enable representatives of non-governmental organizations to provide oral information. Such information should: (*a*) focus specifically on the provisions of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; (*b*) be of direct relevance to matters under consideration by the Committee; (*c*) be credible; (*d*) not be abusive. The relevant meeting is open and provided with interpretation and press services, but is not covered by summary records.

---

[5] See *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 2001, Supplement No. 2* (E/2001/22-E/C.12/2000/21), annex V: "Non-governmental organization participation in the activities of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights".

49. The Committee has requested the secretariat to ensure that any written information formally submitted to it by non-governmental organizations in relation to the consideration of a specific State party report is made available as soon as possible to the representative of the State concerned. The Committee therefore assumes that if any of this information is referred to during the dialogue with the State party, the latter will already be aware of the information.

H. General comments*

50. By the end of its thirty-first session (28 November 2003), the Committee and the sessional working group of governmental experts, which existed prior to the creation of the Committee, had examined 153 initial reports, 71 second periodic reports concerning rights covered by articles 6 to 9, 10 to 12 and 13 to 15 of the Covenant, and 115 comprehensive reports. This work covered a significant number of the States parties to the Covenant, which totalled 148 at the end of the thirty-first session. They represented all regions of the world, with different political, legal, socio-economic and cultural systems. Their reports submitted so far have illustrated many of the problems that might arise in implementing the Covenant.

51. In response to an invitation addressed to it by the Economic and Social Council, the Committee decided to begin, as from its third session, the preparation of general comments based on the various articles and provisions of the Covenant, in particular with a view to assisting the States parties in fulfilling their obligations under the Covenant.

52. The Committee endeavours, through its general comments, to make the experience gained so far through the examination of States' reports available for the benefit of all States parties in order to assist and promote their further implementation of the Covenant; to draw the attention of the States parties to insufficiencies disclosed by a large number of reports; to suggest improvements in the reporting procedures; and to stimulate the activities of the States parties, international organizations and the specialized agencies concerned in achieving progressively and effectively the full realization of the rights recognized in the Covenant. Whenever necessary, the Committee may, in the light of the experience of States parties and of the conclusions drawn therefrom, revise and update its general comments.

53. At its twenty-first session, the Committee adopted the outline for drafting general comments on specific rights of the Covenant.[6] The Committee agreed that the subject matter of a particular general comment would influence the overall structure of that comment and observed that the outline was not intended to be strictly adhered to. However, the outline provided useful signposts, a checklist of issues, to be considered in the process of drafting a general comment. In this respect, the outline would assist in ensuring consistency in the content, format and ambit of general comments to be adopted by the Committee. The Committee emphasized the importance of ensuring that general comments are reader-friendly and readily

---

* For the list of general comments adopted to date by the Committee, see annex V below.

[6] *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, Supplement No. 2* (E/2000/22-E/C.12/1999/11 and Corr.1), annex IX.

understandable to a broad range of readers, primarily States parties to the Covenant. The outline will assist in ensuring consistency and clarity in the structure of the general comments, thus promoting their accessibility, and strengthening the authoritative interpretation of the Covenant provided by the Committee through its general comments.

I. Statements adopted by the Committee

54. With a view to assisting States parties to the Covenant, the Committee adopts statements to clarify and confirm its position with respect to major international developments and issues that bear upon the implementation of the Covenant. As at 28 November 2003, the Committee had adopted 15 statements, a list of which appears in annex VI to the present report.

CHAPTER III

Submission of reports by States parties under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant

55. In accordance with rule 58 of its rules of procedure, the Committee, at its 30th meeting on 10 November 2003, considered the status of submission of reports under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant.

56. In that connection, the Committee had before it the following documents:

(*a*) Note by the Secretary-General on the revised general guidelines regarding the form and contents of reports to be submitted by States parties (E/C.12/1991/1);

(*b*) Note by the Secretary-General on States parties to the Covenant and the status of submission of reports as at 1 July 2003 (E/C.12/2003/6);

(*c*) Note by the secretariat on follow-up to the consideration of reports under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant (E/C.12/2003/3).

57. The Secretary-General informed the Committee that, in addition to the reports scheduled for consideration by the Committee at its thirty-first session (see paragraph 59 below), he had received, as at 28 November 2003, the reports submitted under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant by the following States parties:

> Initial report of Lithuania (E/1990/5/Add.55); fourth periodic report of Spain (E/C.12/4/Add.11); initial reports of Greece (E/1990/5/Add.56) and Kuwait (E/1990/5/Add.57); and second periodic report of Ecuador (E/1990/6/Add.36); initial report of Malta (E/1990/5/Add.58); fourth periodic reports of Denmark (E/C.12/4/Add.12) and Italy (E/C.12/4/Add.13); second periodic report of Azerbaijan (E/1990/6/Add.37); third periodic report of Chile (E/1994/104/Add.26); and initial reports of China (E/1990/5/Add.59) and Zambia (E/1990/5/Add.60); and initial report of Serbia and Montenegro (E/1990/5/Add.61).

CHAPTER IV

Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant

58. At its thirtieth session, the Committee examined the following reports submitted by five States parties under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant:

Initial reports	
Brazil	E/1990/5/Add.53
Second periodic reports	
Israel	E/1990/6/Add.32
New Zealand	E/1990/6/Add.33
Third periodic reports	
Luxembourg	E/1994/104/Add.24
Iceland	E/1994/104/Add.25

59. At its thirty-first session, the Committee considered the following reports submitted by five States parties under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant.

Initial reports	
Republic of Moldova	E/1990/5/Add.52
Yemen	E/1990/5/Add.54
Second periodic reports	
Guatemala	E/1990/6/Add.34/Rev.1
Democratic People's Republic of Korea	E/1990/6/Add.35
Fourth periodic reports	
Russian Federation	E/C.12/4/Add.10

60. In accordance with rule 62 of the Committee's rules of procedure, representatives of all States submitting a report were invited to participate in the meetings of the Committee at which their reports were considered. All States parties whose reports were considered by the Committee sent representatives to participate in the consideration of their respective reports. In accordance with a decision adopted by the Committee at its second session, the names and positions of the members of each State party's delegation are listed in annex VIII to the present report.

61. At its eighth session, the Committee had decided to discontinue its practice of including in its annual report summaries of the consideration of country reports. In accordance with modified rule 57 of the Committee's rules of procedure, the annual report should contain, inter alia, the concluding observations of the Committee relating to each State party's report. Accordingly, the following paragraphs, arranged on a country-by-country basis according to the sequence followed by the Committee in its consideration of the reports, contain the concluding observations adopted by the Committee with respect to the States parties' reports considered at its thirtieth and thirty-first sessions. In accordance with established practice within the Committee, members participate in neither the drawing up nor the adoption of concluding observations on their own country's report.

Thirtieth session

LUXEMBOURG

62. The Committee considered the third periodic report of Luxembourg on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1994/104/Add.24) at its 5th and 6th meetings, held on 7 May 2003, and made public, at its 29th meeting, held on 23 May 2003, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

63. The Committee welcomes the third periodic report of the State party, which was in general prepared in conformity with the Committee's guidelines although the information provided was not sufficient for the Committee to assess developments in the status of implementation of some of the Covenant's provisions. In particular, the Committee regrets the lack of comparative and disaggregated statistical data.

64. The Committee notes with appreciation the comprehensive written replies given by the State party. It regrets, however, that the replies were not submitted prior to the session and were only available in French.

65. The Committee welcomes the open and constructive dialogue with the delegation of the State party. It regrets, however, that the delegation did not include more experts, which would have allowed for a constructive dialogue in all fields covered by the Covenant.

B. Positive aspects

66. The Committee notes with appreciation the State party's continuing efforts to comply with its obligations under the Covenant and the overall high level of protection afforded to economic, social and cultural rights in Luxembourg.

67. The Committee notes with satisfaction that Luxembourg allocates more than 0.7 per cent of its GNP to official development assistance and is thus one of the few countries to have gone beyond the United Nations target for development aid. The Committee also welcomes the goal set by the Government to gradually increase its official development assistance contribution to 1 per cent of its GNP by 2005.

68. The Committee welcomes the establishment in 2000 of the Advisory Commission on Human Rights, charged with advising the Government on all questions concerning human rights, including economic, social and cultural rights.

69. The Committee notes with satisfaction that the unemployment rate in the State party remains low.

70. The Committee notes with satisfaction the State party's ratification of ILO Convention No. 111 (1958) concerning discrimination in respect of employment and occupation, in accordance with the Committee's previous recommendations.

71. The Committee welcomes the measures taken by the State party to promote equality between women and men at the workplace, including the law of 28 June 2001 reversing the burden of proof in cases of gender-based discrimination.

72. The Committee notes with appreciation the recent draft amendment to the law governing joint enterprise committees in the private sector, by which foreign workers who are not citizens of the European Union but have a one-year work permit are allowed to serve on joint enterprise committees.

73. The Committee welcomes the measures undertaken by the State party to combat trafficking in persons, child pornography and sexual exploitation of women and children. In particular, the Committee welcomes the extraterritorial application of certain provisions of the Penal Code, allowing for the criminal prosecution of persons, both nationals and non-nationals, for sexual crimes committed abroad.

74. The Committee notes with appreciation the increase in the support and subsidies given by the State party to cultural associations and artists.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

75. The Committee notes the absence of any significant factors or difficulties impeding the effective implementation of the Covenant in Luxembourg.

D. Principal subjects of concern

76. While taking note of the information provided by the State party that international treaties take precedence over national laws, the Committee regrets that the Covenant's rights have not been invoked before the courts.

77. While acknowledging that economic, social and cultural rights of asylum-seekers are generally protected in the State party, the Committee is concerned about the considerable length of time taken to process applications for asylum.

78. The Committee notes that the State party still has not revised the Constitution in order to include the principle of equality between men and women.

79. While noting the measures taken by the State party to integrate persons with disabilities into the labour market, the Committee is concerned that the draft law (No. 4827), introduced on 27 July 2001 regarding the integration of persons with disabilities into the labour market, has still not been adopted.

80. The Committee notes with concern that, despite the good overall employment situation, there has been a recent increase in unemployment, which seems mainly to affect young people.

81. The Committee is concerned about the situation of prisoners who work for private companies and recalls that under ILO Convention No. 29 (1930) concerning forced or compulsory labour, when a private company is involved with work carried out by a prisoner, the latter must consent to such work and the conditions of work (including wages and social security) must be close to those of a free employment relationship.

82. The Committee notes with concern that the State party has not ratified a number of ILO conventions in the area of labour rights and social security, including Convention No. 117 (1962) concerning basic aims and standards of social policy, No. 118 (1962) concerning equality of treatment of nationals and non-nationals in social security and No. 122 (1964) concerning employment policy.

83. The Committee notes with concern that women are still underrepresented in the workforce. While taking note that the disparities between wages of men and women have been reduced, the Committee also notes with concern that the current level of wage difference (women receiving 15 per cent lower wages than men) remains a matter of concern.

84. The Committee remains concerned about the terminological distinction between "legitimate" and "natural" children in the Civil Code. While the distinction does not imply a difference in protection of rights, the Committee expresses its concern about the terminology's pejorative connotations.

85. The Committee reiterates its concern about adolescent health problems, owing in particular to drug abuse and high rates of alcohol and tobacco consumption.

86. The Committee is concerned about the high incidence of suicide in the State party, especially among young people.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

87. The Committee recommends that effective measures be taken by the State party to ensure that legal and judicial training takes full account of the justiciability of Covenant rights and promotes the use of the Covenant as a source of law in domestic courts. In this respect, the Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 9 (1998) on domestic application of the Covenant.

88. The Committee invites the State party to submit, in its next periodic report, its views and comments on the proposal for an optional protocol to the Covenant to be examined by the Open-Ended Working Group established by the Commission on Human Rights at its fifty-ninth session in 2003.

89. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures to expedite the processing of applications for asylum so that the persons concerned may enjoy all the rights that refugee status confers upon them.

90. The Committee recommends that the State party approve the constitutional reform that will guarantee the principle of equality between men and women.

91. The Committee recommends that the State party accelerate the adoption of draft law No. 4827 regarding the integration of persons with disabilities into the labour market.

92. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to reduce the unemployment rate among young people.

93. The Committee recommends that the State party ensure that a prisoner may only perform work for a private company when such work has been consented to and the labour conditions are close to those of a free working relationship as regards wages and social security.

94. The Committee encourages the State party to ratify ILO Conventions Nos. 117 (1962), 118 (1962) and 122 (1964).

95. The Committee calls upon the State party to implement effectively the measures outlined in the national plan of action for employment aimed at increasing the level of participation of women in the labour market and to ensure equal treatment between men and women, including equal remuneration for work of equal value.

96. The Committee recommends that the State party provide information in its fourth periodic report on how it monitors social services provided by private organizations that use public funds, so as to ensure that they conform to the requirements of the Covenant.

97. The Committee recommends that the State party enact as soon as possible the draft law on domestic violence introduced in May 2001, by which a violent spouse may be forced to leave the family home.

98. The Committee recommends that the reference to "legitimate" and "natural" children in the Civil Code be replaced by "children born in wedlock" and "children born out of wedlock", respectively.

99. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to prevent and combat drug abuse, especially among young people, and step up its campaign against alcohol and tobacco abuse.

100. The Committee recommends that the State party take measures to address the high incidence of suicide, especially among young people.

101. The Committee requests the State party to provide disaggregated figures on the incidence of occupational diseases, showing changes during the reporting period, and refers the State party in this regard to the Committee's general comment No. 14 (2000) on the right to the highest attainable standard of health (art. 12 of the Covenant), in particular paragraphs 43 and 44 regarding core obligations.

102. The Committee requests the State party to provide in its next periodic report information on the implementation of the pilot project on early childhood education currently carried out in a number of communes with a view to providing an opportunity for working parents to reconcile professional and family responsibilities.

103. The Committee notes the imminent establishment of a national university (Université de Luxembourg) and recommends that education at the university be free from the outset, or that tuition fees be kept at a minimum level with a view to introducing progressively free higher education, as required by article 13, paragraph 2 (*c*), of the Covenant.

104. The Committee recommends that the State party continue and strengthen its efforts to support and subsidize cultural associations, including those of migrants.

105. The Committee encourages the State party to provide human rights education in schools at all levels and to raise awareness about human rights, in particular economic, social and cultural rights, among State officials and the judiciary.

106. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate widely the present concluding observations among all levels of society, including among State officials and the judiciary, and to inform the Committee of all steps taken to implement them in its next periodic report. It also encourages the State party to continue to consult with non-governmental organizations and other members of civil society in the preparation of its fourth periodic report.

107. The Committee requests the State party to submit its fourth periodic report by 30 June 2008.

BRAZIL

108. The Committee considered the initial report of Brazil on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1990/5/Add.53) at its 8th, 9th and 10th meetings, held on 8 and 9 May 2003, and made public, at its 29th meeting, held on 23 May 2003 the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

109. The Committee welcomes the submission of the initial report of Brazil, which was prepared in conformity with its guidelines, but regrets the late submission of the report and the absence of written replies to the Committee's list of issues (E/C.12/Q/BRA/1).

110. While welcoming the frank nature of the dialogue with the delegation of Brazil, the Committee regrets that there were not enough experts in the delegation in the field of economic, social and cultural rights who could have provided more information to the Committee on the concrete measures taken by the State party to implement its obligations under the Covenant.

B. Positive aspects

111. The Committee notes with appreciation that the Federal Constitution adopted in 1988 incorporates a wide range of human rights, including a number of the economic, social and cultural rights enshrined in the Covenant. The Committee also takes note that under article 5 of the Constitution, the rights and guarantees in international treaties to which Brazil is party are considered part of the national law.

112. The Committee welcomes the adoption of the new Civil Code in 2002 which replaced that of 1916 and established the principle of equality between men and women.

113. The Committee welcomes the adoption of the National Human Rights Programme in May 1996 and the creation of the Secretariat of State for Human Rights to monitor its implementation.

114. The Committee welcomes the new programmes adopted by the State party to combat discrimination, including the establishment of the National Council on the Rights of Women, the National Council to Combat Discrimination and affirmative action programmes for Afro-Brazilians, in particular women.

115. The Committee also welcomes the progress made in combating racial prejudices and barriers, which is illustrated by the appointment of persons of Afro-Brazilian origin to positions of high public office, on the basis of their professional merits and qualifications.

116. The Committee welcomes the programme "Fome Zero" undertaken by the State party aimed at eradicating hunger which affects a substantial portion of the population.

117. The Committee takes note with appreciation of the efforts made by the State party since 1996 to reduce the mortality rate from HIV/AIDS by 50 per cent.

118. The Committee notes with appreciation constitutional amendment No. 14 (adopted on 12 September 1996) which established the Teaching Development and Enhancement Maintenance Fund, reorganized the primary education system and earmarked more resources for education.

119. The Committee welcomes the creation within the State party of independent special rapporteurs responsible for monitoring economic, social and cultural rights, particularly the right to food, to health and to education.

120. The Committee welcomes the positive position of the State party in relation to the draft optional protocol to the Covenant.

121. The Committee welcomes the proactive participation of civil society in monitoring the implementation of the Covenant, including the provision of a large amount of information to the Committee.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

122. The Committee notes that the persistent extreme inequalities and the social injustice prevailing in the State party have negatively affected the implementation of the rights guaranteed by the Covenant.

123. The Committee notes that the recent economic recession, along with certain aspects of the structural adjustment programmes and economic liberalization policies, have had some negative effects on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights as enshrined in the Covenant, in particular by the most disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

D. Principal subjects of concern

124. The Committee notes with concern the persistent and extreme inequalities among the various geographic regions, states and municipalities, and the social injustice prevalent in the State party. The Committee is also concerned about imbalances in the distribution of resources and income and access to basic services in the State party.

125. The Committee is concerned that, despite the existence of constitutional and legislative provisions and administrative procedures to implement the Covenant rights, there are no effective measures and remedies, judicial or otherwise, to uphold these rights, especially with regard to the disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

126. The Committee is concerned about the lack of adequate human rights training in the State party, in particular with respect to the rights enshrined in the Covenant, especially among the judiciary, law enforcement officials and other actors responsible for the implementation of the Covenant.

127. The Committee is concerned about the widespread and deeply rooted discrimination against Afro-Brazilians, indigenous peoples and minority groups such as Gypsies and the Quilombo communities.

128. The Committee notes with concern that equal opportunity for persons with disabilities is hampered by physical barriers and lack of appropriate facilities.

129. The Committee is concerned about the widespread discrimination against women, in particular in their access to the labour market, to equal pay for work of equal value and to adequate representation at all levels of decision-making bodies of the State party.

130. In spite of the State party's successful efforts to release many workers from forced labour, the Committee is deeply concerned about the persistence of forced labour in Brazil, which is often close to slavery, particularly in the rural areas.

131. The Committee is concerned that the national minimum wage is not sufficient to ensure an adequate standard of living for workers and their families.

132. The Committee notes with concern the killing of landless farmers and the members of trade unions defending them and the impunity enjoyed by those responsible for committing these crimes.

133. While taking note of the concern expressed by the State party in relation to the need for better policy coordination for children and young people, the Committee requests the State party to include, in its next periodic report, information on measures taken to improve the functioning of services for children and young people.

134. The Committee notes with concern the high rate of maternal mortality from illegal abortions, particularly in the northern regions where women have insufficient access to health-care facilities. The Committee is also concerned about the persistence of forced sterilization.

135. The Committee is concerned that some articles of the Penal Code discriminate against women. In particular, it is concerned that article 215 of the Code requires the victim of a minor sexual assault to be an "honest woman" in order to prosecute the offence.

136. The Committee notes with concern that sexual and domestic violence is widespread and not being sufficiently denounced in Brazil.

137. The Committee is deeply concerned about the high incidence of trafficking in women for the purpose of sexual exploitation.

138. The Committee notes with concern the high concentration of land in the hands of a minority, and its negative effects on the equitable distribution of wealth.

139. In spite of the efforts taken by the State party to reduce poverty, the Committee is concerned about the persistence of poverty in the State party, especially in the north-east, in rural areas and among Afro-Brazilians and disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

140. The Committee notes with concern that, according to the State party's report, at least 42 per cent of families currently live in inadequate housing facilities without adequate water supply, waste disposal and trash collection. It also notes that 50 per cent of the population of major urban areas lives in informal urban communities (illegal settlements and homes, as stated in paragraph 512 of the State party's report).

141. The Committee notes with concern that the State party has not facilitated the access to, and adequate provision of, housing credit and subsidies to low-income families, especially disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

142. The Committee is deeply concerned that the State party does not provide sufficient protection for indigenous peoples, who continue to be forcibly evicted from their lands and face threats to their lives and even execution. The Committee also notes with concern that the right of indigenous peoples to own land is not respected and that mineral, timber and other commercial interests have been allowed to expropriate, with impunity, large portions of land belonging to indigenous peoples.

143. The Committee is concerned about the forced eviction of the Quilombo communities from their ancestral lands, which are expropriated with impunity by mineral and other commercial interests.

144. The Committee notes with concern the living conditions of prisoners and detainees in the State party, especially with regard to provision of, and access to, health-care facilities, adequate food and safe drinking water.

145. Although the State party has reduced HIV/AIDS-related mortality, the Committee is concerned that, despite these efforts, there has been a significant increase in cases among women and children.

146. The Committee is concerned about the high rate of illiteracy in Brazil that, according to the State party's report, was 13.3 per cent in 1999, reflecting the social and economic inequalities still prevalent in the country.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

147. The Committee recommends that the State party take immediate remedial action to reduce the persistent, extreme inequalities and imbalances in the distribution of resources and income and access to basic services among various geographical regions, states and municipalities, including speeding up the process of agrarian reform and of granting land titles.

148. The Committee urges the State party to take immediate remedial action to ensure that all the Covenant rights are effectively upheld and that concrete remedies, judicial or otherwise, are provided to those whose economic, social and cultural rights are infringed, especially in relation to disadvantaged and marginalized groups. In this regard, the Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 9 (1998) on domestic application of the Covenant.

149. The Committee recommends that the State party improve its human rights training programmes in such a way as to ensure better knowledge, awareness and application of the Covenant and other international human rights instruments, in particular among the judiciary, law enforcement officials and other actors responsible for the implementation of the Covenant.

150. The Committee strongly recommends that the State party's obligations under the Covenant should be taken into account in all aspects of its negotiations with the international financial institutions to ensure that the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights, particularly by the most disadvantaged and marginalized groups, are not undermined.

151. The Committee urges the State party to take all effective measures to prohibit discrimination on the basis of race, colour, ethnic origin or sex in all fields of economic, social and cultural life. It further recommends that the State party undertake urgent measures to ensure equal opportunity for Afro-Brazilians, indigenous peoples and minority groups such as Gypsies and the Quilombo communities, especially in the fields of employment, health and education. The Committee also requests the State party to include in its second periodic report detailed and comprehensive information, including comparative and disaggregated statistical data, on these matters.

152. The Committee urges the State party to adopt all effective measures to ensure equality between men and women as provided for in articles 2, paragraph 2, and 3 of the Covenant. The Committee also requests the State party to adopt in its relevant policies the principle of equal pay for work of equal value as provided for in the Covenant, to reduce the wage gap between men and women, and to provide detailed information on these matters in its second periodic report.

153. The Committee urges the State party to adopt concrete measures to enable persons with disabilities to enjoy fully the rights guaranteed by the Covenant.

154. The Committee urges the State party to implement its National Plan for the Eradication of Slave Labour and to undertake urgent measures in this regard, especially through the imposition of effective penalties.

155. The Committee calls upon the State party to ensure that the minimum wage enables workers and their families to enjoy an adequate standard of living.

156. The Committee urges the State party to take legal action against those who are responsible for committing crimes against landless farmers and members of trade unions and to take effective preventive measures to ensure protection to all farmers and members of trade unions.

157. In the light of the indication given by the State party that the reform of the social security system foresees an improved role for the State in fundamental areas of social development, the Committee recommends to the State party in this regard that the social security system and the social development measures take into account the needs of disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

158. The Committee requests the State party to undertake legislative and other measures, including a review of its present legislation, to protect women from the effects of clandestine and unsafe abortion and to ensure that women do not resort to such harmful procedures. The Committee requests the State party to provide in its next periodic report detailed information, based on comparative data, about maternal mortality and abortion in Brazil.

159. The Committee calls upon the State party to repeal all discriminatory provisions contained in the Penal Code, in particular article 215.

160. The Committee calls upon the State party to take all effective measures, including the enforcement of existing legislation and the extension of national awareness campaigns, to eliminate all forms of violence against women. The Committee also recommends that the State party ensure that in addition to the "*delegacias da mulher*" the police are trained to handle violence against women in all parts of the country.

161. The Committee recommends the adoption by the State party of specific legislation against trafficking in persons and its effective implementation.

162. The Committee urges the State party to take effective measures to combat the problem of poverty, including the setting up of a national anti-poverty strategy that would include economic, social and cultural rights. In this regard, the Committee refers the State party to its statement on poverty and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.[7]

---

[7] *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 2002, Supplement No. 2* (E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17), annex VII).

163. The Committee urges the State party to give effect to its national housing policy and its federal housing programmes and to adopt nationwide policies in order to ensure that families have adequate housing facilities and amenities. In this respect, the Committee draws the State party's attention to its general comment No. 4 (1991) on the right to adequate housing (art. 11 (1) of the Covenant).

164. The Committee urges the State party to provide access to housing credit and subsidies to low-income families and disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

165. The Committee calls upon the State party to ensure that indigenous peoples are effectively protected from threats and danger to their lives and from eviction from their lands. The Committee particularly urges the State party to seek the consent of the indigenous peoples concerned prior to the implementation of timber, soil or subsoil mining projects and any public policy affecting them, in accordance with ILO Convention No. 169 concerning Indigenous and Tribal Peoples in Independent Countries (1989).

166. The Committee urges the State party to adopt measures to guarantee the ancestral lands of the Quilombo communities and to ensure that any evictions are carried out in compliance with the guidelines set out in general comment No. 7 of the Committee (1997) on the right to adequate housing (art. 11, para. 1, of the Covenant): forced evictions.

167. The Committee urges the State party to take effective measures, including policies, programmes and specific legislation, aimed at improving the living conditions of prisoners and detainees.

168. The Committee urges the State party to undertake appropriate measures to ensure effective realization of agrarian reform.

169. The Committee urges the State party to continue its prevention and care efforts in the field of health by providing sexual and reproductive health services to the population, with particular emphasis on those for women, young people and children.

170. The Committee requests the State party to adopt effective measures to combat illiteracy and to provide, in its next periodic report, information on the measures undertaken and on the results obtained. The Committee also requests the State party to include disaggregated and comparative statistics in its periodic report.

171. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely at all levels of society and, in particular, among State officials and the judiciary and to inform the Committee, in its next periodic report, of all steps undertaken to implement them.

172. The Committee also encourages the State party to continue to consult with non-governmental organizations and other members of civil society when preparing the next periodic report.

173. The Committee requests the State party to submit its second periodic report by 30 June 2006.

NEW ZEALAND

174. The Committee considered the second periodic report of New Zealand on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1990/6/Add.33) at its 11th and 12th meetings, held on 12 May 2003, and made public, at its 29th meeting, held on 23 May, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

175. The Committee welcomes the second periodic report of the State party, which was prepared in conformity with the Committee's guidelines. The Committee is particularly satisfied with the comprehensive information provided in the report and in the written replies given by the State party. The Committee also notes with satisfaction that the State party's core document had recently been updated.

176. The Committee welcomes the open and constructive dialogue with the high-level delegation of the State party.

B. Positive aspects

177. The Committee notes with appreciation the State party's continuing efforts to comply with its obligations under the Covenant.

178. The Committee welcomes the Human Rights Amendment Act 2001 which transformed the Office of the Race Relations Conciliator and the New Zealand Human Rights Commission into a new Human Rights Commission with a broader human rights mandate charged with developing a national plan of action for human rights.

179. The Committee notes with appreciation the efforts undertaken by the State party to ensure that the indigenous Maori people enjoy their rights under the Covenant. The Committee notes with satisfaction that the State party's delegation included a senior official of the Ministry of Maori Development.

180. The Committee welcomes the Employment Relations Act 2000 which facilitates collective bargaining, strengthens the role of trade unions and introduces measures of protection against harassment and discrimination in the workplace. The Committee also welcomes the State party's indication of the imminent ratification of ILO Convention No. 98 (1949) concerning the Application of the Principles of the Right to Organise and to Bargain Collectively.

181. The Committee welcomes the introduction of new legislation providing for a government-funded parental leave scheme, whereby 12 weeks' paid parental leave is granted to either parent. The Committee also notes the statement made by the State party that it intends to withdraw its reservation under article 10, paragraph 2, of the Covenant.

182. The Committee appreciates the information on the right to water provided in the report of the State party (paras. 417-418), which was submitted even prior to the adoption of the Committee's general comment No. 15 (2002), on the right to water (arts. 11 and 12 of the Covenant).

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

183. The Committee notes the absence of any significant factors or difficulties impeding the effective implementation of the Covenant by the State party.

D. Principal subjects of concern

184. The Committee notes with regret the view expressed by the State party's delegation that economic, social and cultural rights are not necessarily justiciable.

185. The Committee notes with concern the relatively high unemployment rate among young people.

186. The Committee notes with regret that the State party has not ratified a number of ILO conventions in the area of labour and social security rights, namely Conventions No. 87 (1948) concerning Freedom of Association and Protection of the Right to Organise, No. 117 (1962) concerning Basic Aims and Standards of Social Policy and No. 118 (1962) concerning Equality of Treatment of Nationals and Non-Nationals in Social Security.

187. While noting that measures are being taken by the State party to redress inequality between men and women with regard to employment conditions, the Committee is concerned about the persistence of a gap between the wages of women and men, in contradiction with the principle of equal pay for work of equal value.

188. While taking note of the measures taken by the State party to confront domestic violence under the Ministry of Health Family Violence Project, the Committee is concerned about the persistence of the phenomenon among all socio-economic groups and especially among the indigenous Maori people.

189. The Committee is concerned about the relatively high suicide rate, especially among young people, in the State party.

190. The Committee notes with concern that nearly one in four persons lives in poverty according to the measurement commonly used in the State party, and that clear indicators are lacking to assess the effectiveness of measures to combat poverty.

191. The Committee notes with concern that despite improvements in some health indicators, the general health situation of the indigenous Maori people continues to be worse than that of other segments of the population in the State party. In particular, the Committee is concerned that the life expectancy of Maoris is significantly lower than the national average.

192. The Committee notes with concern that the provision of secondary and tertiary health-care services in rural and remote areas is considerably inferior to that in urban areas.

193. The Committee is concerned about persistent inequalities between the Maori and non-Maori people in access to education and the high dropout rates, especially among Maori children and young people and the disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

194. Affirming the principle of the interdependence and indivisibility of all human rights, the Committee encourages the State party to reconsider its position regarding the justiciability of economic, social and cultural rights. Moreover, the Committee points out that the State party remains under an obligation to give full effect to the Covenant in its domestic legal order, providing for judicial and other remedies for violations of economic, social and cultural rights. In this respect, the Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 9 (1998) on domestic application of the Covenant.

195. The Committee invites the State party to submit, in its next periodic report, its views and comments on the proposal for an optional protocol to the Covenant to be examined by the Open-Ended Working Group established by the Commission on Human Rights at its fifty-ninth session, in 2003.

196. The Committee recommends that the national Human Rights Commission take up economic, social and cultural rights as a comprehensive topic and that it ensure that those rights are duly reflected in the New Zealand Action Plan for Human Rights.

197. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to reduce unemployment among young people and requests further information on this matter in its next periodic report.

198. The Committee encourages the State party to ratify ILO Conventions Nos. 87 (1948), 117 (1962) and 118 (1962) and to withdraw its reservation to article 8 of the Covenant.

199. The Committee encourages the State party to take measures to increase awareness of the possibility of bringing complaints before the Employment Relations Authority or the national Human Rights Commission in cases of employment disputes.

200. The Committee recommends that the State party continue and intensify programmes to reduce inequality between men and women in the workplace, including ensuring equal pay for work of equal value.

201. While acknowledging the ongoing reform of the social welfare system, the Committee recommends that in targeting assistance more specifically to disadvantaged and marginalized groups, including persons with special needs, single-parent families and homeless persons, concerns to contain costs do not lead to a decrease in the level of effective social protection.

202. Given the complexity of the social welfare system with a range of different social security benefits, assistance measures and entitlement conditions, the Committee recommends

that the State party widely disseminate accessible information on the system to all, and especially to those who, owing to language, educational or cultural difficulties, need specific targeted information.

203. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify measures taken to combat domestic violence and that it provide, in its next periodic report, information on the results achieved in the implementation of the "Te Rito": New Zealand Family Violence Prevention Strategy, including statistical data on cases of domestic violence, disaggregated by sex, ethnic group and age.

204. The Committee calls upon the State party to take effective measures to address the relatively high suicide rate, particularly among young people. The Committee requests the State party to provide further information on this matter, on a comparative and disaggregated basis, in its next periodic report.

205. The Committee recommends that the State party adopt a national plan to combat poverty with clear indicators to assess its impact on the incidence of poverty, in particular among disadvantaged and marginalized groups, the indigenous Maori people and Pacific Islanders. In this respect, the Committee refers the State party to its statement on poverty and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.[7]

206. The Committee requests the State party to adopt effective measures to improve the health situation of the indigenous Maori people.

207. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to ensure equitable access to health services in both rural and remote areas. The Committee draws the attention of the State party in this regard to its general comment No. 14 (2000) on the right to the highest attainable standard of health (art. 12 of the Covenant). The State party is also requested to provide detailed information, on a disaggregated and comparative basis, on progress made in this respect in its next periodic report.

208. The Committee urges the State party to take remedial action to ensure that the indigenous Maori people have equal access to education. Moreover, the Committee requests the State party to provide in its next periodic report disaggregated data on a comparative basis on enrolment and dropout rates among Maori children and young people, and the disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

209. The Committee encourages the State party to provide human rights education in schools at all levels and to raise awareness about human rights, in particular economic, social and cultural rights, among State officials and the judiciary.

210. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely among all levels of society, including among State officials and the judiciary, and to inform the Committee on all steps taken to implement them in its next periodic report. It also encourages the State party to continue to consult with non-governmental organizations and other institutions of civil society when preparing its third periodic report.

211. The Committee requests the State party to submit its third periodic report by 30 June 2008.

ICELAND

212. The Committee considered the third periodic report of Iceland on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1994/104/Add.25) at its 14th to 16th meetings, held on 13 and 14 May 2003, and made public, at its 29th meeting, held on 23 May, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

213. The Committee welcomes the submission of the third periodic report of Iceland, which has been prepared in conformity with the guidelines of the Committee. The Committee also notes with appreciation the comprehensive written replies submitted by the State party to its list of issues (E/C.12/Q/ICE/2).

214. The Committee expresses its satisfaction with the in-depth, constructive and frank dialogue with the State party's delegation, which consisted of members with expertise in different fields relevant to the provisions of the Covenant.

B. Positive aspects

215. The Committee welcomes the recent court practice in the State party whereby constitutional provisions are interpreted in the light of its international obligations. The Committee also notes with appreciation references made in the report and by the delegation to judgements of the Supreme Court of Iceland in which the Covenant has been invoked.

216. The Committee notes with satisfaction the adoption of new legislation on the Public Health Institute which seeks to promote public health in Iceland and to implement a National Health Policy.

217. The Committee notes with appreciation the new Act on Maternity/Paternity Leave and Parental Leave which reconciles family life and work, provides for time for parents to devote to their children, and promotes the sharing of parental responsibilities and gender equality in the labour market.

218. The Committee welcomes the adoption of the new Child Protection Act containing a comprehensive set of provisions and of new amended rules concerning, inter alia, measures to protect children from neglect and ill-treatment at home.

219. The Committee notes with satisfaction the amendments enacted in the Tobacco Control Act, the objective of which is to reduce the consumption of tobacco products by imposing supplementary restrictions on their sale and by reinforcing the prohibition of their advertisement.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

220. The Committee notes that there are no factors and difficulties which impede the effective implementation of the Covenant in the State party.

D. Principal subjects of concern

221. The Committee regrets that, as stated in its concluding observations on the second periodic report of Iceland,[8] the State party has not given full effect to the Covenant provisions in its domestic legal order, especially by providing for judicial and other remedies for violations of economic, social and cultural rights.

222. The Committee regrets that Iceland devotes only 0.16 per cent of its GNP to international cooperation, while the United Nations recommendation in this regard is 0.7 per cent for developed countries.

223. The Committee notes with concern that inequality between men and women continues to exist, particularly with respect to wages.

224. While taking note of the measures undertaken by the State party to promote access to employment and improve the working environment for persons with disabilities, the Committee is concerned about the lack of disaggregated statistical data on people with disabilities in employment in its third periodic report as well as in the dialogue with the State party's delegation.

225. The Committee notes with concern that, in spite of the measures undertaken by the State party to reduce the frequency of occupational accidents both on land and at sea, particularly accidents involving seamen employed on fishing vessels, there is still a relatively high rate of accidents.

226. The Committee is concerned about the persistent problem of domestic violence in the State party and that it has not adopted specific legislation on this issue.

227. The Committee notes with concern that the support provided to single-parent families remains insufficient.

228. The Committee is concerned about the existence of poverty and social exclusion in the State party, in spite of the efforts undertaken to combat the phenomenon.

229. The Committee expresses its concern about the high level of alcohol and drug consumption in the State party, in particular among young people.

---

[8] *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 2000, Supplement No. 2* (E/2000/22-E/C.12/1999/11 and Corr.1), chap. IV, paras. 77-78.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

230. The Committee reiterates its previous recommendation that, if measures are taken to incorporate treaty obligations with respect to civil and political rights in the Icelandic legal system, similar measures should be taken simultaneously in respect of economic, social and cultural rights.[9] In this regard, the Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 9 (1998) on domestic application of the Covenant.

231. The Committee recommends that the State party continue its activities in the area of international cooperation and increase its official development assistance to 0.7 per cent of its GNP, as recommended by the United Nations. The Committee also urges the State party to take into account the provisions of the Covenant in its bilateral project agreements with other countries.

232. The Committee calls upon the State party to intensify its efforts to ensure that women and men enjoy full and equal participation in the labour market, particularly in terms of equal pay for work of equal value. In this regard, the Committee recommends that the State party review its mechanisms for obtaining statistical information so as to enable an effective assessment of the progress achieved.

233. The Committee urges the State party to continue its efforts to implement current policies and programmes aimed at improving access to employment and improving the working conditions of people with disabilities and to provide disaggregated statistical data on this matter in its next periodic report.

234. The Committee urges the State party to enhance its efforts to reduce the frequency of occupational accidents both on land and at sea by raising awareness of the importance of preventive measures and, in particular, by providing training to seamen in matters relating to vessel stability and the use and treatment of hoisting equipment. In this regard, the Committee also recommends that the State party ratify ILO Conventions No. 174 (1993) concerning the Prevention of Major Industrial Accidents and No. 81 (1947) concerning Labour Inspection in Industry and Commerce.

235. The Committee recommends that the State party ratify ILO Conventions No. 117 (1962) concerning Basic Aims and Standards of Social Policy and No. 118 (1962) concerning Equality of Treatment of Nationals and Non-Nationals in Social Security.

236. The Committee urges the State party to adopt specific legislation on domestic violence.

237. The Committee urges the State party to increase its efforts to provide greater support to single-parent families.

---

[9] Ibid., para. 84.

238. The Committee reiterates its recommendation made in its earlier concluding observations on the poverty situation in Iceland[10] and urges the State party to pursue efforts to combat poverty and social exclusion, particularly of the disadvantaged and marginalized groups, with the adoption of clear indicators to assess progress achieved, and requests the State party to report on this matter in its next periodic report, including the findings of the special committee set up in this regard. The Committee refers the State party to its statement on poverty and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.[7]

239. The Committee calls upon the State party to take effective measures to address the high level of alcohol and drug consumption, particularly among young people.

240. The Committee encourages the State party to raise awareness about human rights, in particular about economic, social and cultural rights, among State officials, the judiciary and other actors responsible for the implementation of the Covenant.

241. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely at all levels of society and, in particular, among State officials and the judiciary and to inform the Committee, in its next periodic report, of all steps undertaken to implement them.

242. The Committee also encourages the State party to continue to consult with non-governmental organizations and other institutions of civil society in the preparation of the next periodic report.

243. The Committee requests the State party to submit its fourth periodic report by 30 June 2008.

ISRAEL

244. The Committee considered the second periodic report of Israel on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1990/6/Add.32) at its 17th to 19th meetings, held on 15 and 16 May 2003 , and made public, at its 29th meeting, held on 23 May, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

245. The Committee welcomes the submission of the second periodic report of the State party, which was prepared in general conformity with the Committee's guidelines. The Committee appreciates the extensive written replies to the list of issues (E/C.12/Q/ISR/2), as well as the readiness of, and efforts made by, the high-level delegation to respond to the oral questions. The members of the delegation were knowledgeable with respect to most of the Covenant rights, but the Committee regrets that a number of the questions it posed during the dialogue remained unanswered.

---

[10] Ibid., para. 88.

246. The Committee notes with appreciation the large amount of information received from non-governmental organizations concerning the implementation of the Covenant in the State party.

B. Positive aspects

247. The Committee welcomes the steps undertaken by the State party to implement the Multi-Year Plan for the Development of Arab Sector Communities (2000), aimed at closing the gap between Jews and Arabs by promoting equality in the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights.

248. The Committee notes with appreciation the various affirmative-action measures taken, as mentioned in the State party's replies to the list of issues, with respect to various disadvantaged sectors such as the Arab, Druze, Circassian and Bedouin communities, despite the decline in economic growth in the State party in recent years.

249. The Committee further notes with appreciation that the Supreme Court's rules of standing have been relaxed, allowing any person, regardless of citizenship, residency or other status, who contends that his or her rights have been unlawfully denied or infringed, formal access to the Court, and allowing even for an *actio popularis*. In particular, the Committee particularly appreciates that in the State party, plaintiffs seeking remedy for alleged violations of economic, social and cultural rights have access to and can make use of the judiciary system, which provides opportunities for the justiciability of the rights enshrined in the Covenant. In this regard, the Committee welcomes the information given on cases before the courts, in which reference has been made to Covenant provisions.

250. The Committee further notes the amendment to the Equal Rights for Women Law in April 2000.

251. The Committee welcomes the improvements in the conditions for foreign workers, allowing them to change employers for the legal duration of their stay, prohibiting employers from withholding workers' passports, as well as the regulations regarding the system of compulsory health insurance for these foreign workers.

252. The Committee notes that, while gaps still remain, the State party has achieved some positive results towards expanding basic education and special education for non-Jewish sectors.

253. The Committee notes with appreciation the efforts undertaken by the State party to address the problem of trafficking and exploitation of persons, such as the criminalization of trafficking, increased penalties for trafficking of minors, and the enhanced cooperation between government agencies to combat trafficking with a victim-sensitive approach.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

254. The Committee reiterates its statement made in its concluding observations on the initial report of Israel,[11] that the State party's continuing emphasis on its security concerns, which have even increased in recent years, has impeded the realization of economic, social and cultural rights within Israel and the occupied territories.

D. Principal subjects of concern

255. The Committee notes with regret that a number of the issues raised in its concluding observations in 1998 and 2001 remain outstanding issues of concern. In this regard, the Committee reiterates its concerns raised in 1998[12] and in 2001.[13]

256. Despite the above-mentioned positive measures (para. 249), the Committee reiterates its concern that the Covenant has not been incorporated in the domestic legal order, and therefore cannot be directly invoked before the courts.

257. The Committee regrets that the judgement of the *Ka'adan* case has still not been implemented.

258. The Committee also reiterates its concern about the State party's position that the Covenant does not apply to areas that are not subject to its sovereign territory and jurisdiction, and that the Covenant is not applicable to populations other than the Israelis in the occupied territories. The Committee further reiterates its regret at the State party's refusal to report on the occupied territories.[14] In addition, the Committee is deeply concerned at the insistence of the State party that, given the circumstances in the occupied territories, the law of armed conflict and humanitarian law are considered as the only mode whereby protection may be ensured for all involved, and that this matter is considered to fall outside the sphere of the Committee's responsibility.

259. The Committee is deeply concerned about the continuing difference in treatment between Jews and non-Jews, in particular Arab and Bedouin communities, with regard to their enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights in the State party's territory. The Committee reiterates its concern that the excessive emphasis upon the State as a "Jewish State" encourages discrimination and accords a second-class status to its non-Jewish citizens.[15] This discriminatory

---

[11] *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 1999, Supplement No. 2* (E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26), chap. IV, para. 233.

[12] Ibid., paras. 237, 251, 252 and 254.

[13] Ibid., *2002, Supplement No. 2* (E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17), chap. IV, para. 705.

[14] Ibid., *1999, Supplement No. 2* (E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26), chap. IV, para. 237.

[15] Ibid., para. 236.

attitude is apparent in the continuing lower standard of living of Israeli Arabs as a result, inter alia, of higher unemployment rates, restricted access to and participation in trade unions, lack of access to housing, water, electricity and health care and a lower level of education, despite the State party's efforts to close the gap. In this regard, the Committee expresses its concern that the State party's domestic legal order does not enshrine the general principles of equality and non-discrimination.

260. The Committee is concerned that in spite of the enactment of the Equal Rights for People with Disabilities Law in 2000, the majority of its provisions have not been implemented. The situation is aggravated for persons with disabilities from the Arab sector.

261. The Committee is particularly concerned about the status of "Jewish nationality", which is a ground for exclusive preferential treatment for persons of Jewish nationality under the Israeli Law of Return, granting them automatic citizenship and financial government benefits, thus resulting in practice in discriminatory treatment against non-Jews, in particular Palestinian refugees. The Committee is also concerned about the practice of restrictive family reunification with regard to Palestinians, which has been adopted for reasons of national security. The Committee reiterates its concern in this regard contained in its previous concluding observations.[16]

262. The Committee deeply regrets the refusal of the State party to provide in its second periodic report additional information on the living conditions of population groups other than Israeli settlers in the occupied territories as requested in its 2001 concluding observations. The Committee continues to be gravely concerned about the deplorable living conditions of the Palestinians in the occupied territories, who - as a result of the continuing occupation and subsequent measures of closures, extended curfews, roadblocks and security checkpoints - suffer from impingement of their enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights enshrined in the Covenant, in particular access to work, land, water, health care, education and food.

263. The Committee expresses its concern about the general increase in unemployment in the State party, which rose from 6.7 per cent in 1996 to 10.5 per cent in 2002, as well as about the significant increase in unemployment of the non-Jewish sectors: 13.5 per cent for the Arab sector and more than 15 per cent for the Bedouin sector. The Committee also expresses concern about the rate of unemployment in the occupied territories, which is over 50 per cent as a result of the closures that have prevented Palestinians from working in Israel.

264. The Committee is concerned about the persisting inequality in wages of Jews and Arabs in Israel, as well as the severe underrepresentation of the Arab sector in the civil service and universities.

265. The Committee is concerned about the fact that it is extremely difficult for Palestinians living in the occupied territories and working in Israel to join Israeli trade unions or to establish their own trade unions in Israel.

---

[16] Ibid., para. 239, and ibid., *2002, Supplement No. 2* (E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17), chap. IV, para. 705.

266. The Committee expresses concern about the fact that the Jewish religious courts' interpretation of personal status law with respect to divorce is discriminatory as regards women, especially the regulation that allows the husband to remarry even when the wife is opposed to the divorce, whilst the same rules do not apply to the wife.

267. The Committee is particularly concerned about information received concerning the construction of a "security fence" around the occupied territories, which allegedly would infringe upon the surface area of the occupied territories and which would limit or even impede access by Palestinian individuals and communities to land and water resources. The Committee regrets the fact that the delegation did not respond to questions by the Committee concerning the security fence or wall during the dialogue.

268. The Committee is particularly concerned about limited access to and distribution and availability of water for Palestinians in the occupied territories, as a result of inequitable management, extraction and distribution of shared water resources, which are predominantly under Israeli control.

269. The Committee reiterates its grave concern about the continuing practices by the State party of home demolitions, land confiscations and restrictions on residency rights, and its adoption of policies resulting in sub-standard housing and living conditions, including extreme overcrowding and lack of services, of Palestinians in East Jerusalem, in particular in the old city.[17] Furthermore, the Committee is gravely concerned about the continuing practice of expropriation of Palestinian properties and resources for the expansion of Israeli settlements in the occupied territories.[18]

270. The Committee continues to be concerned about the situation of Bedouins residing in Israel, and in particular those living in villages that are still unrecognized.[19] Despite measures by the State party to close the gap between the living conditions of Jews and Bedouins in the Negev, the quality of living and housing conditions of the Bedouins continues to be significantly lower, with limited or no access to water, electricity and sanitation. Moreover, Bedouins continue to be subjected on a regular basis to land confiscations, house demolitions, fines for building "illegally", destruction of agricultural crops, fields and trees, and systematic harassment and persecution by the Green Patrol, in order to force them to resettle in "townships". The Committee is also concerned that the present compensation scheme for Bedouins who agree to resettle in "townships" is inadequate.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

271. The Committee urges the State party to take into consideration the subjects of concern and to give effect to the recommendations contained in its 1998 and 2001 concluding observations.

---

[17] Ibid., *1999, Supplement No. 2* (E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26), chap. IV, para. 248.

[18] Ibid., para. 250.

[19] Ibid., para. 254.

272. The Committee urges the State party to undertake steps towards the incorporation of the Covenant and its provisions in the domestic legal order. It refers the State party to its general comment No. 9 (1998) on domestic application of the Covenant.

273. The Committee urges the State party to undertake steps to facilitate the implementation of the judgement in the *Ka'adan* case.

274. The Committee recognizes that the State party has serious security concerns, which must be balanced with its efforts to comply with its obligations under international human rights law. However, the Committee reaffirms its view that the State party's obligations under the Covenant apply to all territories and populations under its effective control. The Committee repeats its position that, even in a situation of armed conflict, fundamental human rights must be respected and that basic economic, social and cultural rights, as part of the minimum standards of human rights, are guaranteed under customary international law and are also prescribed by international humanitarian law. Moreover, the applicability of rules of humanitarian law does not by itself impede the application of the Covenant or the accountability of the State under article 2, paragraph 1, for the actions of its authorities. The Committee therefore requests that the State party provide more extensive information on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights enshrined in the Covenant by those living in the occupied territories in its next periodic report.

275. The Committee reiterates its recommendation that the State party take steps to ensure equality of treatment of all Israeli citizens in relation to all Covenant rights.[20]

276. The Committee urges the State party to undertake effective measures to combat discrimination against persons with disabilities, especially by providing access to public facilities and promoting access to basic services and employment, with particular attention to persons with disabilities from the Arab sector.

277. The Committee reiterates its recommendation that in order to ensure equality of treatment and non-discrimination, the State party undertake a review of its re-entry and family reunification policies for Palestinians.[21]

278. The Committee reiterates its request that the State party provide detailed information on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights of all population groups living in the occupied territories in its next periodic report.[22] The Committee also calls upon the State party to give full effect to its Covenant obligations and, as a matter of the highest priority, to undertake to ensure safe passage at checkpoints for Palestinian medical staff and people seeking treatment, the unhampered flow of essential foodstuffs and supplies, free movement to places of employment, and the safe conduct of students and teachers to and from schools.[23]

---

[20] Ibid., para. 260.

[21] Ibid., para. 262.

[22] Ibid., para. 272 and ibid., *2002, Supplement No. 2* (E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17), chap. IV, para. 707.

[23] Ibid., *1999, Supplement No. 2* (E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26), chap. IV, para. 265.

279. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures to reduce the rate of unemployment, and pay particular attention to reducing the inequalities between the Jewish and non-Jewish sectors with respect to employment. The Committee further recommends that the State party ensure that workers living in the occupied territories are permitted to continue to work in Israel.

280. The Committee strongly recommends that the State party take measures to reduce the inequalities in wages between Jews and Arabs, in conformity with the principle of equal pay for work of equal value, as enshrined in article 7 of the Covenant.

281. The Committee recommends that the State party take steps to ensure that all workers working in Israel can exercise their trade union rights, in accordance with article 8 of the Covenant.

282. The Committee recommends that the State party take steps to modify the Jewish religious courts' interpretation of the law concerning divorce to ensure equality between men and women, as provided for in article 3 of the Covenant.

283. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that any security measure it adopts does not disproportionally limit or impede the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights enshrined in the Covenant, in particular access to land and water resources by Palestinians, and that adequate restitution and compensation are provided to those who have incurred damage to and loss of property and lands as a result of these security measures.

284. The Committee strongly urges the State party to take immediate steps to ensure equitable access to and distribution of water to all populations living in the occupied territories, and in particular to ensure that all parties concerned participate fully and equally in the process of water management, extraction and distribution. In that connection, the Committee refers the State party to its general comment No. 15 (2002) on the right to water.

285. Reiterating its earlier recommendation,[24] the Committee urges the State party to cease the practices of facilitating the building of Israeli settlements, expropriating land, water and resources, demolishing houses and carrying out arbitrary evictions. The Committee also urges the State party to take immediate steps to respect and implement the right to an adequate standard of living, including housing, of the Palestinian residents of East Jerusalem and the Palestinian Arabs in cities with mixed populations. The Committee recalls in this connection its general comments No. 4 (1991) on the right to adequate housing (art. 11, para. 1, of the Covenant) and No. 7 (1997) on the right to adequate housing (art. 11, para. 1, of the Covenant): forced evictions). The Committee requests the State party to provide detailed information on this issue in its next periodic report.

286. The Committee further urges the State party to recognize all existing Bedouin villages, their property rights and their right to basic services, in particular water, and to desist from the

---

[24] Ibid., para. 267.

destruction and damaging of agricultural crops and fields, including in unrecognized villages. The Committee further encourages the State party to adopt an adequate compensation scheme for Bedouins who have agreed to resettle in "townships".

287. The Committee encourages the State party to continue to provide human rights education in schools at all levels and to raise awareness about human rights, in particular economic, social and cultural rights, among State officials and the judiciary.

288. The Committee also encourages the State party to develop the system of mixed schools for Jewish and Arab pupils, in order to promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among the citizens of the country.

289. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely among all levels of society and to inform the Committee of all steps taken to implement them in its next periodic report. It also encourages the State party to continue to consult with non-governmental organizations and other members of civil society when preparing its third periodic report.

290. The Committee requests the State party to submit its third periodic report by 30 June 2008.

Thirty-first session

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA

291. The Committee considered the initial report of the Republic of Moldova on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1990/5/Add.52) at its 32nd to 34th meetings, held on 11 and 12 November 2003, and made public, at its 56th meeting, held on 28 November, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

292. The Committee welcomes the submission of the initial report of the State party, which was prepared in general conformity with the Committee's guidelines, as well as the information provided in the written replies to its list of issues (E/C.12/Q/MOL/1).

293. The Committee welcomes the open and constructive dialogue with the delegation of the State party. The Committee regrets that there were not enough experts in the delegation in the field of economic, social and cultural rights, who could provide more information to the Committee on the concrete measures taken by the State party to implement its obligations under the Covenant.

B. Positive aspects

294. The Committee welcomes the adoption in 1994 of the Constitution of the Republic of Moldova, which incorporates international principles of human rights, as well as the State party's accession to six of the seven main international human rights treaties.

295. The Committee welcomes the establishment in 1998 of the Centre for Human Rights of the Republic of Moldova, consisting primarily of three ombudspersons empowered to deal with cases of human rights violations.

296. The Committee welcomes the adoption on 24 October 2003 of the National Human Rights Action Plan (for the period 2004-2008), in conformity with the recommendations of the 1993 Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action.[25] The Committee also notes with appreciation the Baseline Study on the Human Rights Status in the Republic of Moldova carried out by the Coordinating Committee for the Development and Implementation of the National Human Rights Action Plan, with the support of UNDP and the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, evaluating the compatibility of national legislation with international human rights standards.

297. The Committee welcomes the establishment of the Governmental Committee for Women's Issues in 1999 and the adoption of the National Plan for the Promotion of Gender Equality in Society in 2003.

298. The Committee welcomes the new Labour Code adopted on 28 March 2003 and the Law on Employment and Social Protection for Job Seekers of 13 March 2003.

299. The Committee welcomes the State party's ratification in 2002 of ILO Convention No. 182 (1999) concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

300. The Committee notes that the State party encountered difficulties in the implementation of the Covenant arising from the organization of its national economy as a newly independent State and from the transition to a market-oriented economy. The Committee also notes that the Transnistrian region, which is part of the State party's territory, is effectively outside the State party's control.

D. Principal subjects of concern

301. The Committee regrets that national courts have so far not made reference to the Covenant in any of their rulings.

302. The Committee notes with concern that the State party faces serious problems of corruption, which have a negative effect on the full exercise of the rights covered by the Covenant. The Committee is also concerned that low salaries of civil servants and judges may obstruct the effective implementation of measures to combat corruption.

303. The Committee is concerned about the extent to which gender inequality persists in the Republic of Moldova.

---

[25] Adopted by the World Conference on Human Rights, held in Vienna from 14 to 25 June 1993 (A/CONF.157/24 (Part I), chap. III).

304. The Committee is concerned about the high rates of unemployment, particularly among young people, women and the Roma population. The Committee notes with great concern, in this regard, that the lack of employment opportunities and low salaries have prompted massive emigration of people in the active and working age, a majority of whom work abroad illegally without social insurance and legal protection.

305. The Committee is concerned about the persistent gap in wages between women and men despite Law No. 847-XV on Wages of 14 February 2002, which prohibits discrimination on the grounds of sex in determining remuneration.

306. The Committee is concerned that the minimum wage in the State party is not sufficient to provide workers with a decent living for themselves and their families in contravention of articles 7 and 11 of the Covenant.

307. The Committee expresses its concern that the current levels of social benefits and pensions are inadequate.

308. The Committee is concerned about the absence of adequate statistical data on social benefits since 1997 in the State party's report.

309. The Committee is alarmed about the extent of trafficking in persons, particularly women, despite the various measures taken by the State party to prevent and combat this phenomenon, including the adoption in 2001 of the National Plan of Action to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings and the introduction of sanctions against crimes related to trafficking under the new Penal Code of 2002.

310. The Committee is concerned that violence against women remains widespread. The Committee notes with regret that existing legislation does not define domestic violence as a specific offence. Lack of crisis centres for victims of domestic violence is also a cause for concern.

311. The Committee is concerned about the large number of children placed in institutions, especially those with slight mental disabilities. The Committee is also concerned that children left in the care of relatives or other persons while their parents travel abroad in search of employment are at risk of abuse and neglect.

312. The Committee is concerned that an estimated 40 per cent of the population live in absolute poverty, and that extreme poverty is especially pronounced in rural areas and among children.

313. The Committee notes with concern that rising real-estate prices have negatively affected the accessibility and affordability of housing for a large part of the population and that the State party is not taking adequate measures to deal with this problem.

314. The Committee is concerned about the deterioration of the public health system and notes with regret that conditions in hospitals, especially psychiatric hospitals, are inadequate.

315. The Committee is alarmed about the rising incidence of tuberculosis in the State party and notes with particular concern the acuteness of this problem in prisons where the infection rate is more than 40 times higher than the national average, according to the "Baseline Study on the Human Rights Status in the Republic of Moldova".

316. The Committee is concerned about the rising incidence of HIV/AIDS and sexually transmitted diseases in the State party. In this regard, it is also concerned that sex education classes held in urban areas are almost non-existent in rural areas.

317. The Committee is concerned about the continuing high level of infant and maternal mortality. It is also concerned that the number of abortions remains high (15.6 per 1,000 women of fertile age in 2002), notwithstanding the ongoing programmes in the area of reproductive health.

318. The Committee is concerned that drug abuse is a serious problem in the State party, with the number of drug addicts having more than doubled in the last five years despite the establishment of an interdepartmental commission to fight drug addiction in 2000 and the launching of a programme to fight drug addiction and the drugs business in the period 2003-2004.

319. The Committee is concerned about the high rates of non-attendance and high dropout rates in primary and secondary education. It notes with particular concern that the main reason for non-attendance is acute family poverty. The Committee is also concerned about the lack of pre-school education.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

320. The Committee requests the State party to clarify in its second periodic report whether individuals within the State party's territory may invoke the rights enshrined in the Covenant before the domestic courts and to provide relevant case law, if available. In this respect, the Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 9 (1998) on domestic application of the Covenant. Moreover, the Committee recommends that the State party take measures to raise awareness of the Covenant and of the possibility of invoking its provisions before the courts, among the judiciary and the public at large.

321. The Committee recommends that the Centre for Human Rights give prominence to economic, social and cultural rights in its activities.

322. The Committee requests the State party to provide in its second periodic report detailed information on the implementation of the National Human Rights Action Plan.

323. The Committee urges the State party to strengthen its efforts to combat corruption, including by ensuring the effective functioning of the Anti-Corruption Committee and to work towards ensuring better remuneration for civil servants and judges.

324. The Committee urges the State party to continue to reinforce its efforts to promote inter-ethnic dialogue and tolerance among the different ethnic groups living within its jurisdiction with a view to eliminating discrimination.

325. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to promote gender equality in all spheres of life, including by ensuring the effective implementation of the National Plan for the Promotion of Gender Equality in Society.

326. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to improve job opportunities for young people, women and the Roma population. It also recommends that the State party seek to conclude international agreements with a view to ensuring the social protection of migrant workers and, in particular, to acceding to the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families.

327. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures to reduce inequality between men and women in the labour market, including by ensuring equal pay for work of equal value, and to report back on progress made in its next periodic report.

328. The Committee urges the State party to increase its efforts to establish a national minimum wage that would be sufficient to ensure an adequate standard of living for workers and their families according to articles 7 and 11 of the Covenant. Moreover, the State party should introduce a mechanism to determine and regularly adjust the minimum wage in proportion to the cost of living as envisaged in the draft legislation on the subsistence level.

329. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that the social security and pension systems under reform give special attention to the needs of the most disadvantaged and vulnerable groups in society. The Committee requests the State party to provide detailed information on the results of the implementation of the reformed pension scheme in its next periodic report.

330. The Committee recommends that the State party develop a reliable database providing timely, disaggregated and comparative statistics on social security issues and include these statistics in its next periodic report.

331. The Committee urges the State party to reinforce its efforts to combat the phenomenon of trafficking in persons, including by ensuring the effective implementation of anti-trafficking legislation and programmes and by improving job possibilities and assistance to women living in poverty. In view of the cross-border character of crimes related to trafficking, the State party is encouraged to seek international assistance and strengthen regional cooperation with countries to which Moldovans are trafficked.

332. The Committee encourages the State party to consider defining domestic violence as a specific offence under the Penal Code. It also encourages the State party to give effect to the planned amendments of the Civil Procedure Code, which aim to protect victims of domestic violence. The Committee also recommends that the State party increase the number of crisis centres where victims of domestic violence could find safe lodging and counselling.

333. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to reduce the number of children living in institutions, including by strengthening family support measures and by developing alternative forms of family care. The State party should ensure that children in institutions as well as all other children deprived of their natural family environment grow up in an atmosphere of emotional and material security.

334. The Committee calls upon the State party to strengthen its efforts to combat poverty under the National Poverty Alleviation Programme and to give special attention to the most vulnerable groups, including children and people living in rural areas. It urges the State party to develop a mechanism for measuring the poverty level and to monitor it closely. The Committee requests that the State party provide in its next periodic report disaggregated and comparative data on the number of people living below the poverty line.

335. The Committee encourages the State party to ensure that resources are allocated for the provision of social housing, especially to the disadvantaged and vulnerable groups, including the Roma. The Committee also recommends that the State party undertake a study on the problem of homeless people and to report back on its findings in its next periodic report.

336. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures to ensure the quality, affordability and accessibility of health services, especially in rural areas. In this respect, the Committee draws the attention of the State party to its general comment No. 14 (2000) on the right to the highest attainable standard of health (art. 12 of the Covenant) and requests detailed information in the second periodic report, on a disaggregated and comparative basis, on progress made.

337. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts under the National Programme of Tuberculosis Control to combat the spread of tuberculosis, including by ensuring the availability of medicines and adequate sanitary conditions in prisons.

338. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to combat the spread of HIV/AIDS and other sexually transmitted diseases, including through public information campaigns and by ensuring that sex education is also introduced to schools in rural areas.

339. The Committee urges the State party to reinforce its efforts to reduce infant and maternal mortality by increasing health coverage for women and children. The Committee calls upon the State party to strengthen efforts to promote awareness of sexual and reproductive health, safe contraceptive methods and the health risk of using abortion as a method of birth control, and to report on the results of such measures in its next periodic report.

340. The Committee calls on the State party to ensure the effective implementation of programmes to prevent and combat drug abuse, especially among young people. It requests the State party to provide disaggregated and comparative data on this problem in its next periodic report.

341. The Committee urges the State party to reinforce its efforts to ensure that children are not prevented from attending school because of poverty in the family. It also recommends that the State party consider establishing new pre-school educational institutions. The Committee requests the State party to provide in its next periodic report disaggregated data on a comparative basis on enrolment and dropout rates among boys and girls, in particular from vulnerable groups. It refers the State party to its general comment No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant) for guidance in this regard.

342. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely among all levels of society and to inform the Committee on all steps taken to implement them in its next periodic report. It also encourages the State party to engage non-governmental organizations and other members of civil society in the process of discussion at the national level prior to the submission of its second periodic report.

343. Finally, the Committee requests the State party to submit its second periodic report by 30 June 2008.

YEMEN

344. The Committee considered the initial report of Yemen on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1990/5/Add.54) at its 35th to 37th meetings, held on 12 and 13 November 2003, and made public, at its 56th meeting, held on 28 November, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

345. The Committee welcomes the submission of the initial report of Yemen, which has been prepared in general conformity with the Committee's guidelines, and the written replies to its list of issues (E/C.12/Q/YEM/1).

346. While welcoming the frank dialogue with the delegation of the State party, the Committee regrets that there were not enough experts in the delegation in all fields of economic, social and cultural rights, who could have provided more information to the Committee on the concrete measures taken by the State party to implement its obligations under the Covenant.

B. Positive aspects

347. The Committee welcomes the various programmes adopted by the State party to promote and protect human rights, including the establishment of the Supreme National Committee for Human Rights.

348. The Committee welcomes the establishment of the National Committee for Women which is charged with, inter alia, the task of reviewing and drafting legislation relevant to women.

349. The Committee welcomes the Local Authority Law No. 4 of 2000 which aims to ensure a fair distribution of services, programmes and projects to the widely decentralized administration of social affairs.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

350. The Committee recognizes that the State party suffered serious difficulties relating to its obligations under the Covenant as a result of the civil war of 1994 and of the Gulf war of 1990-1991, which forced about a million Yemeni migrant workers to return home, leaving behind most of their belongings.

D. Principal subjects of concern

351. The Committee is concerned about the persistence of de facto discrimination, within Yemeni civil society, in relation to some marginalized and vulnerable groups, commonly referred to as *akhdam*, *ahjur* or *zubud* (derogatory terms for which no neutral alternatives exist).

352. Despite the measures taken by the State party to advance the status of women in Yemen, the Committee is concerned about the existence of certain customs, traditions and cultural practices which lead to substantial discrimination against women and girls and that there are still persisting patterns of discrimination, particularly in family and personal status law, as well as inheritance law. The Committee is also concerned about the widespread discrimination faced by women in their access to an adequate representation at all levels of decision-making bodies in the State party.

353. The Committee is concerned about the limited progress attained by the State party to combat unemployment and that this remains at a very high rate, particularly among young people.

354. The Committee regrets the absence of a minimum wage.

355. The Committee is concerned about the gap in wages between men and women even if they perform the same work under the same conditions and specifications.

356. The Committee notes with concern that significant segments of society, particularly self-employed and agricultural workers, are not covered by the social security system.

357. The Committee is concerned about the lack of measures to combat sexual and domestic violence as well as the lack of legislation to criminalize such violence.

358. The Committee is concerned about the high rate of infant and maternal mortality and the insufficient availability of health services, especially for women in rural areas. The Committee is also concerned about the lack of a comprehensive sexual and reproductive health programme in the State party.

359. The Committee is concerned that child labour still persists, especially in the informal sector, despite the adoption of a national strategy and a plan of action for the elimination of child labour.

360. The Committee is deeply concerned about the persistence of extreme poverty in the State party, especially in rural areas, and among the disadvantaged and marginalized groups.

361. The Committee is concerned about the living conditions of prisoners and detainees in the State party, especially women, with regard to access to health-care facilities, adequate food and safe drinking water.

362. The Committee is concerned about the persisting water crisis which constitutes an alarming environmental emergency in the State party, and which prevents access to safe and affordable drinking water, particularly for the disadvantaged and marginalized groups of society, and for rural areas.

363. The Committee is concerned about the rising incidence of HIV/AIDS and other sexually transmitted diseases in the State party.

364. The Committee is also concerned that people suffering from HIV/AIDS do not always have full access to the necessary services, food and facilities.

365. The Committee is deeply concerned about the persistent consumption of *khat*, especially when up to about 50 per cent of household incomes are allocated to its consumption.

366. The Committee is concerned about the high level of tobacco consumption in the State party, especially among youth.

367. The Committee is concerned that the policy of compulsory education has yet to be fully implemented. It further notes the high dropout rates, especially among girls in rural areas, and the inadequate training of teachers.

368. The Committee remains concerned that the high level of illiteracy, especially among women in rural areas amounting to over 70 per cent, poses a major problem and has a deep impact on the enjoyment of their economic, social and cultural rights.

369. The Committee is concerned about the lack of adequate human rights training in the State party, in particular with respect to the rights enshrined in the Covenant, especially among the judiciary, law enforcement officials and civil servants responsible for the implementation of the Covenant.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

370. The Committee urges the State party to undertake effective measures, such as awareness-raising campaigns and educational programmes, to combat de facto discrimination, in particular against marginalized and vulnerable groups in society commonly referred to as *akhdam*, *ahjur* or *zubud*.

371. The Committee strongly recommends that the State party amend existing legislation to bring it in line with the provisions of article 3 of the Covenant. The Committee requests the State party to provide, in its second periodic report, detailed information on government policies, programmes and measures adopted for the immediate and effective implementation of the legislation on equality between men and women, including the representation of women at various levels of the Government and public administration.

372. The Committee recommends that the State party undertake measures for the effective implementation of the national population policy and its programme of action for 2001-2005.

373. The Committee recommends that the State party establish a system of adequate remuneration which is sufficient to ensure a decent living for workers and their families, in accordance with article 7 of the Covenant.

374. The Committee recommends that the State party undertake effective measures to ensure in practice the principle of equal remuneration for work of equal value.

375. The Committee urges the State party to undertake measures to make its social security system more comprehensive so as to include all workers and their families. In this regard, the Committee encourages the State party to ratify ILO Convention No. 102 (1952) concerning Minimum Standards of Social Security

376. The Committee calls upon the State party to adopt and implement the necessary measures to combat domestic and sexual violence and to provide adequate protection for victims of such practices.

377. The Committee urges the State party to increase its efforts to reduce the rate of infant and maternal mortality by providing adequate access to health services and vaccination programmes, especially for women and children in rural areas. The Committee urges the State party to adopt and implement a national sexual and reproductive health programme.

378. The Committee also urges the State party to adopt measures to eradicate child labour and to report on progress achieved in its next periodic report.

379. The Committee further urges the State party to take effective measures to combat the problem of poverty, including the effective implementation of its poverty reduction strategy.

380. The Committee urges the State party to take effective legislative or other measures to provide adequate health-care facilities, adequate food and safe drinking water to prisoners and detainees, especially women. The Committee also urges the State party to ensure the professional and social reintegration of women ex-prisoners, through vocational training.

381. The Committee further urges the State party to introduce strategies, plans of action, and legislative or other measures to address the scarcity of water problems, in particular sustainable management of the available water resources. The Committee recommends that effective water management strategies and measures be undertaken in urban areas, exploring possibilities for alternative water treatment and developing ecological dry sanitation methods in rural areas. The Committee requests the State party to report on these issues, in its next periodic report, bearing in mind the Committee's general comment No. 15 (2002) on the right to water (arts. 11 and 12 of the Covenant), by providing comparative and disaggregated data.

382. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to control the spread of HIV/AIDS. The Committee further requests the State party to provide detailed statistical data, disaggregated on a year-by-year basis, on the incidence of HIV/AIDS and on the measures taken to combat this pandemic, including public information programmes.

383. The Committee, in line with its general comment No. 14 (2000) on the right to the highest attainable standard of health (art. 12 of the Covenant), recommends that the State party provide adequate health care for people suffering from HIV/AIDS and that public information programmes be provided to raise awareness of these problems in Yemeni society.

384. The Committee urges the State party to take effective measures to combat the widespread consumption of *khat* and to conduct further studies on the health and economic implications of its consumption.

385. The Committee recommends that the State party undertake immediate measures to implement the national work plan for tobacco control recently developed by the Ministry of Health.

386. The Committee urges the State party to implement fully its national education for all plan for, taking into account the Committee's general comments Nos. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant).

387. The Committee requests the State party to adopt effective measures to combat illiteracy and to provide, in its second periodic report, information on the measures it has undertaken and on the results of these measures. The Committee also requests the State party to include disaggregated and comparative statistics in its second periodic report.

388. The Committee recommends that the State party improve its human rights training programmes in such a way as to ensure better knowledge, awareness and application of the Covenant and other international human rights instruments, in particular among the judiciary, law enforcement officials and civil servants responsible for the implementation of the provisions of the Covenant.

389. The Committee also recommends that the State party establish an independent national human rights institution in accordance with the Paris Principles.[26] The Committee further recommends that the State party make sure that the mandate of the institution includes economic, social and cultural rights and is accessible through local offices. In this regard, the Committee recommends that the State party seek technical cooperation from the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.

390. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely at all levels of society and, in particular, among State officials and the judiciary and to inform the Committee, in its second periodic report, of all steps undertaken to implement them.

391. The Committee encourages the State party to engage non-governmental organizations and other members of civil society in the process of discussion at the national level prior to the submission of its second periodic report.

392. The Committee requests the State party to submit its second periodic report by 30 June 2008.

GUATEMALA

393. The Committee considered the second periodic report of Guatemala on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1990/6/Add.34/Rev.1) at its 38th and 39th meetings, held on 14 November 2003, and made public, at its 56th meeting, held on 28 November, the following concluding observations.

---

[26] Principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights (see General Assembly resolution 48/134 of 20 December 1993, annex).

A. Introduction

394. The Committee welcomes the submission of the second periodic report of Guatemala, which was prepared in general conformity with the Committee's guidelines, as well as the information provided in the written replies to its list of issues (E/C.12/Q/GTM/1).

395. The Committee welcomes the open and constructive dialogue with the delegation of the State party.

B. Positive aspects

396. The Committee notes with satisfaction the constitutional provisions establishing the post of Human Rights Ombudsman (arts. 273-275 of the Political Constitution), as well as the adoption of the Law on the Congressional Human Rights Commission, and the Law on the Human Rights Ombudsman. The Committee also welcomes the elaboration by the Human Rights Ombudsman of a management plan for the period 2002-2007.

397. The Committee welcomes the establishment of the Office for the Defence of Indigenous Women for the promotion and development of proposals for government policies, plans and programmes for the defence of the rights of indigenous women.

398. The Committee takes note with satisfaction of the adoption of Legislative Decree No. 19 of May 2003 on national languages recognizing, promoting and respecting the languages of the Maya, Garifuna and Xinka people.

399. The Committee welcomes the ratification by Guatemala of the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, as well as its adherence to the Inter-American Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Persons with Disabilities.

400. The Committee welcomes the invitation extended to it by the State party's delegation to visit Guatemala in the foreseeable future.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

401. The Committee takes note that the consequences of the armed conflict have seriously affected the full enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights.

D. Principal subjects of concern

402. The Committee is concerned by the insufficient progress made by the State party towards the effective implementation of the peace agreements of 1996 (including the Comprehensive Agreement on Human Rights, the Agreement on Social and Economic Aspects and the Agrarian Situation) which has led to persistent serious problems, such as violence at the national level, intimidation, corruption, impunity and lack of constitutional, fiscal, educational and agrarian reforms. All these have impacted adversely on the full realization of economic, social and cultural rights enshrined in the Covenant, particularly with regard to indigenous peoples.

403. The Committee is concerned about the persisting discrimination against indigenous peoples, with regard to access to, inter alia, landownership, work, education, health services and adequate nutrition and housing.

404. The Committee is concerned about the de facto inequality between women and men, which is perpetuated by traditional prejudices and social conditions, in spite of an important number of legal instruments adopted by the State party.

405. The Committee is concerned about the high level of unemployment, in particular among indigenous peoples. In this regard, the Committee takes note that the State party has not yet ratified ILO Convention No. 2 (1919) concerning Unemployment.

406. The Committee is particularly concerned that the minimum wage is not sufficient to provide a decent living for the workers and their families and that, in practice, such insufficient salary is not always paid.

407. Notwithstanding the measures taken by the State party to decentralize and expand labour inspection services, the Committee is concerned that labour inspections are not carried out regularly, especially in rural areas.

408. The Committee is also concerned about sexual harassment of women in the workplace.

409. The Committee is concerned that only 15 per cent of the population are covered by the Guatemalan Social Security Institute and that there is a considerable disparity in the coverage of workers in rural and urban areas. The Committee also notes that the State party has not yet ratified ILO Convention No. 102 (1952) concerning Minimum Standards of Social Security.

410. The Committee takes note of the legislative measures undertaken by the State party to address the needs of persons with disabilities, but regrets the lack of implementation measures and adequate financial and human resources in this area.

411. The Committee also takes note of the efforts made by the State party towards the implementation of the National Reparations Programme for victims of war. However, the Committee expresses concern at the lack of effective measures to reunite families separated by the conflict, to establish the whereabouts of children who have disappeared and to safeguard the rights of children orphaned by the war.

412. The Committee is deeply concerned about the persistent problem of child labour in the State party, especially in agricultural and domestic services.

413. The Committee is concerned about the extent of the problem of violence against women in Guatemalan society, both within and outside the family, and its implication for both the physical and mental health of women and children. The Committee is also concerned that the Penal Code does not consider domestic violence as a crime.

414. The Committee is concerned about the high level of poverty which affects, according to official statistics, 73.8 per cent of the indigenous population and 40.6 per cent of the non-indigenous populations.

415. The Committee is concerned about the negative effects of the coffee crisis on rural employment and standard of living.

416. The Committee continues to be deeply concerned that the uneven distribution of wealth and land and the high level of social exclusion, in particular among indigenous and rural populations, hinder the full enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights.

417. The Committee is concerned about the current state of sexual and reproductive health of women and that the incidence of child and maternal mortality is relatively high.

418. The Committee is alarmed about the increasing level of drug addiction in the State party, especially among young people.

419. The Committee is concerned that only 30 per cent of children living in rural communities complete primary education and, in the case of indigenous children, only 20 per cent complete it. The Committee also expresses its concern about the limited access for indigenous peoples to enjoy education in their mother tongue and to use it in their dealings with public authorities.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

420. The Committee recommends that the State party make every possible effort, including through international assistance, to provide adequate follow-up to various issues contained in the peace agreements of 1996, which, following over 30 years of civil unrest, laid the foundation for national reconciliation and for the promotion of human rights.

421. The Committee recommends that the State party increase its efforts to combat discrimination against indigenous peoples, in particular in the areas of employment, health services, landownership, adequate nutrition, housing and education.

422. The Committee calls upon the State party to ensure equality between men and women in all spheres of life, in particular by taking effective measures to combat discrimination in the education of the girl-child, in access to employment, in equal pay for work of equal value and in access to land and credit services. The Committee urges the State party to increase the level of representation of women in public services.

423. The Committee urges the State party to increase its efforts to combat unemployment by strengthening technical and professional training programmes and by adopting policies aimed at facilitating investments that create jobs. The Committee encourages the State party to ratify ILO Convention No. 2 (1919).

424. The Committee recommends that the State party ensure that the minimum wage is increased regularly in proportion to the cost of living so as to guarantee an adequate standard of living for workers and their families and to ensure that the rules regarding the minimum wage are respected in practice.

425. The Committee urges the State party to verify and ensure the fulfilment of labour legislation concerning occupational health and safety conditions, including through regular inspections.

426. The Committee urges the State party to amend all its relevant legislation in order to define sexual harassment as a crime and to take effective measures to combat the crime.

427. The Committee recommends that the State party take all necessary measures to ensure that the coverage of the national social security system is significantly extended to include rural and domestic workers and their families. The Committee also recommends that the State party ratify ILO Convention No. 102 (1952).

428. The Committee urges the State party to address the condition of persons with disabilities by formulating adequate implementation measures in this area. It also recommends that the State party provide in its next periodic report detailed information on measures taken and the results obtained.

429. The Committee urges the State party to increase its efforts to reunite separated families, to continue seeking children who have disappeared and to safeguard the situation of war orphans while facilitating access to the judicial system for affected persons.

430. The Committee urges the State party to take all necessary measures, legislative or otherwise, to address the persistent problem of child labour, especially in agriculture and domestic services.

431. The Committee urges the State party to combat violence against women, including through the effective application of the Act on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Domestic Violence and awareness-raising campaigns designed to combat negative traditional practices and prejudices and their effects and consequences. In this regard, the Committee urges the State party to amend the Penal Code by including domestic violence as a crime. The Committee requests the State party to provide, in its third periodic report, detailed information and up-to-date statistics on a comparative basis on the phenomenon of domestic violence in Guatemala, as well as the results of the measures to combat this serious problem.

432. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its programmes and activities to combat poverty and improve the living conditions of the population of Guatemala, in particular of the marginalized and vulnerable groups, including indigenous peoples. The Committee requests the State party to provide in its next periodic report detailed information on the progress made.

433. The Committee encourages the State party to reorient its agricultural policies and to implement its social plan to combat the coffee crisis through measures that ensure access to adequate nutrition, health care, subsidized housing and employment opportunities for those affected by the crisis.

434. The Committee reiterates its previous recommendation[27] and urges the State party to implement the measures contained in the peace agreements of 1996, in particular those related to the agrarian reform and the devolution of communal indigenous lands.

---

[27] *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 1997, Supplement No. 2* (E/1997/22-E/C.12/1996/6), chap. IV, para. 137.

435. The Committee recommends that the State party take measures to reduce child and maternal mortality, and in particular intensify the implementation of its national programme on reproductive health, provide further assistance and training to midwives, organize educational campaigns regarding women's sexual and reproductive health, and include such subjects in the school curricula.

436. The Committee urges the State party to undertake effective measures to combat drug addiction, such as awareness-raising campaigns and educational activities.

437. The Committee urges the State party to make efforts to increase school attendance of children, particularly of indigenous children. The Committee recommends that the State party broaden its intercultural bilingual education and allocate adequate funds and human resources to the Department of Intercultural Bilingual Education, and improve the working conditions of teachers by paying them better salaries and providing them with training as well as hiring additional teachers to cover rural areas fully.

438. In the light of paragraph 71 of the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action,[25] the Committee encourages the State party to continue preparation, through an open and consultative process, of a comprehensive national plan of action on human rights and to seek technical cooperation from the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. The Committee requests the State party to include in its third periodic report information on progress made in this regard.

439. The Committee requests the State party to provide information, in its third periodic report, on specific measures adopted by the Office of the Human Rights Ombudsman that had been set up to promote and protect economic, social and cultural rights in the country.

440. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely at all levels of society and, in particular, among State officials, the judiciary and the legislature and to inform the Committee, in its next periodic report, of all steps undertaken to implement them.

441. The Committee also encourages the State party to engage non-governmental organizations and other members of civil society in the process of discussion at the national level prior to the submission of its third periodic report.

442. The Committee requests the State party to submit its third periodic report by 30 June 2008.

RUSSIAN FEDERATION

443. The Committee considered the fourth periodic report of the Russian Federation on the implementation of the Covenant (E/C.12/4/Add.10) at its 41st to 43rd meetings, held on 17 and 18 November 2003, and made public, at its 56th meeting, held on 28 November, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

444. The Committee welcomes the submission of the fourth periodic report of the State party, which was prepared in general conformity with the Committee's guidelines. It also appreciates the comprehensive written replies to the list of issues (E.C.12/Q/RUS/2) as well as the additional written information provided during the dialogue.

445. The Committee welcomes the frank and constructive dialogue with the high-level delegation of the State party.

B. Positive aspects

446. The Committee notes with appreciation that the Constitutional Court continues to apply the Covenant in its rulings.

447. The Committee welcomes the State party's commentary on an optional protocol to the Covenant in which it restates its support for a complaints procedure.

448. The Committee welcomes the adoption of the federal Political Parties Act which contains provisions aiming at enhancing women's participation in political life.

449. The Committee welcomes the new Labour Code of 2001, which introduces further protection against forced labour and discrimination in the field of labour and employment.

450. The Committee welcomes the State party's ratification on 25 March 2003 of ILO Convention No. 182 (1999) concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

451. The Committee notes the absence of any significant factors or difficulties preventing the effective implementation of the Covenant in the Russian Federation.

D. Principal subjects of concern

452. The Committee is deeply concerned about the poor living conditions in the Republic of Chechnya and notes with regret that sufficient information was not provided on this problem in the State party's report. While acknowledging the difficulties posed by the ongoing military operations, the Committee is concerned about the problems faced by people in the Republic of Chechnya with regard to the provision of basic services, including health care and education.

453. The Committee is concerned about the precarious situation of indigenous communities in the State party, affecting their right to self-determination under article 1 of the Covenant. The Committee notes that the Law of 2001 on Territories of Traditional Natural Resource Use (Small Indigenous Minorities of the North, Siberia and the Russian Far East), which provides for the demarcation of indigenous territories and protection of indigenous land rights, has still not been implemented.

454. The Committee is concerned about reports of cases where the lack of registration of place of residence and other identity documents in practice places limitations on the enjoyment of rights, including work, social security, health services and education. The Committee is also concerned about reports that some groups of people, including the homeless and the Roma, face particular difficulties in obtaining personal identification documents, including registration of residence.

455. The Committee notes the statement of the State party's delegation that any former citizen of the Soviet Union living in the country can exchange their old Soviet passports for new Russian Federation ones without any difficulty. However, the Committee is concerned about reports that registration and recognition of citizenship have been denied to some groups, particularly the Meskhetians living in Krasnodar Krai.

456. The Committee remains concerned about gender inequality in the State party, particularly with regard to discrimination in employment, in the family and in political representation.

457. The Committee remains concerned about the relatively high rates of unemployment in the State party, particularly among young people, women, people of pre-pensionable age and persons with disabilities. It also notes with concern the significant regional disparities, with unemployment rates ranging from 32.4 to 56.5 per cent in the nine worst affected regions.

458. The Committee notes with concern that the employment of persons with disabilities has significantly decreased in recent years. The Committee regrets that two important tax benefits, which served as incentives for hiring persons with disabilities and which were commended by the Committee in its previous concluding observations,[28] have been removed.

459. The Committee notes with concern that the informal economy in the State party has grown considerably and that illegal migration of labour is widespread, which means that a large number of people work without legal and social protection.

460. The Committee remains concerned about the low level of wages in the State party, with an estimated 32.8 per cent of workers earning wages equal to or below the subsistence level. The Committee notes that the situation is aggravated by the persistent problem of wage arrears. The low level of the minimum wage is also a cause of concern since it remains well below the minimum subsistence level and is inadequate to provide workers with a decent living for themselves and their families (arts. 7 and 11 of the Covenant).

461. The Committee remains concerned about the high incidence of serious accidents in the workplace in the State party.

462. The Committee is concerned about the difference in wages between men and women as well as about working conditions for women. It is also concerned about sexual harassment of women in the workplace.

---

[28] Ibid. (E/1998/22-E/C.12/1997/10), chap. IV, para. 93.

463. The Committee is concerned that the Labour Code may impose undue restrictions on the right to strike, by requiring a quorum of two thirds of the total number of workers and the agreement of at least half of the workers present at the meeting to call a strike.

464. The Committee remains concerned about the inadequate amounts paid in pensions and social benefits, while noting that the problem of arrears has been addressed.

465. The Committee is very concerned about the high incidence of trafficking in persons in the State party and about the lack of reliable statistics on the number of people trafficked and of information on cases where persons have been prosecuted under existing anti-trafficking legislation.

466. The Committee remains concerned about the high incidence of domestic violence and the fact that victims of domestic violence are not adequately protected under existing legislation.

467. The Committee is concerned that income disparities, which have further increased in the reporting period, affect the standard of living of a considerable part of Russian society, and that, despite economic recovery in the last years, the level of poverty in the State party has still not been brought down to the pre-1998 level. The Committee is also deeply concerned that, according to the most recent figures (2002), an estimated 35.8 million people, or 25 per cent of the population, live on an income below the minimum subsistence level.

468. The Committee remains concerned about the problem of street children in the major cities of the State party. The Committee is also deeply concerned about the growing number of orphaned children and children deprived of parental care.

469. The Committee notes with concern that homelessness is a growing problem in the State party.

470. The Committee is concerned about delays in the payment of compensation for houses destroyed during military operations in Chechnya.

471. The Committee is concerned about reports indicating maltreatment of conscripts in the armed forces as well as their sub-standard living conditions and lack of access to adequate food and health care.

472. The Committee is concerned about the precarious situation of more than 100,000 internally displaced persons from Chechnya living in Ingushetia. The Committee emphasizes in this respect its view that the closing down of tent camps without provision of alternative lodging would be in contravention of the Covenant.

473. The Committee is concerned about the general deterioration of the level of availability and accessibility of health care in the State party. The Committee also notes with concern that hospitals and clinics in poor regions often do not stock all essential drugs, and that, despite the constitutional guarantee of free medical care, many health clinics charge fees for their services and request patients to purchase medicaments. Furthermore, the Committee is concerned about the poor health status of northern indigenous peoples, the life expectancy of whom is estimated to be 15-20 years lower than the national average.

474. The Committee notes that the State party lacks federal legislation on the rights of patients concerning, inter alia, professional ethics and redress for medical errors.

475. The Committee remains concerned about the high incidence of tuberculosis in the State party, particularly in prisons, in the Republic of Chechnya and in the regions of the Far North, in particular among indigenous communities.

476. The Committee notes with concern the sharp increase in the HIV-infection rate during the last three years, the increasing incidence of HIV contracted through heterosexual contacts, and the increasing number of children born of HIV-positive mothers.

477. The Committee is concerned about the high levels of infant and maternal mortality in the State party. It also notes with concern that unsafe abortion remains a main cause of maternal mortality.

478. The Committee remains concerned about the spread of drug addiction in the State party.

479. The Committee remains concerned about reports that a sizeable number of children, owing to migration, homelessness and neglect, do not attend school.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

480. The Committee urges the State party to allocate sufficient funds to reinstate basic services, including the health and education infrastructure, in the Republic of Chechnya.

481. The Committee, recalling the right to self-determination enshrined in article 1 of the Covenant, urges the State party to intensify its efforts to improve the situation of the indigenous peoples and to ensure that they are not deprived of their means of subsistence. The Committee also encourages the State party to ensure the effective implementation of the Law on Territories of Traditional Natural Resource Use.

482. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that the lack of residence registration and other personal identity documents do not become an obstacle to the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights.

483. The Committee urges the State party to take effective measures to ensure that no one will be deprived of their legal status and enjoyment of rights as a consequence of the expiry of Soviet passports on 31 December 2003. The Committee also calls upon the State party to ensure that the authorities in Krasnodar Krai legalize the residence of Meskhetians and members of other ethnic groups who have reportedly been denied registration.

484. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to promote gender equality and encourages the adoption of the draft federal law on State guarantees of equal rights, freedoms and opportunities for men and women in the Russian Federation currently before the Duma.

485. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that programmes to promote employment are targeted to the regions and groups that are most affected.

486. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures to promote the integration of persons with disabilities into the labour market, including by strengthening the system of job quotas for them, or by providing penalty payments for non-employment.

487. The Committee recommends that the State party strengthen its efforts to protect the human rights of workers in the informal labour market with a view to creating the conditions for unimpeded implementation of migrants' rights, and protecting migrants' legal rights and interests as indicated in the State party's report (para. 69). The Committee also encourages the State party to consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families.

488. The Committee urges the State party to take effective measures to raise wages, prevent wage arrears, and ensure the implementation of article 133 of the Labour Code, which, in line with the Covenant, stipulates that the minimum wage must not be lower than the worker's minimum subsistence level.

489. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that adequate funds are allocated for the prevention of accidents in the workplace and to strengthen the resources and powers of the labour inspectorate so as to ensure that sanctions are imposed on employers who fail to observe safety regulations.

490. The Committee recommends that the State party undertake effective measures, including through affirmative action, to improve the working conditions for women and to ensure equal pay for work of equal value. The Committee also recommends that the State party enact legislation criminalizing sexual harassment in the workplace.

491. The Committee encourages the State party to revise section 410 of the Labour Code so as to lower the quorum required for a strike ballot.

492. The Committee urges the State party to ensure that under the new pensions system, introduced by the Federal Law of 1 January 2002, the basic component of pensions is raised to the minimum subsistence level. In view of the fact that the realization of this goal may take time, owing to limited resources, the Committee urges the State party to give priority to raising minimum pension levels and to ensuring that social benefits are targeted to the families most in need.

493. The Committee calls upon the State party to ensure effective implementation of existing anti-trafficking legislation. It also encourages the State party to proceed with the adoption of proposed legislative amendments and of the draft act on combating the trafficking of people which aim at providing more effective protection for victims and ensuring the prosecution of traffickers. Moreover, the State party should ensure the availability of accessible crisis centres where victims of trafficking can receive assistance.

494. The Committee calls upon the State party to intensify its efforts to combat domestic violence by enacting specific legislation criminalizing it and providing training for law enforcement personnel and judges regarding the serious and criminal nature of domestic violence. Moreover, the Committee urges the State party to ensure the availability and accessibility of crisis centres where victims of domestic violence can find safe lodging and counselling.

495. The Committee urges the State party, in order to fulfil its Covenant obligations under article 11, to ensure that the increase in available funds in the State budget is also used to promote an adequate standard of living for all, including through a comprehensive national strategy to combat poverty. The Committee requests the State party to provide, in its next periodic report, updated statistical information on a comparative basis on the results of the efforts undertaken to reduce the number of people living below the minimum subsistence level to 28-30 million by 2006.

496. The Committee urges the State party to further strengthen measures to prevent child neglect and to ensure adequate assistance and social rehabilitation for neglected or abandoned children. The State party should take effective measures to deal with the root causes of neglect and abandonment, particularly by increasing assistance rendered to families with children, including by increasing the levels of family benefits.

497. The Committee urges the State party to strengthen its efforts to address the problem of homelessness, including by ensuring that adequate resources are set aside for the provision of social housing, with priority given to the most disadvantaged and vulnerable groups. The Committee also encourages the State party to undertake a study into the problem of homelessness so that it may acquire a more accurate picture of the scope of the problem and of its root causes.

498. The Committee calls upon the State party to guarantee that timely and adequate compensation is duly provided to all persons whose property has been destroyed during the military operations in Chechnya.

499. The Committee calls upon the State party to ensure that mechanisms are in place to ensure the enjoyment of basic rights of conscripts, including their access to adequate food and health care.

500. The Committee reminds the State party of its obligation under the Covenant to ensure the provision of adequate temporary housing for those people who fear that Chechnya is too insecure for them to return.

501. The Committee calls upon the State party to ensure that the ongoing reform of the health sector will improve the quality of, and equitable access to, health services in all regions of the country. The State party should also take effective measures to improve the health status of indigenous peoples in the regions of the Far North.

502. The Committee recommends that the State party address the matter of patients' rights and report back to the Committee on this issue in its next periodic report.

503. The Committee recommends that the State party intensify its efforts to combat tuberculosis, under the special federal programme on urgent measures to tackle tuberculosis for the period 1998-2004, including by ensuring the availability of medicines and adequate sanitary conditions in prisons, and by taking special measures to combat the epidemic in the worst affected regions.

504. The Committee, in line with its general comment No. 14 (2000) on the right to the highest attainable standard of health (art. 12 of the Covenant), calls upon the State party to take urgent measures to stop the spread of HIV/AIDS. The State party should ensure that all persons know about the disease and how to protect themselves, including through sex education in schools, and that methods of protection are available at affordable prices. Moreover, awareness-raising campaigns should aim at preventing discrimination against HIV-positive people.

505. The Committee urges the State party to reinforce its efforts to reduce infant and maternal mortality. The State party should promote awareness of safe contraceptive methods and ensure that abortions are carried out under adequate medical and sanitary conditions.

506. The Committee recommends that the State party ensure the effective implementation of programmes to prevent and combat drug abuse, targeted at young people and the worst affected regions of the country, and to report back to the Committee on this issue in its next periodic report.

507. The Committee recommends that the State party reinforce its efforts under the federal programme entitled "Youth of Russia (2001-2005)" to ensure that no child is deprived of the right to education. The Committee notes that a statistical survey of the number of children who do not attend school was introduced in 2003 and it requests the State party to provide in its next periodic report disaggregated data on a comparative basis on enrolment and dropout rates among boys and girls and vulnerable groups. It refers the State party to its general comment No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant) for guidance on how to prepare the information on the right to education in the next report.

508. The Committee requests the State party to disseminate the present concluding observations widely among all levels of society and to inform the Committee on all steps taken to implement them in its next periodic report. It also encourages the State party to engage non-governmental organizations and other members of civil society in the process of discussion at the national level prior to the submission of its next periodic report.

509. Finally, the Committee requests the State party to submit its fifth periodic report by 30 June 2008.

DEMOCRATIC PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF KOREA

510. The Committee considered the second periodic report of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea on the implementation of the Covenant (E/1990/6/Add.35) at its 44th to 46th meetings, held on 19 and 20 November 2003 and made public, at its 56th meeting, on 28 November, the following concluding observations.

A. Introduction

511. The Committee welcomes the submission of the second periodic report of the State party, which was prepared in conformity with the Committee's guidelines and thanks the State party for the written replies to its list of issues (E/C.12/Q/DPRK/1). The Committee, nevertheless, regrets that the State party has not included specific information in terms of data and updated statistics, particularly in the field of social security, health and education.

512. The Committee expresses its appreciation for the dialogue that took place between the Committee members and the delegation of the State party.

B. Positive aspects

513. The Committee acknowledges the efforts by the State party and the people of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea to overcome the effects of the natural disasters from the mid-1990s, including the reconstruction of the food production infrastructure.

514. The Committee notes with appreciation the willingness of the State party to continue its cooperation with the Committee.

515. The Committee also notes with appreciation the wide coverage of free health care in the State party.

516. The Committee further notes with appreciation the full implementation of a free and universal 11-year education system.

C. Factors and difficulties impeding the implementation of the Covenant

517. The Committee is aware of the difficulties facing the State party on many levels and in various areas, including food security and the high cost of rebuilding the infrastructure destroyed as a consequence of the natural disasters during the mid-1990s.

D. Principal subjects of concern

518. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights is concerned, as is the Human Rights Committee in its own concluding observations,[29] about the constitutional and other legislative provisions, particularly article 162 of the Constitution, that seriously compromise the impartiality and independence of the judiciary and have an adverse impact on the protection of all human rights guaranteed under the Covenant.

519. The Committee notes with concern that no case law on the application of the Covenant exists and that the Covenant has not been directly invoked before national courts, although the State party declares that the provisions of international human rights instruments, though not yet incorporated into its domestic law, are directly applied by the courts.

520. The Committee regrets the lack of information about the exact functioning of the individual complaint system under the Law on Complaints and Petitions, as concerns complaints in the field of economic, social and cultural rights.

521. The Committee notes with concern that the State party has not ratified the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.

522. The Committee expresses its concern about the persistence of traditional societal attitudes and practices prevailing in the State party with regard to women that negatively affect the

---

[29] See *Official Records of the General Assembly, Fifty-sixth session, Supplement No. 40* (A/56/40), para. 86.

enjoyment of their economic, social and cultural rights. The Committee is concerned about the lack of domestic legislation on non-discrimination against women and about the persistence of de facto inequality between men and women in decision-making positions, both in political and administration bodies, as well as in the industrial sector as a whole.

523. The Committee is concerned that the right to work may not be fully assured in the present system of compulsory State-allocated employment, which is contrary to the right of the individual to freely choose his/her career or his/her workplace.

524. The Committee is concerned about information according to which citizens of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea who travel abroad without a passport in quest of employment and better living conditions are sent to labour camps upon return to their country.

525. The Committee notes with concern that the legislation of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea establishes a single trade-union structure, which is controlled by the ruling party. It notes also that the exercise of the right to form trade unions is dependent upon an authorization given by the State security organs. Furthermore, the Committee notes with concern that domestic legislation does not recognize the right to strike.

526. The Committee regrets the sparse information provided on the coverage of the social security system which does not enable the Committee to ascertain whether the system provides universal coverage.

527. The Committee is concerned about information according to which some segments of the population are still suffering hardship because of the period of reconstruction and reform and may be in need of extra support from the public authorities.

528. The Committee notes with concern that there is no specific provision in the legislation of the State party that criminalizes and punishes domestic violence.

529. The Committee notes with concern that existing social and educational policies in the State party for orphans keep them in segregated environments, which can lead to situations of social exclusion.

530. The Committee is concerned about the consequences of the widespread famine suffered by the country from the mid-1990s and that certain groups, in particular women, children and older persons, have been more severely affected than others and have not received proper assistance in order to alleviate their plight.

531. The Committee expresses deep concern about the high rate of children under five that are chronically malnourished (45 per cent according to government statistics), as well as the high incidence of poverty-related diseases.

532. The Committee is concerned about the alarming increase in maternal mortality rates.

533. The Committee remains concerned about the declining attendance rate in schools, from 99 to 85 per cent according to the State party, as a consequence of national disasters.

534. The Committee remains concerned that children with disabilities, whenever possible, are not included in the regular school system.

E. Suggestions and recommendations

535. The Committee invites the State party to set up a mechanism for the effective monitoring of the progressive implementation of the Covenant.

536. The Committee recommends that the State party, in its efforts aimed at the implementation of the rights under the Covenant, continue to seek international assistance and engage itself in international cooperation and in the regional activities undertaken by international and regional agencies, including the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights.

537. The Committee recommends that the constitutional and legislative provisions that may compromise or diminish the independence and impartiality of the judiciary be immediately reviewed in order to guarantee its crucial role in the protection of rights covered by the Covenant.

538. The Committee requests the State party to include in its third periodic report information on how the provisions of the Covenant have been incorporated into its domestic legislation and to provide examples of cases of direct application, by the national courts, of the provisions of the Covenant.

539. The Committee requests the State party to provide more detailed information on the exact functioning of the procedures in the individual complaint system under the Law on Complaints and Petitions, relating to economic, social and cultural rights, including case law exemplifying how this law has been used in practice.

540. The Committee recommends that the State party ratify the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.

541. The Committee recommends that the State party join ILO as a full member and consequently ratify the main ILO conventions in due course. In order to facilitate the accession, the Committee recommends that the State party speed up the necessary reform of its legislation with a view to fulfilling the criteria of the tripartite representation system in ILO.

542. The Committee suggests that domestic legislation be reviewed with the aim of giving full effect to the principle of non-discrimination against women and that the State party adopt and implement a programme containing specific measures for awareness-raising, aimed at promoting the rights of women and their advancement in all fields of political, economic and social life.

543. The Committee encourages the State party to take legislative measures to guarantee the right of everyone to choose his/her career and workplace.

544. The Committee recommends that the national legislation be reviewed in order to eliminate penalties against persons having travelled abroad in quest of employment and better living conditions.

545. The Committee recommends that the State party review its domestic legislation to bring it in line with the provisions of article 8 of the Covenant with regard to trade union rights, including the right to form independent trade unions and the right to strike.

546. The Committee encourages the State party to provide in its third periodic report data on the conditions for entitlement under the social security system, including for family benefits, benefits for persons with disabilities, and pensions for older persons.

547. The Committee invites the State party to explore the possibility of increasing in due course the budgetary allocations for social expenditure, as well as public assistance for people in need, and of enabling persons looking for employment, particularly women, to find jobs on the territory of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea.

548. The Committee recommends that the State party amend its legislation in order to include specific provisions that can be used as grounds to fight domestic violence.

549. The Committee calls upon the State party to continue its efforts in assisting those children who have suffered from the consequences of natural disasters to return to school.

550. The Committee urges the State party to strengthen its efforts to provide alternative family care for orphans and to include them in the regular school system.

551. The Committee recommends that the State party establish appropriate mechanisms to guarantee equal access for the more vulnerable groups to international food aid and give priority to these groups in food programmes.

552. The Committee recommends that increased attention be paid by the competent authorities to providing adequate nutrition to children suffering from chronic malnutrition as well as adequate health care, to address the potentially severe consequences on their health.

553. The Committee recommends that the State party take effective measures to improve the conditions of maternal care, including prenatal health services and medical assistance at birth.

554. The Committee recommends that the State party adopt a comprehensive HIV/AIDS prevention strategy, including awareness-raising campaigns and a blood safety programme. The Committee invites the State party to continue and enhance its collaboration with United Nations programmes and specialized agencies, such as WHO, UNDP and UNAIDS. The Committee further recommends that the State party include in its third periodic report statistical data on the incidence of HIV/AIDS and information about the measures undertaken to prevent an epidemic.

555. The Committee recommends that the State party change the present system concerning the education of children with disabilities by allowing these children to be educated in the regular school system. Moreover, the State party should take measures to raise awareness among students, teachers and families of the special needs of these children and train teachers to assist them effectively in regular classes.

556. The Committee is ready, if invited, to send a delegation to visit the Democratic People's Republic of Korea in order to ascertain the realities and the efforts being made by the State party to apply the provisions of the Covenant as well as to offer advice and assistance to the State party in discharging its obligations under the Covenant.

557. While noting with appreciation the State party's commitment to disseminate widely the present concluding observations, the Committee encourages the State party to make them available to all institutions and public authorities dealing with the rights under the Covenant as well as to large segments of the civil society.

558. Finally, the Committee requests the State party to submit its third periodic report by 30 June 2008.

CHAPTER V

Substantive issues arising in the implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

A. Cooperation with specialized agencies: first meeting of the Joint Expert Group UNESCO (Committee on Conventions and Recommendations)/ Economic and Social Council (Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights) on the Monitoring of the Right to Education

1. Introduction

559. The Joint Expert Group UNESCO (Committee on Conventions and Recommendations)/Economic and Social Council (Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights) on the Monitoring of the Right to Education was established by decision 5.4 adopted by the UNESCO Executive Board at its one hundred and sixty-second session in October 2001 and by the Economic and Social Council decision 2003/310 of 25 July 2003. Welcoming the experts[30] to its first meeting on behalf of Mr. Koïchiro Matsuura, Director-General of UNESCO, Mr. Marcio Barbosa, Deputy Director General of UNESCO, underlined the importance of giving effect to the right to education, which is at the heart of the UNESCO education programme. The meeting was opened, on behalf of the Chairperson of the UNESCO Executive Board, by Mr. Louis P. Van Vliet, Chairman of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations, bringing into prominence key issues for deliberations. In her introductory statement, Ms. Virginia Bonoan-Dandan, Chairperson of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, recalled that when the Covenant was being elaborated, UNESCO had drafted articles 13 and 14 concerning the right to education. It could therefore be said that those articles were "owned" by UNESCO. She stated that education played a crucial role in all economic, cultural and social rights, and all the rights impacted by the right to education.

560. After adopting the agenda, the experts agreed on an informal working pattern. They decided that the chair of the Joint Expert Group would rotate among the members representing the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations. The Chairperson of the Committee on Economic and Social Rights was requested to chair the meeting. Mr. Kishore Singh from the UNESCO Education Sector served as Secretary for the Joint Expert Group.

---

[30] The Joint Expert Group is composed of four members: Ms. Virginia Bonoan-Dandan, and Mr. Eibe Riedel, respectively Chairperson and Vice-Chairperson of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, representing the Committee, and Messrs Olabiyi B. J. Yaï and Klaus Hüfner, members of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations and representing it.

2. Cooperation between the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations and the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, especially as a follow-up to decision 6.2, adopted by the UNESCO Executive Board at its one hundred and sixty-fifth session in October 2002

561. The discussions on the above agenda item covered several substantive questions, mainly, comparing the working methods of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations with a view to complementarity in the monitoring of the right to education.

562. It was mentioned that in monitoring the implementation of the Covenant, which covered the right to education (arts. 13 and 14), the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights maintained dialogue with the States parties to the Covenant. It was significant that as a result of the active participation of UNESCO in the work of the Committee in recent years, achieving the right to education for all systematically figured in such dialogue. In the concluding observations the Committee adopted for follow-up action by the State party after examining country reports, it advised States parties to seek assistance from UNESCO. On the other hand, the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations as subsidiary organ of the UNESCO Executive Board had the mandate of monitoring the implementation of UNESCO standard setting instruments. Unlike the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, which was composed of 18 independent experts, the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations was composed of 30 representatives of member States and not of independent experts. Rather than examining the reports submitted by States individually, it examined a synthesis report prepared by the secretariat. Moreover, unlike the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations did not benefit from participation by non-governmental organizations and civil society. As such, it was exploring ways of making the monitoring more effective, concentrating on the right to education.

563. The Joint Expert Group, therefore, recommended:

(*a*) Stepping up reciprocal exchange of information, including the States' reports to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and UNESCO and feedback on the concluding observations as well as on the decisions of the UNESCO Executive Board on the right to education;

(*b*) Cooperation with the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in the elaboration of the UNESCO guidelines for monitoring, foreseen in decision 6.2 mentioned above, much as UNESCO had collaborated with the Committee in the elaboration of general comment No. 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant).

564. The Joint Expert Group raised the question of endowing the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations with independent experts. It suggested that bringing such a concern to the UNESCO General Conference could lead to examining eventually the possibility of transforming the nature of the Committee. Other suggestions that emerged related to ensuring that the States' reports reflected the reality on the ground and were of quality; standardization of reports and publicizing them so as to bring the two reporting systems closer; to involve National Commissions for UNESCO actively in State reporting and its follow-up; and to draw upon human rights institutions which play a major role at the country level, etc.

565. Emphasis was placed upon States' obligations in reporting.[31] As provided in general comment No. 13, the right to education, like all human rights, imposes three levels of obligation on States parties: the obligations to respect, protect and fulfil. In turn, the obligation to fulfil incorporates both an obligation to facilitate and an obligation to provide. The State obligation remains even in case of privatization of education.

3. Follow-up to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights day of general discussion on the right to education and to the World Education Forum

566. The meeting organized by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in cooperation with UNESCO on 14 May 2002 on follow-up to the Committee's day of general discussion on the right to education and to the World Education Forum (Dakar, April 2000)[32] bears evidence to shared concerns and common objectives of UNESCO and the Committee in promoting the right to basic education for all as a fundamental human right. Bearing in mind that the realization of the right to basic education for all is the priority of UNESCO, a number of areas were examined for further measures. The discussion indicated the need for:

(*a*) Operational definitions of basic education for all, of lifelong learning as well as of quality education so that progress could be monitored on the basis of agreed legal parameters and the United Nations system would use the same language;

(*b*) The *EFA Global Monitoring Report* could possibly be reviewed in the light of this discussion to see how the monitoring of the right to education can be used in the whole process, with key targets and quality indicators, starting from an analysis of the 18 indicators on Education for All as the first step. The guidelines on human rights and poverty reduction strategies are useful in developing indicators.

567. The Joint Expert Group considered it especially important that work on the legal implications of the Dakar Framework for Action, adopted at the World Education Forum, should deserve greater consideration.

4. Questions of key importance for strengthening legal foundations of the right to education

568. The discussions showed that it was crucial to emphasize the importance of incorporation of State obligations on the right to education into national legal systems and to project it as being justiciable for promoting its enforcement. Research and studies in the field of the right to education are vital for examining how the right to basic education as a fundamental right is integrated into constitutions.

---

[31] Article VIII of the UNESCO Constitution provides that "Each Member State shall submit to the Organization, at such times and in such manner as shall be determined by the General Conference, reports on laws, regulations and statistics relating to its educational, scientific and cultural institutions and activities, and on the action taken upon the recommendations and conventions […]."

[32] See *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council, 2002, Supplement No. 2* (E/2003/22-E/C.12/2002/13), chap. V, paras. 544-589.

569. With that end, the Joint Expert Group suggested that it was important to:

(*a*) Create greater awareness about the need for and the importance of national laws on the right to education (seminars and meetings especially involving lawmakers and parliamentarians);

(*b*) Undertake detailed studies as regards the foundations of the right to education in national legal systems, including legislation on non-discrimination in and on accessibility to education and collaboration with the intellectual community;

(*c*) Develop further the proactive role and technical assistance of UNESCO to member States in response to emerging concerns for modernizing legislation and administrative processes, thus ensuring fulfilment of their State obligation;

(*d*) Expound legal questions and issues in universalizing access to education, especially universal, free primary education.

570. It was mentioned that the focus of the World Bank's Fast-Track Initiative was on the completion of universal primary education. As regards the justiciability of the right to education, reference was made to recent case law in India and South Africa with respect to the obligation of providing universal free primary education. Wider issues such as rights in education and the right to education also figured in the discussions.

5. Complementarity between the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations, and major conclusions

571. The main thrust of the discussion of the Joint Expert Group was to fully explore the potential of the complementarity between the two committees. An important substantive question on which it focused related to the proposal for the revision of section VI (Procedure for the submission and examination of Member States' reports on the action they have taken in pursuance of conventions and recommendations adopted by the General Conference) of the Rules of Procedure concerning recommendations to Member States and international conventions covered by the terms of article IV, paragraph 4, of the UNESCO Constitution. Mr. Abdulqawi A. Yusuf, Director of the UNESCO Office of International Standards and Legal Affairs, provided information and explanations with respect to the proposed revision. Such revision will cover the entire process concerning the submission and examination of State reports and follow-up action in monitoring implementation of UNESCO standard-setting instruments. In this process, a distinction would be made between conventions and recommendations so that reports on recommendations could be separated from those on conventions, which create legal obligations for States. Furthermore, conventions on education could be separated from other forms of convention for more effective monitoring of the right to education itself.

572. In the light of the above information and explanations, the Joint Expert Group explored how a new approach would create complementarity between the work of UNESCO and that of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. The Joint Expert Group arrived at a set of major recommendations:

(*a*) The suggestions and recommendations made by the members of the Joint Expert Group will be taken into consideration in the proposals that the secretariat is preparing for the General Conference of UNESCO and on which the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations has already given its views. It will be suggested to the General Conference to accept revision of section VI of the Rules of Procedure (see paragraph 571 above), taking into account a rights-based approach with respect to the conventions in the field of education;

(*b*) The distinction between conventions and recommendations in State reporting would be the way towards a rights-based reporting system, on the basis of the conventions on education. The adoption of a rights-based approach would facilitate cooperation between UNESCO and the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and also make it easier to monitor the right to education. UNESCO would rather have to seek information on the fulfilment of the rights than on their protection. That way, the UNESCO reporting system could, in the final analysis, be fed into the reports to be presented. As UNESCO deals with plans of action, policies and strategies, it would also be useful to the Committee and its work;

(*c*) UNESCO will need information from the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, particularly on the fulfilment of the right to education. Indeed, the Committee does measure progress in realizing the right to education whether it be primary education, national plans for primary education, the Dakar Framework for Action or Education for All and universal free, compulsory primary education. A critical evaluation of progress by States parties in that respect would be quite a large step forward;

(*d*) The Joint Expert Group recognized the need to elaborate on the complementarity of the two bodies in normative action: the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights with articles 13, 14 and 15 of the Covenant and its general comments Nos. 11 (1999) on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) and 13 (1999) on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant), and the work of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations with respect to the monitoring of the implementation of the UNESCO standard-setting instruments relating to the right to education. The issues concerning the complexity of the reporting cycles, individual State reports and the kind of States that are parties to the Covenant - in the case of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights - and to the Convention of 1960 against Discrimination in Education in the case of UNESCO - and that submit reports, need to be considered carefully, as they require innovative and creative solutions.

573. In concluding the meeting, it was decided that the report of the Joint Expert Group would include the summary of discussions, along with suggestions and a set of recommendations. After its approval by the members of the Joint Expert Group, the report would be presented as a document to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights by its Chairperson, Ms. Virginia Bonoan-Dandan, and to the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations by its Chairperson, Mr. Louis P. Van Vliet.

574. A web site on the right to education* was launched by UNESCO on the occasion of the meeting. It presents the work of UNESCO in this field, and includes landmarks in the

---

* The following web site: http://portal.unesco.org/education.

collaboration between the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and UNESCO, documents prepared by the secretariat and information on the first meeting of the Joint Expert Group.

575. Finally, it was proposed that the next meeting of the Joint Expert Group would take place on 3 and 4 May 2004 during the thirty-second session of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Geneva. This will provide an opportunity for the members of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations to see how the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights conducts the dialogue with the States parties to the Covenant and its general comments are used in reporting, especially as regards the right to education.

576. The Chairman of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations stated that, despite the complexity of the matter discussed, the meeting had led to "undreamed-of" concrete results. The Joint Expert Group had really come up with much of substance and the outcome had been "very positive". The Chairperson of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, in her general conclusions, characterized the meeting as having been historic. For the first time, treaty bodies had been working together hand in hand on a particular right, that is, for realizing the right to education. The work done by the secretariat was highly commended.

B. Day of general discussion: the right to work (art. 6 of the Covenant)

1. Introduction

577. At its thirty-first session, on 24 November 2003, the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights held a day of general discussion on the right to work, as provided for in article 6 of the Covenant.

578. The discussion was intended to lay the groundwork for the elaboration of a general comment on the right to work.

579. Participants in the day of general discussion included: Ms. Constance Thomas (Chief, Equality and Employment Branch, ILO), Mr. Wataru Iwamoto (Director, Division of Secondary, Technical and Vocational Education, UNESCO), Mr. Richard Siegel (Professor, Department of Political Science, and Faculty Associate, Grant Sawyer Centre for Justice Studies, University of Nevada, United States of America), Mr. Vassil Mratchkov (Professor, Institute for Legal Studies at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Sofia, and former Rapporteur of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights), Mr. Akmal Saidov (Director, National Human Rights Centre of Uzbekistan, Tashkent), Ms. Olga Krylova (Centre of Social and Labour Rights, Moscow), Mr. Janek Kuczkiewicz (Director, Department of Trade Union Rights, International Confederation of Free Trade Unions), Ms. Shanthi Dairiam (Executive Director, International Women's Rights Action Watch (Asia Pacific)), Ms. Machteld Inge Van Dooren (Researcher, Human Rights Office, Amersfoort, The Netherlands) and Mr. Pal Malik Özden (Europe-Third World Centre).

580. The Committee had before it the following papers:

(*a*) Discussion paper submitted by Mr. Philippe Texier, member of the Committee: "General comment on the right to work (art. 6) of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights" (E/C.12/2003/7);

(*b*) Background paper submitted by Mr. Richard Siegel, Professor, Department of Political Science, and Faculty Associate, Grant Sawyer Centre for Justice, University of Nevada, United States of America: "Towards a general comment on the right to work: core elements" (E/C.12/2003/8);

(*c*) Background paper submitted by Ms. Elena Gerasimova, Director, Centre for Social and Labour Rights, Moscow, and Ms. Anna Gvozditskikh and Ms. Olga Krylova: "The right to work: regulatory content" (E/C.12/2003/9);

(*d*) Background paper submitted by Mr. Akmal Saidov, Director, National Human Rights Centre of Uzbekistan, Tashkent: "The right to work: towards a general comment on article 6 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights" (E/C.12/2003/10);

(*e*) Background paper submitted by Mr. Vassil Mratchkov, Professor, Institute for Legal Studies at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Sofia, and former member of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: "Comments on the draft general comment on the right to work (art. 6 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights)" (E/C.12/2003/11);

(*f*) Background paper submitted by Ms. Machteld Inge Van Dooren, Researcher, Human Rights Office, Amersfoort, The Netherlands: "The right to work" (E/C.12/2003/12).

2. Opening remarks

581. Ms. Bonoan-Dandan, Chairperson of the Committee, opened the day of general discussion by underlining that the Committee's recent general comments had focused on specific provisions of the Covenant with a view to providing clarification both for States parties and members themselves. She expressed appreciation for the assistance from various experts in preparing this first draft general comment on the right to work. She said that all contributions would be studied carefully and taken into account in the preparation of the final version.

582. Mr. Texier, in presenting his preliminary draft general comment on the right to work (art. 6 of the Covenant) (E/C.12/2003/7), welcomed the fact that after many years the Committee was preparing its first general comment on the right to work and hoped that this would mark the beginning of a series of general comments on the other labour rights (arts. 7 and 8) and the right to social security (art. 9). He said that the draft general comment had been prepared in close collaboration with ILO and acknowledged the contributions of various experts and the support of the Friedrich Ebert Foundation. He pointed out the difficulties that had arisen during the drafting process, such as the indivisibility of articles 6 to 8 of the Covenant. The right to work was directly linked to the right to just and favourable conditions of work and to the right to form trade unions and to strike. However, as it would not have been feasible to elaborate one general comment dealing with all three articles, the best solution would be to have several general comments related to these articles. The second problem related to the issues to be included under the right to work. For example the prohibition of child labour overlapped with article 10 (protection and assistance to the family). The third difficulty related to conceptual problems such as the distinction between formal and informal work, and whether to refer to the self-employed or only to employees.

3. Statements and discussion

583. Mr. Iwamoto (Division of Secondary, Technical and Vocational Education, UNESCO) pointed out that UNESCO had played an important role in the realization of the right to work. It had made significant efforts to provide technical and vocational education and training in all member States in cooperation with ILO and had adopted the Convention on Technical and Vocational Education in 1989. The concept of a job for life was largely a thing of the past and people were now obliged to anticipate engaging in several jobs during their working lives. Consequently, a person's right to work implied a right to receive the training and retraining necessary to engage in productive work in a labour market that was in constant evolution.

584. Mr. Siegel (Professor, Department of Political Science, and Faculty Associate, Grant Sawyer Centre for Justice Studies, University of Nevada, United States of America) said that the Committee's general comment must emphasize the relationship between the right to work and anti-poverty measures, as there was a tendency to examine the right to work only in the context of industrialized countries. He argued that the draft general comment should include concepts such as forced labour and child labour as well as the concept of full employment.

585. With regard to the issue of full employment, members of the Committee inquired how this could be achieved in countries facing serious economic problems, including lack of foreign investment. Mr Siegel replied that irrespective of economic difficulties all States should be held accountable for the realization of the right to work of their citizens. States should take steps to review their trade policies and resources management to promote the right to work paying special attention to the most vulnerable groups. He also highlighted the important role of international financial institutions and donor States in this context.

586. Commenting on the issue of justiciability, Mr. Siegel said that the right to work should be broken down into its more and less justiciable elements. The right to work that is freely chosen, including protection against slavery, forced labour, child labour and trafficking, was justiciable. Rights related to security and arbitrary dismissals were also justiciable although they required more effort to enforce. The right to full employment, on the other hand, should not be considered by normal courts but rather be monitored by the Committee.

587. Mr. Mratchkov (Institute for Legal Studies at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Sofia) congratulated Mr. Texier for the draft general comment which set out the fundamental issues regarding the right to work embodied in article 6 of the Covenant and provided a good basis for discussion. He pointed out that the right to work had developed and been enriched, gaining from having absorbed elements of the realities of today's work. In defining the right to work, the general comment should take into account the new elements currently apparent such as the right to decent work. It should also reflect the social dimension of the right to work, as the right not only had implications for individuals but also for society as a whole. He also suggested reflecting on the right to work as an economic right as it was a basis for economic development. Furthermore, he stressed the need to ensure the justiciability of the right to work in national legislation and to move towards a greater protection of the right at international level. He noted that economic, social and cultural rights currently did not enjoy the same degree of protection as civil and political rights owing to the lack of an optional protocol to the Covenant.

588. Mr. Saidov (Director, National Human Rights Centre of Uzbekistan, Tashkent) said that the right to work should be seen as a human right that was fundamental to the enjoyment of other human rights. The right to work comprised three elements: the right to the opportunity to gain a living by working, the right to freely chosen work without discrimination and the right to protection against arbitrary dismissals by employers. He emphasized the importance of taking into account the general comments or recommendations of other United Nations treaty bodies, such as general comment No. 18 (1999) on non-discrimination of the Human Rights Committee and general recommendation No. 16 on unpaid women workers in rural and urban family enterprises of the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women.

589. Mr. Kuczkiewicz (Director, Department of Trade Union Rights, International Confederation of Free Trade Unions) commended the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights for involving representatives of trade unions in discussions on the general comment. He noted, however, that he would have preferred the general comment to address articles 6 to 8 of the Covenant at the same time given the interrelatedness of these articles. Mr. Kuczkiewicz was pleased that the draft general comment made reference to the issue of globalization and suggested that the effect of globalization on the right to work be further clarified. With regard to the issue of discrimination, he suggested that trade unionists and migrant workers be included among the categories of groups vulnerable to discrimination. When dealing with the issue of forced labour he proposed that the text give more attention to working conditions in prisons. Furthermore, he recommended that mention be made of the tripartite system and its essential role for the protection of the right to work and that ILO case law and instruments be reflected with more emphasis.

590. Ms. Dairiam (Executive Director, International Women's Rights Action Watch (Asia Pacific)) said the respect for and protection and fulfilment of the right to work needed to take place within the framework of equality and non-discrimination in accordance with articles 2, paragraph 2, and 3 of the Covenant. She said that special attention should be given to the elimination of discrimination against women, because women generally lagged behind men in the enjoyment of the right to work. She underlined that, to ensure equality between men and women, States needed to analyse carefully the factors that impeded women's access to the labour market. Laws and policies should be sensitive to the disadvantages that women faced as women, to ensure substantive equality, including by providing adequate maternity benefits, social policies for child care and other measures for combining family responsibilities with work responsibilities. Ms. Dairiam pointed to the need for temporary special measures to enable women to achieve de facto equality. She argued that States should be obligated to gather data on the relative positions of women and men in the labour market and develop equality plans setting indicators and benchmarks for the progressive realization of equality rights in all aspects of work.

591. Ms. Dairiam read out a statement on behalf of the Canadian organization Women's Economic Equality Project. The statement reiterated that the right to work had different implications and ramifications for women given women's social and economically disadvantaged position in most societies. It also argued that the globalization process accentuated women's disadvantaged position with an increasing number of women working in low-paid part-time contract jobs, in the informal sector, as domestic workers, ragpickers, home-based pieceworkers, etc., or being trafficked into prostitution. The Project also reiterated that laws and policies needed to take into account the economic and social disadvantages of women to achieve de facto equality between men and women.

592. Ms. Thomas (Chief, Equality and Employment Branch, ILO) said ILO welcomed the Committee's initiative to prepare a general comment on the right to work. She recommended that the draft general comment further elaborate upon the facets of globalization that might affect the right to work as well as upon the close linkage between the right to work and poverty. Moreover, she proposed that the draft make reference to ILO Convention No. 122 (1964) and ILO Recommendation No. 169 (1984) both concerning Employment Policy, which affirm the right to work that is freely chosen and the obligation of States to combat forced labour. Ms. Thomas also suggested that the general comment should underline States' obligation to take adequate measures in the area of job creation. Moreover, she agreed with the view of UNESCO that the full realization of the right to work required the promotion of the right to education and training.

593. With regard to the issue of discrimination, Ms. Thomas said the Committee could use the definitions in ILO Convention No. 111 (1958) concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation, the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination and the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women. She recommended that the Committee give the term "work" a broad definition in the general comment so as to include all forms of activity that represented a means of subsistence. Concerning groups vulnerable to discrimination, Ms. Thomas underlined the importance of not presenting these groups only as victims, but also as members of society who contributed positively to the economy. With regard to women's right to work, she suggested that the text briefly mention some of the protection measures (maternity leave, child care, protection against sexual harassment) and place more emphasis on positive measures, or affirmative action to address inequalities.

594. Concerning child labour, Ms. Thomas suggested that the general comment make reference to ILO Conventions Nos. 138 (1973) concerning Minimum Age for Admission to Employment and 182 (1999) concerning the Prohibition and Immediate Action for the Elimination of the Worst Forms of Child Labour). She recommended that the general comment mention agricultural workers, which she saw as a particularly important category of workers. She found interesting the way the concept of decent work had been incorporated into the draft general comment. She said that the concept was part of ILO terminology and implied that whatever the situation in a given country was, the right to work could not justify abusive employment. She pointed to ongoing work within the organization to define the term more clearly and noted that the report of the World Commission on the Social Dimension of Globalization, due to be released in December 2003, might introduce new language.

595. With regard to the issues of discrimination and positive measures, a Committee member inquired about the ILO view on protective measures, such as different retirement ages and forbidding women from working on night shifts and carrying heavy weights, which might be seen as discriminatory. Ms. Thomas replied by referring to the resolution on equal of opportunities and equal treatment for men and women in employment, adopted on 27 June 1985 by ILO according to which any special measures which imposed restrictions or prohibitions on women in the name of protection needed to be reviewed in the national context taking into account the views of workers and women themselves. Ms. Thomas said that restrictions in the name of equality might be good in some circumstances and some countries, but not be warranted in others and might keep women out of the labour market. Ms. Dairiam (Executive Director,

International Women's Rights Action Watch (Asia Pacific)) noted in this regard that protective measures were no longer the norm and should be distinguished from positive measures in the form of affirmative action. The latter aimed at achieving equality, as provided for under international human rights treaties, by bringing disadvantaged groups up to the level of other groups.

596. The view that the issues of equality between men and women, direct and indirect discrimination as well as positive measures be given more emphasis was supported by a number of Committee members. A member suggested that the draft general comment emphasize the importance of measures to ensure that parents are able to combine work responsibilities with family life and that the interrelatedness of article 9 (right to social security) with articles 6, 7, 8 of the Covenant should be reflected in the draft.

597. Ms. Van Dooren (Human Rights Office, Amersfoort, The Netherlands) suggested making clearer that the list of grounds for discrimination in the draft general comment was illustrative and not exhaustive. With regard to the obligations of State parties, she argued that a fourth category should be added to the obligations to respect, protect and fulfil, namely the obligation to redress (a notion borrowed from Mr. Asbjørn Eide, Chairperson-Rapporteur, Working Group on Minorities, Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights). Though the right to work did not imply the right to get a job, Ms. Van Dooren argued that States were under an obligation to redress the economic situation with a view to creating favourable conditions for employment. It should also be made clear which obligations were of immediate effect and self-executing.

598. Mr. Özden (Europe-Third World Centre Europe) noted that no State was able to realize the goal of full employment. He also argued that the general comment should not refer to the Global Compact Initiative of the Secretary-General, but rather to the Norms on the Responsibilities of Transnational Corporations and Other Business Enterprises with regard to Human Rights adopted by the Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights in its resolution 2003/16 of 13 August 2003. Mr. Özden furthermore suggested that the problem of inadequate protection of workers in *maquiladora* assembly plants be mentioned in the general comment.

599. Adding to the many ideas and suggestions that had been made by the invited experts, Committee members made a number of comments on the draft general comment. It was suggested that it be made clear that the right to work covered the right to independent work and to engage in self-employment, also after retirement. It was also argued that the typology of obligations as well as what would constitute a failure to protect the right to work could be further clarified. Furthermore, it was suggested that the general comment should mention the notion of the right to work as part of a person's identity. Other suggestions made were to include references to relevant recent United Nations world summits and documents, including the World Summit for Social Development (held in Copenhagen on 6-12 March 1995) and the Millennium Development Goals,[33] as outlined in the Millennium Declaration, and to make a reference to the responsibilities of private companies.

---

[33] A/56/326, annex.

600. Mr. Texier said that all submissions and comments made would be taken into consideration, as would any additional written comments submitted before May 2004. He stressed that the concept of decent work in the context of the general comment was not used in a moral sense, but rather referred to work which was in conformity with the provisions of the Covenant. He mentioned some of the main suggestions made, including that the issue of discrimination should be given more prominence, that the issue of globalization should be developed further, that a number of ILO instruments should be referred to in the text, and that mention could be made of the problem of anti-union activities. He appreciated the participation of representatives of trade unions in the discussions and regretted that trade unions only very rarely participate in the work of the Committee. Mr. Texier said he would strive to incorporate all comments into the final draft that was scheduled to be adopted at the thirty-second session of the Committee (26 April-14 May 2004).

601. Concluding the discussion, the Chairperson thanked participants for their contributions, which would help the Committee improve its general comments. She also underlined the importance of preparing the final draft general comments in close cooperation with ILO.

CHAPTER VI

Decisions adopted and matters discussed by the Committee at its thirtieth and thirty-first sessions

A. Action taken by the Committee on information on economic, social and cultural rights received from sources other than the States parties

1. Information provided in connection with consideration by the Committee of a State party report

602. The Committee attaches great importance to the information provided to it by sources other than the State party in connection with its consideration of a State party's report. That information, being an integral part of the Committee's constructive dialogue with a State party, is made available by the Secretariat to the State party concerned in advance of the Committee's consideration of the report of that State party.

2. Information received following consideration by the Committee of a State party report and adoption of concluding observations

603. On various occasions in the past, the Committee has been receiving information, mainly from non-governmental organizations, after consideration of the State party's report and adoption of concluding observations thereon. In fact that was follow-up information on the Committee's conclusions and recommendations. Not being in a position to consider and act upon such information without reopening its dialogue with a State party (except in cases specifically addressed in concluding observations), the Committee will consider and act upon the information received from sources other than a State party only in cases where such information has been specifically requested in its concluding observations.

604. The Committee considers that, following its consideration of the State party report and adoption of concluding observations, the primary responsibility for their implementation lies with the national Government, which is bound to report on measures taken in this respect to the Committee in its next periodic report. Therefore, the Committee recommends that information referred to in the preceding paragraph be submitted by authors directly to national competent authorities with a view to assisting them in implementing the Committee's concluding observations.

3. Information provided with respect to non-reporting States parties

605. The Committee has also been receiving information from both international and national non-governmental organizations on the status of implementation of economic, social and cultural rights by:

(*a*) States parties that have not submitted any report at all since ratification of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and its entry into force;

(*b*) States parties with long overdue periodic reports.

606. In both cases the failure of the State party to comply with its obligations under the Covenant, and in particular with their reporting obligations, had made it impossible for the Committee to monitor effectively the implementation by those States of the economic, social and cultural rights set forth in the Covenant in accordance with the mandate conferred to the Committee by the Economic and Social Council.

607. At its thirtieth session, held from 5 to 23 May 2003, the Committee, in the spirit of open and constructive dialogue with States parties, decided that in both cases referred to above, it might take, on a case-by-case basis, the following action:

(*a*) The Committee might informally bring to the attention of the State party concerned the information received and urge the State party to submit its overdue report without further delay;

(*b*) The Committee might formally-through a letter from the Chairperson-bring to the attention of the State party concerned the information received and urge the State party to submit its overdue report without further delay. The Committee might formally request the State party to provide it with information addressing issues raised in non-governmental organizations' submissions and to submit its overdue report without further delay. That letter would also be made available to the non-governmental organizations concerned upon request.

B. Cooperation with specialized agencies

608. Following the UNESCO decision to designate two members of the Committee on Conventions and Recommendations of its Executive Board to take part in the UNESCO (Committee on Conventions and Recommendations)/Economic and Social Council (Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights) Joint Expert Group on the monitoring of the right to education, namely Messrs Klaus Hüfner (Germany) and Olabiyi B. J. Yaï (Benin), the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights designated its Chairperson, Ms. Virginia Bonoan-Dandan (Philippines), and its Vice-Chairperson, Mr. Eibe Riedel (Germany) to represent it in the Joint Expert Group. The first meeting of the Group was held on 19 May 2003 at UNESCO headquarters in Paris (see above, chap. V, sect. A, paras. 559-576).

C. Day of general discussion

609. At its thirty-first session, on 24 November 2003, the Committee held a day of general discussion on the right to work (art. 6 of the Covenant). The discussion laid foundations for elaboration of a draft general comment on article 6 of the Covenant (see above, chap. V, sect. B, paras. 577-601).

D. General comments

610. At its thirtieth session, the Committee, as follow-up to its day of general discussion on the equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of all economic, social and cultural rights (art. 3 of the Covenant), at its twenty-eighth session on 13 May 2002, held discussions on the draft general comment on article 3 of the Covenant.

E. Secretary-General's proposals on the United Nations human rights treaty bodies system

611. At its thirtieth session, the Committee discussed and adopted its recommendations to the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights in response to the Secretary-General's proposals on the human rights treaty bodies system[34] (see below, annex IV).

F. Cooperation with special procedures' mechanisms of the Commission on Human Rights

612. The Committee, at its thirtieth session under agenda item "Substantive issues arising in the implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights", held discussions with Mr. Miloon Kothari, Special Rapporteur of the Commission on Human Rights adequate housing, and Mr. Jean Ziegler, Special Rapporteur of the Commission on the right to food, with respect to specific country situations, as well as issues of common interest and concern.

G. Workshop on follow-up action to the Committee's concluding observations

613. The Committee is of the view that action taken at the national level on the concluding observations that it addresses to States parties at the end of its consideration of their reports is of vital importance for the effective promotion and protection of human rights set forth in international human rights treaties, and in particular in the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. The Committee noted with interest a workshop on follow-up action, organized in August 2002 in Ecuador by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights in cooperation with some States parties to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. It appears that the workshop had a positive impact towards strengthening protection of human rights at the national level. The Committee also took note of the preparation by the Office of the High Commissioner of another workshop on follow-up action addressed to States parties to the Convention on the Rights of the Child to be held in the Syrian Arab Republic in December 2003.

614. Accordingly, the Committee invites the Office of the High Commissioner to consider the possibility of organizing, in 2005, a workshop on follow-up action to its concluding observations for the States parties to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural rights. States parties to the Covenant from the Asian region, whose reports have recently been considered by the Committee (Republic of Korea, Japan, Democratic People's Republic of Korea, Mongolia) or that will be considered in 2005-2006 (China and eventually others) could be invited to participate at this workshop.

---

[34] See the Report of the Secretary-General (A/57/387 and Corr.1).

CHAPTER VII

Adoption of the report

615. At its 56th meeting, held on 28 November 2003, the Committee considered its draft report to the Economic and Social Council on the work of its thirtieth and thirty-first sessions (E/C.12/2003/CRP.1). The Committee adopted the report as amended during the discussions.

ANNEXES

ANNEX I

States parties to the Covenant and status of submission of reports (as of 28 November 2003)

A. Initial and second periodic reports

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Initial reports*			*Second periodic reports*		
		Articles 6-9	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*	*Articles 6-9*	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*
		(Summary records of consideration of reports)					
1. Afghanistan	24 April 1983	E/1990/5/Add.8 (E/C.12/1991/SR.2, 4-6 and 8)			Overdue		
2. Albania	4 January 1992	Overdue					
3. Algeria	12 December 1989	E/1990/5/Add.22 (E/C.12/1995/SR.46 and 47)			E/1990/6/Add.26 (E/C.12/2001/SR.65 and 66; E/C.12/1/Add.71)		
4. Angola	10 April 1992	Overdue					
5. Argentina	8 November 1986	E/1990/5/Add.18 (E/C.12/1994/SR.31, 32, 35, 36 and 37)		E/1988/5/Add.4 E/1988/5/Add.8 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.18-20)	E/1990/6/Add.16 (E/C.12/1999/SR.33-36)		
6. Armenia	13 December 1993	E/1990/5/Add.36 (E/C.12/1999/SR.38-40)			Was due on 30 June 2001		
7. Australia	10 March 1976	E/1978/8/Add.15 (E/1980/WG.1/ SR.12-13)	E/1980/6/Add.22 (E/1981/WG.1/ SR.18)	E/1982/3/Add.9 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.13-14	E/1984/7/Add.22 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.17, 18 and 21)	E/1986/4/Add.7 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.10, 11, 13 and 14)	E/1990/7/Add.13 (E/C.12/1993/ SR.13, 15 and 20)
8. Austria	10 December 1978	E/1984/6/Add.17 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.3-4)	E/1980/6/Add.19 (E/1981/WG.1/ SR.8)	E/1982/3/Add.37 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.3)	E/1990/6/Add.5 (E/C.12/1994/ SR.39-41)	E/1986/4/Add.8 and Corr.1 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.4 and 7)	E/1990/6/Add.5 (E/C.12/1994/ SR.39-41)
9. Azerbaijan	13 November 1992	E/1990/5/Add.30 (E/C.12/1997/SR.39-41)			E/1990/6/Add.37. Received on 6 May 2003		
10. Bangladesh	5 January 1999	Was due on 30 June 2001					
11. Barbados	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.33 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.3)	E/1980/6/Add.27 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.6-7)	E/1982/3/Add.24 (E/1983/WG.1/ SR.14-15)	Overdue		
12. Belarus	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.19 (E/1980/WG.1/ SR.16)	E/1980/6/Add.18 (E/1981/WG.1/ SR.16)	E/1982/3/Add.3 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.9-10)	E/1984/7/Add.8 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.13-15)	E/1986/4/Add.19 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.10-12)	E/1990/7/Add.5 (E/C.12/1992/ SR.2, 3 and 12)
13. Belgium	21 July 1983	E/1990/5/Add.15 (E/C.12/1994/SR.15-17)			E/1990/6/Add.18 (E/C.12/2000/SR.64-66)		
14. Benin	12 June 1992	E/1990/5/Add.48 (E/C.12/2002/SR.8-10; E/C.12/1/Add.78			Due on 30 June 2007		
15. Bolivia	12 November 1982	E/1990/5/Add.44 (E/C.12/2001/SR.15-17; E/C.12/1/Add.60)			Due on 30 June 2005		

Annex I *(continued)*

State party	Date of entry into force	Initial reports			Second periodic reports		
		Articles 6-9	Articles 10-12	Articles 13-15	Articles 6-9	Articles 10-12	Articles 13-15
		(Summary records of consideration of reports)					
16. Bosnia and Herzegovina	6 March 1993	Overdue					
17. Brazil	24 April 1992	E/1990/5/Add.53 (E/C.12/2003/SR.8-10)			Due on 30 June 2006		
18. Bulgaria	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.24 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.12)	E/1980/6/Add.29 (E/1982/WG.1/SR.8)	E/1982/3/Add.23 (E/1983/WG.1/ SR.11-13)	E/1984/7/Add.18 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.9 and 11)	E/1986/4/Add.20 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.17-19)	
19. Burkina Faso	4 April 1999	Was due on 30 June 2001					
20. Burundi	9 August 1990	Overdue					
21. Cambodia	26 August 1992	Overdue					
22. Cameroon	27 September 1984	E/1990/5/Add.35 (E/C.12/1999/ SR.41-43)	E/1986/3/Add.8 (E/C.12/1989/ SR.6-7)	E/1990/5/Add.35 (E/C.12/1999/ SR.41-43)	Was due on 30 June 2001		
23. Canada	19 August 1976	E/1978/8/Add.32 (E/1982/WG.1/SR.1-2)	E/1980/6/Add.32 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.4 and 6)	E/1982/3/Add.34 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.13, 15 and 16)	E/1984/7/Add.28 (E/C.12/1989/ SR.8 and 11)	E/1990/6/Add.3 (E/C.12/1993/SR.6, 7 and 18)	
24. Cape Verde	6 November 1993	Overdue					
25. Central African Republic	8 August 1981	Overdue					
26. Chad	9 September 1995	Overdue					
27. Chile	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.10 and 28 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.8-9)	E/1980/6/Add.4 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.7)	E/1982/3/Add.40 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.12-13 and 16)	E/1984/7/Add.1 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.11-12)	E/1986/4/Add.18 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.12-13 and 16)	Overdue
28. China	27 June 2001	E/1990/5/Add.59 (Received on 27 June 2003) (Pending consideration)					
29. Colombia	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.17 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.15)	E/1986/3/Add.3 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.6 and 9)	E/1982/3/Add.36 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.15, 21 and 22)	E/1984/7/Add.21/ Rev.1 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.22 and 25)	E/1986/4/Add.25 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.12-14 and 17)	E/1990/7/Add.4 (E/C.12/1991/ SR.17, 18 and 25)
30. Congo	5 January 1984	Overdue (without report: E/C.12/2000/SR.16 and 17)					
31. Costa Rica	3 January 1976	E/1990/5/Add.3 (E/C.12/1990/SR.38, 40, 41 and 43)			Overdue		
32. Côte d'Ivoire	26 June 1992	Overdue					
33. Croatia	8 October 1991	E/1990/5/Add.46 (E/C.12/2001/SR.69, 70 and 71; E/C.12/1/Add.73)			Due on 30 June 2006		
34. Cyprus	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.21 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.17)	E/1980/6/Add.3 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.6)	E/1982/3/Add.19 (E/1983/WG.1/SR.7-8)	E/1984/7/Add.13 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.18 and 22)	E/1986/4/Add.2 and 26 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.2, 3 and 5)	
35. Czech Republic	1 January 1993	E/1990/5/Add.47 (E/C.12/2002/SR.3-5; E/C.12/1/Add.76)			Due on 30 June 2007		
36. Democratic People's Republic of Korea	14 December 1981	E/1984/6/Add.7 (E/C.12/1987/SR.21-22)	E/1986/3/Add.5 (E/C.12/1987/ SR.21-22)	E/1988/5/Add.6 (E/C.12/1991/ SR.6, 8 and 10)	E/1990/6/Add.35 (E/C.12/2003/SR.44-46)		
37. Democratic Republic of the Congo	1 February 1977	E/1984/6/Add.18	E/1986/3/Add.7	E/1982/3/Add.41	Overdue		
		(E/C.12/1988/SR.16-19)					

Annex I *(continued)*

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Initial reports*			*Second periodic reports*		
		Articles 6-9	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*	*Articles 6-9*	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*
		(Summary records of consideration of reports)					
38. Denmark	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.13 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.10)	E/1980/6/Add.15 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.12)	E/1982/3/Add.20 (E/1983/WG.1/SR.8-9)	E/1984/7/Add.11 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.17 and 21)	E/1986/4/Add.16 (E/C.12/1988/SR.8-9)	
39. Djibouti	5 February 2003	Due on 30 June 2005					
40. Dominica	17 September 1993	Overdue					
41. Dominican Republic	4 April 1978	E/1990/5/Add.4 (E/C.12/1990/SR.43-45 and 47)			E/1990/6/Add.7 (E/C.12/1996/SR.29 and 30) (E/C.12/1997/SR.29-31)		
42. Ecuador	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.1 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.4-5)	E/1986/3/Add.14 (E/C.12/1990/SR.37-39 and 42)	E/1988/5/Add.7	E/1984/7/Add.12 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.20 and 22)	E/1990/6/Add.36 (Pending consideration)	
43. Egypt	14 April 1982	E/1990/5/Add.38 (E/C.12/2000/SR.12, 13 and 14)			Overdue (was due on 30 June 2003)		
44. El Salvador	29 February 1980	E/1990/5/Add.25 (E/C.12/1996/SR.15, 16 and 18)			Overdue		
45. Equatorial Guinea	25 December 1987	Overdue					
46. Eritrea	17 July 2001	Overdue (was due on 30 June 2003)					
47. Estonia	21 January 1992	E/1990/5/Add.51 (E/C.12/2002/SR.41-43; E/C.12/1/Add.85)			Due on 30 June 2007		
48. Ethiopia	11 September 1993	Overdue					
49. Finland	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.14 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.6)	E/1980/6/Add.11 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.10)	E/1982/3/Add.28 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.7-8)	E/1984/7/Add.14 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.17-18)	E/1986/4/Add.4 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.8-9 and 11)	E/1990/7/Add.1 (E/C.12/1991/ SR.11, 12 and 16)
50. France	4 February 1981	E/1984/6/Add.11 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.18-19 and 21)	E/1986/3/Add.10 (E/C.12/1989/ SR.12-13)	E/1982/3/Add.30 and Corr.1 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.5 and 7)	E/1990/6/Add.27 (E/C.12/2001/SR.67 and 68; E/C.12/1/Add.72)		
51. Gabon	21 April 1983	Overdue					
52. Gambia	29 March 1979	Overdue					
53. Georgia	3 August 1994	E/1990/5/Add.37 (E/C.12/2000/SR.3, 4 and 5)			E/1990/6/Add.31 (E/C.12/2002/SR.35 and 36; E/C.12/1/Add.83)		
54. Germany	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.8 and Corr.1 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.8) E/1978/8/Add.11 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.10)	E/1980/6/Add.6 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.8) E/1980/6/Add.10 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.10)	E/1982/3/Add.15 and Corr.1 (E/1983/WG.1/ SR.5-6) E/1982/3/Add.14 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.17-18)	E/1984/7/Add.3 and 23 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.12 and 16) E/1984/7/Add.24 and Corr.1 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.22-23 and 25)	E/1986/4/Add.11 (E/C.12/1987/ SR.11, 12 and 14) E/1986/4/Add.10 (E/C.12/1987/ SR.19-20)	E/1990/7/Add.12 (E/C.12/1993/ SR.35, 36 and 46)
55. Ghana	7 December 2000	Overdue					
56. Greece	16 August 1985	E/1990/5/Add.56 (Pending consideration)					
57. Grenada	6 December 1991	Overdue					
58. Guatemala	19 August 1988	E/1990/5/Add.24 (E/C.12/1996/SR.11-14)			E/1990/6/Add.34/Rev.1 (E/C.12/2003/SR.38-39).		
59. Guinea	24 April 1978	Overdue					
60. Guinea-Bissau	2 October 1992	Overdue					

Annex I (*continued*)

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Initial reports*			*Second periodic reports*		
		Articles 6-9	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*	*Articles 6-9*	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*
		(Summary records of consideration of reports)					
61. Guyana	15 May 1977	E/1990/5/Add.27 (Pending consideration)		E/1982/3/Add.5, 29 and 32 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.20 and 22 and E/1985/WG.1/SR.6)			
62. Honduras	17 May 1981	E/1990/5/Add.40 (E/C.12/2001/SR.5-7; E/C.12/1/Add.57)			Due on 30 June 2006		
63. Hungary	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.7 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.7)	E/1980/6/Add.37 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.6-7 and 9)	E/1982/3/Add.10 (E/1982/WG.1/SR.14)	E/1984/7/Add.15 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.19 and 21)	E/1986/4/Add.1 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.6-7 and 9)	E/1990/7/Add.10 (E/C.12/1992/ SR.9, 12 and 21)
64. Iceland	22 November 1979	E/1990/5/Add.6 and Add.14 and Corr.1 (E/C.12/1993/SR.29-31)			E/1990/6/Add.15 (E/C.12/1999/SR.3-5)		
65. India	10 July 1979	E/1984/6/Add.13 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.20 and 24)	E/1980/6/Add.34 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.6 and 8)	E/1988/5/Add.5 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.16-17 and 19)	Overdue		
66. Iran (Islamic Republic of)	3 January 1976	E/1990/5/Add.9 (E/C.12/1993/SR.7-9 and 20)		E/1982/3/Add.43 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.42, 43 and 45)	Overdue		
67. Iraq	3 January 1976	E/1984/6/Add.3 and 8 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.8 and 11)	E/1980/6/Add.14 (E/1981/WG.1/ SR.12)	E/1982/3/Add.26 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.3-4)		E/1986/4/Add.3 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.8 and 11)	E/1990/7/Add.15 (E/C.12/1994/ SR.11 and 14)
68. Ireland	8 March 1990	E/1990/5/Add.34 (E/C.12/1999/SR.14-16)			E/1990/6/Add.29 (E/C.12/2002/SR.6 and 7; E/C.12/1/Add.77)		
69. Israel	3 January 1992	E/1990/5/Add.39 (E/C.12/1998/SR.31-33)			E/1990/6/Add.32 (E/C.12/2003/SR.17-19)		
70. Italy	15 December 1978	E/1978/8/Add.34 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.3-4)	E/1980/6/Add.31 and 36 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.3 and 5)		E/1990/6/Add.2 (E/C.12/1992/SR.13, 14 and 21)		
71. Jamaica	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.27 (E/1980/WG.1/ SR.20)	E/1986/3/Add.12 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.10-12 and 15)	E/1988/5/Add.3 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.10-12 and 15)	E/1984/7/Add.30 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.10-12 and 15)	E/1990/6/Add.28 (E/C.12/2001/SR.73; E/C.12/1/Add.75)	
72. Japan	21 September 1979	E/1984/6/Add.6 and Corr.1 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.9-10)	E/1986/3/Add.4 and Corr.1 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.20-21 and 23)	E/1982/3/Add.7 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.12-13)	E/1990/6/Add.21 (E/C.12/2001/SR.42-43; E/C.12/1/Add.67)		
73. Jordan	3 January 1976	E/1984/6/Add.15 (E/C.12/1987/SR.6-8)	E/1986/3/Add.6 (E/C.12/1987/SR.8)	E/1982/3/Add.38/ Rev.1 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.30-32)	E/1990/6/Add.17 (E/C.12/2000/SR.30-31; E/C.12/1/Add.46)		
74. Kenya*	3 January 1976	Overdue			Overdue		
75. Kuwait	31 August 1996	E/1990/5/Add.57 (Pending consideration)					
76. Kyrgyzstan	7 January 1995	E/1990/5/Add.42 (E/C.12/2000/SR.42-44; E/C.12/1/Add.49)			Due on 30 June 2005		
77. Latvia	14 July 1992	Overdue					

Annex I *(continued)*

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Initial reports*			*Second periodic reports*		
		Articles 6-9	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*	*Articles 6-9*	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*
		(Summary records of consideration of reports)					
78. Lebanon	3 January 1976	E/1990/5/Add.16 (E/C.12/1993/SR.14, 16 and 21)			Overdue		
79. Lesotho	9 December 1992	Overdue					
80. Libyan Arab Jamahiriya	3 January 1976	E/1990/5/Add.26 (E/C.12/1997/SR.20-21)		E/1982/3/Add.6 and 25 (E/1983/WG.1/ SR.16-17)	Overdue		
81. Liechtenstein	10 March 1999	Overdue					
82. Lithuania	20 February 1992	E/1990/5/Add.55 (Pending consideration)					
83. Luxembourg	18 November 1983	E/1990/5/Add.1 (E/C.12/1990/SR.33-36)			E/1990/6/Add.9 (E/C.12/1997/SR.48 and 49)		
84. Madagascar	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.29 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.2)	E/1980/6/Add.39 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.2-3 and 5)	Overdue	E/1984/7/Add.19 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.14 and 18)	Overdue	
85. Malawi	22 March 1994	Overdue					
86. Mali	3 January 1976	Overdue					
87. Malta	13 December 1990	E/1990/5/Add.58 (Received on 7 February 2003 (Pending consideration)					
88. Mauritius	3 January 1976	E/1990/5/Add.21 (E/C.12/1995/SR.40, 41 and 43)			Overdue		
89. Mexico	23 June 1981	E/1984/6/Add.2 and 10 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.24, 26 and 28)	E/1986/3/Add.13 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.6, 7 and 9)	E/1982/3/Add.8 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.14-15)	E/1990/6/Add.4 (E/C.12/1993/SR.32-35 and 49)		
90. Monaco	28 November 1997	Overdue					
91. Mongolia	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.6 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.7)	E/1980/6/Add.7 (E/1981/WG.1/ SR.8-9)	E/1982/3/Add.11 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.15-16)	E/1984/7/Add.6 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.16 and 18)	E/1986/4/Add.9 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.5 and 7)	
92. Morocco	3 August 1979	E/1990/5/Add.13 (E/C.12/1994/SR.8-10)			E/1990/6/Add.20 (E/C.12/2000/SR.70-72)		
93. Namibia	28 February 1995	Overdue					
94. Nepal	14 August 1991	E/1990/5/Add.45 (E/C.12/2001/SR.44-46; E/C.12/1/Add.66)			Due on 30 June 2006		
95. Netherlands	11 March 1979	E/1984/6/Add.14 and 20 (E/C.12/1987/SR.5-6) (E/C.12/1989/SR.14-15)	E/1980/6/Add.33 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.4-6 and 8)	E/1982/3/Add.35 and 44 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.14 and 18) (E/C.12/1989/ SR.14-15)	E/1990/6/Add.11 E/1990/6/Add.12 (E/C.12/1998/ SR.13-17)	E/1986/4/Add.24 (E/C.12/1989/ SR.14-15)	E/1990/6/Add.13 (E/C.12/1998/ SR.13-17)
96. New Zealand	28 March 1979	E/1990/5/Add.5, 11 and 12 (E/C.12/1993/SR.24-26)			E/1990/6/Add.33 (E/C.12/2003/SR.11-12)		
97. Nicaragua	12 June 1980	E/1984/6/Add.9 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.16-17 and 19)	E/1986/3/Add.15 (E/C.12/1993/ SR.27, 28 and 46)	E/1982/3/Add.31 and Corr.1 (E/1985/WG.1/SR.15)	Overdue		
98. Niger	7 June 1986	Overdue					
99. Nigeria	29 October 1993	E/1990/5/Add.31 (E/C.12/1998/SR.6-9)			Was due on 30 June 2000		
100. Norway	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.12 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.5)	E/1980/6/Add.5 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.14)	E/1982/3/Add.12 (E/1982/WG.1/SR.16)	E/1984/7/Add.16 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.19 and 22)	E/1986/4/Add.21 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.14-15)	E/1990/7/Add.7 (E/C.12/1992/ SR.4, 5 and 12)

Annex I (*continued*)

State party	Date of entry into force	Initial reports			Second periodic reports		
		Articles 6-9	Articles 10-12	Articles 13-15	Articles 6-9	Articles 10-12	Articles 13-15
		(Summary records of consideration of reports)					
101. Panama	8 June 1977	E/1984/6/Add.19 (E/C.12/1991/ SR.3, 5 and 8)	E/1980/6/Add.20 and 23 (E/1982/WG.1/SR.5)	E/1988/5/Add.9 (E/C.12/1991/ SR.3, 5 and 8)	E/1990/6/Add.24 (Pending consideration)	E/1986/4/Add.22 (E/C.12/1991/ SR.3, 5 and 8)	E/1990/6/Add.24 (E/C.12/2001/ SR.36; E/C.12/1/ Add.64)
102. Paraguay	10 September 1992	E/1990/5/Add.23 (E/C.12/1996/SR.1, 2 and 4)			Overdue		
103. Peru	28 July 1978	E/1984/6/Add.5 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.11 and 18)	E/1990/5/Add.29 (E/C.12/1997/SR.15-17)		Overdue		
104. Philippines	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.4 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.11)	E/1986/3/Add.17 (E/C.12/1995/ SR.11, 12 and 14)	E/1988/5/Add.2 (E/C.12/1990/ SR.8-9 and 11)	E/1984/7/Add.4 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.15 and 20)	Overdue	
105. Poland	18 June 1977	E/1978/8/Add.23 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.18-19)	E/1980/6/Add.12 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.11)	E/1982/3/Add.21 (E/1983/WG.1/ SR.9-10)	E/1984/7/Add.26 and 27 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.25-27)	E/1986/4/Add.12 (E/C.12/1989/ SR.5-6)	E/1990/7/Add.9 (E/C.12/1992/ SR.6, 7 and 15)
106. Portugal	31 October 1978		E/1980/6/Add.35/ Rev.1 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.2 and 4)	E/1982/3/Add.27/ Rev.1 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.6 and 9)	E/1990/6/Add.6 (E/C.12/1995/SR.7, 8 and 10) E/1990/6/Add.8 (Macau) (E/C.12/1996/SR.31-33)		
107. Republic of Korea	10 July 1990	E/1990/5/Add.19 (E/C.12/1995/SR.3, 4 and 6)			E/1990/6/Add.23 (E/C.12/1/Add.12-14; E/C.12/1/Add.59)		
108. Republic of Moldova	26 March 1993	E/1990/5/Add.52 (E/C.12/2003/SR.32-34)			Due on 30 June 2008		
109. Romania	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.20 (E/1980/WG.1/ SR.16-17)	E/1980/6/Add.1 (E/1981/WG.1/ SR.5)	E/1982/3/Add.13 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.17-18)	E/1984/7/Add.17 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.10 and 13)	E/1986/4/Add.17 (E/C.12/1988/SR.6)	E/1990/7/Add.14 (E/C.12/1994/ SR.5, 7 and 13)
110. Russian Federation	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.16 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.14)	E/1980/6/Add.17 (E/1981/WG.1/ SR.14-15)	E/1982/3/Add.1 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.11-12)	E/1984/7/Add.7 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.9-10)	E/1986/4/Add.14 (E/C.12/1987/ SR.16-18)	E/1990/7/Add.8 (withdrawn)
111. Rwanda	3 January 1976	E/1984/6/Add.4 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.10 and 12)	E/1986/3/Add.1 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.16 and 19)	E/1982/3/Add.42 (E/C.12/1989/ SR.10-12)	E/1984/7/Add.29 (E/C.12/1989/ SR.10-12)	Overdue	
112. Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	9 February 1982	Overdue					
113. San Marino	18 January 1986	Overdue					
114. Senegal	13 May 1978	E/1984/6/Add.22 (E/C.12/1993/ SR.37, 38 and 49)	E/1980/6/Add.13/ Rev.1 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.11)	E/1982/3/Add.17 (E/1983/WG.1/ SR.14-16)	E/1990/6/Add.25 (E/C.12/2001/SR.32-33; E/C.12/1/Add.62)		
115. Serbia and Montenegro	12 March 2001	E/1990/5/Add.61 (Received on 10 October 2003) (Pending consideration)					

Annex I (*continued*)

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Initial reports*			*Second periodic reports*		
		Articles 6-9	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*	*Articles 6-9*	*Articles 10-12*	*Articles 13-15*
		(Summary records of consideration of reports)					
116. Seychelles	5 August 1982	Overdue					
117. Sierra Leone	23 November 1996	Overdue					
118. Slovakia	28 May 1993	E/1990/5/Add.49 (E/C.12/2002/SR.30-32; E/C.12/1/Add.81			Due on 30 June 2007		
119. Slovenia	6 July 1992	Overdue					
120. Solomon Islands	17 March 1982	Overdue (without report: E/C.12/1999/SR.9; E/C.12/1/Add.33) E/1990/5/Add.50 (E/C.12/2002/SR.38 and 39; E/C.12/1/Add.84			Due on 30 June 2005		
121. Somalia	24 April 1990	Overdue					
122. Spain	27 July 1977	E/1978/8/Add.26 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.20)	E/1980/6/Add.28 (E/1982/WG.1/SR.7)	E/1982/3/Add.22 (E/1983/WG.1/ SR.10-11)	E/1984/7/Add.2 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.12 and 14)	E/1986/4/Add.6 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.10 and 13)	E/1990/7/Add.3 (E/C.12/1991/ SR.13, 14, 16 and 22)
123. Sri Lanka	11 September 1980	E/1990/5/Add.32 (E/C.12/1998/SR.3-5)			Overdue (was due on 30 June 2003)		
124. Sudan	18 June 1986	E/1990/5/Add.41 (E/C.12/2000/SR.36 and 38-41)			Overdue (was due on 30 June 2003)		
125. Suriname	28 March 1977	E/1990/5/Add.20 (E/C.12/1995/SR.13, 15 and 16)			Overdue		
126. Sweden	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.5 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.15)	E/1980/6/Add.8 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.9)	E/1982/3/Add.2 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.19-20)	E/1984/7/Add.5 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.14 and 16)	E/1986/4/Add.13 (E/C.12/1988/ SR.10-11)	E/1990/7/Add.2 (E/C.12/1991/ SR.11-13 and 18)
127. Switzerland	18 September 1992	E/1990/5/Add.33 (E/C.12/1998/SR.37-39)			Overdue		
128. Syrian Arab Republic	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.25 and 31 (E/1983/WG.1/SR.2)	E/1980/6/Add.9 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.4)		E/1990/6/Add.1 (E/C.12/1991/SR.7, 9 and 11)		
129. Tajikistan	4 April 1999	Overdue					
130. Thailand	5 December 1999	Overdue					
131. The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	17 September 1991	Overdue					
132. Timor-Leste	16 July 2003	Due on 30 June 2005					
133. Togo	24 August 1984	Overdue (without report: E/C.12/2001/SR.19 and 25)					
134. Trinidad and Tobago	8 March 1979	E/1984/6/Add.21	E/1986/3/Add.11 (E/C.12/1989/SR.17-19)	E/1988/5/Add.1	E/1990/6/Add.30 (E/C.12/2002/SR.15 and 16; E/C.12/1/Add.80)		
135. Tunisia	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.3 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.5-6)	E/1986/3/Add.9 (E/C.12/1989/SR.9)		E/1990/6/Add.14 (E/C.12/1999/SR.17-19)		
136. Turkey	23 December 2003	Due on 30 June 2005					
137. Turkmenistan	1 August 1997	Overdue					
138. Uganda	21 April 1987	Overdue					
139. Ukraine	3 January 1976	E/1978/8/Add.22 (E/1980/WG.1/SR.18)	E/1980/6/Add.24 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.5-6)	E/1982/3/Add.4 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.11-12)	E/1984/7/Add.9 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.13-15)	E/1986/4/Add.5 (E/C.12/1987/ SR.9-11)	E/1990/7/Add.11 (withdrawn)

Annex I (*continued*)

State party	***Date of entry into force***	***Initial reports***			***Second periodic reports***		
		Articles 6-9	***Articles 10-12***	***Articles 13-15***	***Articles 6-9***	***Articles 10-12***	***Articles 13-15***
		(Summary records of consideration of reports)					
140. United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	20 August 1976	E/1978/8/Add.9and 30 (E/1980/WG.1/ SR.19 and E/1982/WG.1/SR.1)	E/1980/6/Add.16 and Corr.1, Add.25 and Corr.1 and Add.26 (E/1981/WG.1/ SR.16-17)	E/1982/3/Add.16 (E/1982/WG.1/ SR.19-21)	E/1984/7/Add.20 (E/1985/WG.1/ SR.14 and 17)	E/1986/4/Add.23 (E/C.12/1989/ SR.16-17) E/1986/4/Add.27 E/1986/4/28 (E/C.12/1994/ SR.33-37)	E/1990/7/Add.16 (E/C.12/1994/ SR.33-37)
141. United Republic of Tanzania	11 September 1976	Overdue	E/1980/6/Add.2 (E/1981/WG.1/SR.5)	Overdue			
142. Uruguay	3 January 1976	E/1990/5/Add.7 (E/C.12/1994/SR.3, 4, 6 and 13)			E/1990/6/Add.10 (E/C.12/1997/SR.42-44)		
143. Uzbekistan	28 December 1995	Overdue					
144. Venezuela	10 August 1978	E/1984/6/Add.1 (E/1984/WG.1/ SR.7, 8 and 10)	E/1980/6/Add 38 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.2 and 5)	E/1982/3/Add.33 (E/1986/WG.1/ SR.12, 17 and 18)	E/1990/6/Add.10 (E/C.12/2001/SR.3-5; E/C.12/1/Add.56)		
145. Viet Nam	24 December 1982	E/1990/5/Add.10 (E/C.12/1993/SR.9-11 and 19)			Overdue		
146. Yemen	9 May 1987	E/1990/5/Add.54 (E.C.12/2003/SR.35-37)			Due on 30 June 2008		
147. Zambia	10 July 1984	E/1990/5/Add.60 (Received on 29 July 2003) (Pending consideration)					
148. Zimbabwe	13 August 1991	E/1990/5/Add.28 (E/C.12/1997/SR.8-10 and 14)			Overdue		

Annex I (*continued*)

B. Third and fourth periodic reports

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Third periodic reports*	*Fourth periodic reports*
1. Afghanistan	24 April 1983		
2. Albania	4 January 1992		
3. Algeria	12 December 1989	Due on 30 June 2006	
4. Angola	10 April 1992		
5. Argentina	8 November 1986		
6. Armenia	13 December 1993		
7. Australia	10 March 1976	E/1994/104/Add.22 (E/C.12/2000/SR.45-47)	Due on 30 June 2005
8. Austria	10 December 1978	Overdue	
9. Azerbaijan	13 November 1992		
10. Bangladesh	5 January 1999		
11. Barbados	3 January 1976		
12. Belarus	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.6 (E/C.12/1996/SR.34-36)	Overdue
13. Belgium	21 July 1983	Due on 30 June 2005	
14. Benin	12 June 1992		
15. Bolivia	12 November 1982		
16. Bosnia and Herzegovina	6 March 1993		
17. Brazil	24 April 1992		
18. Bulgaria	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.16 (E/C.12/1999/SR.30-32)	Overdue
19. Burkina Faso	4 April 1999		
20. Burundi	9 August 1990		
21. Cambodia	26 August 1992		
22. Cameroon	27 September 1984		
23. Canada	19 August 1976	E/1994/104/Add.17 (E/C.12/1998/SR.46-48)	Overdue
24. Cape Verde	6 November 1993		
25. Central African Republic	8 August 1981		

Annex I (*continued*)

State party	***Date of entry into force***	***Third periodic reports***	***Fourth periodic reports***
26. Chad	9 September 1995		
27. Chile	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.26 (Received on 10 July 2003) (Pending consideration)	
28. China	27 June 2001		
29. Colombia	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.2 (E/C.12/1995/SR.32-33 and 35)	E/C.12/4/Add.6 (E/C.12/2001/SR.63-64) Fifth periodic report due on 30 June 2006
30. Congo	5 January 1984		
31. Costa Rica	3 January 1976		
32. Côte d'Ivoire	26 June 1992		
33. Croatia	8 October 1991		
34. Cyprus	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.12 (E/C.12/1998/SR.34-36)	Overdue
35. Czech Republic	1 January 1993		
36. Democratic People's Republic of Korea	14 December 1981	Due on 30 June 2008	
37. Democratic Republic of the Congo	1 February 1977		
38. Denmark	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.15 (E/C.12/1999/SR.11-13)	E/C.12/4/Add.12 (Received on 28 March 2003) (Pending consideration)
39. Djibouti	5 February 2003		
40. Dominica	17 September 1993		
41. Dominican Republic	4 April 1978	Overdue	
42. Ecuador	3 January 1976		
43. Egypt	14 April 1982		
44. El Salvador	29 February 1980		
45. Equatorial Guinea	25 December 1987		
46. Eritrea	17 July 2001		
47. Estonia	21 January 1992		
48. Ethiopia	11 September 1993		
49. Finland	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.7 (E/C.12/1996/SR.37-38 and 40)	E/C.12/4/Add.1 (E/C.12/2000/SR.61-63) Fifth periodic report due on 30 June 2005
50. France	4 February 1981	Due on 30 June 2006	
51. Gabon	21 April 1983		
52. Gambia	29 March 1979		
53. Georgia	3 August 1994	Due on 30 June 2007	
54. Germany	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.14 (E/C.12/1998/SR.40-42)	E/C.12/4/Add.3 (E/C.12/2001/SR.48-49; E/C.12/1/Add.68); fifth periodic report due on 30 June 2006
55. Ghana	7 December 2000		
56. Greece	16 August 1985		
57. Grenada	6 December 1991		
58. Guatemala	19 August 1988	Due on 30 June 2008	
59. Guinea	24 April 1978		
60. Guinea-Bissau	2 October 1992		

Annex I (*continued*)

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Third periodic reports*	*Fourth periodic reports*
61. Guyana	15 May 1977		
62. Honduras	17 May 1981		
63. Hungary	3 January 1976	Overdue	
64. Iceland	22 November 1979	E/1994/104/Add.25 (E/C.12/2003/SR.14-16)	Due on 30 June 2008
65. India	10 July 1979		
66. Iran (Islamic Republic of)	3 January 1976		
67. Iraq	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.9 (E/C.12/1997/SR.33-35)	Overdue
68. Ireland	8 March 1990	Due on 30 June 2007	
69. Israel	3 January 1992	Due on 30 June 2008	
70. Italy	15 December 1978	E/1994/104/Add.19 (E/C.12/2000/SR.6-8)	E/C.12/4/Add.13 (Received on 23 April 2003) (Pending consideration)
71. Jamaica	3 January 1976	Overdue (was due on 30 June 2003)	
72. Japan	21 September 1979	Due on 30 June 2006	
73. Jordan	3 January 1976	Overdue (was due on 30 June 2003)	
74. Kenya	3 January 1976		
75. Kuwait	31 August 1996		
76. Kyrgyzstan	7 January 1995		
77. Latvia	14 July 1992		
78. Lebanon	3 January 1976		
79. Lesotho	9 December 1992		
80. Libyan Arab Jamahiriya	3 January 1976		
81. Liechtenstein	10 March 1999		
82. Lithuania	20 February 1992		
83. Luxembourg	18 November 1983	E/1994/104/Add.24 (E/C.12/2003/SR.5-6)	Due on 30 June 2008
84. Madagascar	3 January 1976		
85. Malawi	22 March 1994		
86. Mali	3 January 1976		
87. Malta	13 December 1990		
88. Mauritius	3 January 1976		
89. Mexico	23 June 1981	E/1994/104/Add.18 (E/C.12/1999/SR.44-46)	
90. Monaco	28 November 1997		
91. Mongolia	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.21 (E/C.12/2000/SR.34-37)	Overdue (was due on 30 June 2003)
92. Morocco	3 August 1979	Due on 30 June 2004	
93. Namibia	28 February 1995		
94. Nepal	14 August 1991		
95. Netherlands	11 March 1979	Overdue	
96. New Zealand	28 March 1979	Due on 30 June 2008	
97. Nicaragua	12 June 1980		
98. Niger	7 June 1986		
99. Nigeria	29 October 1993		

Annex I *(continued)*

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Third periodic reports*	*Fourth periodic reports*
100. Norway	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.3 (E/C.12/1995/SR.34-37)	Overdue
101. Panama	8 June 1977	Due on 30 June 2004	
102. Paraguay	10 September 1992		
103. Peru	28 July 1978		
104. Philippines	3 January 1976		
105. Poland	18 June 1977	E/1994/104/Add.13 (E/C.12/1998/SR.10-12)	E/C.12/4/Add.9 (E/C.12/2002/SR.33-34) Fifth periodic report due on 30 June 2007
106. Portugal	31 October 1978	E/1994/104/Add.20 (E/C.12/2000/SR.58-60)	Due on 30 June 2005
107. Republic of Korea	10 July 1990	Due on 30 June 2006	
108. Republic of Moldova	26 March 1993		
109. Romania	3 January 1976	Overdue	
110. Russian Federation	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.8 (E/C.12/1997/SR.11-14)	E/C.12/4/Add.10 (E/C/12/2003/SR.41-43) Fifth periodic report due on 30 June 2008
111. Rwanda	3 January 1976		
112. Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	9 February 1982		
113. San Marino	18 January 1986		
114. Senegal	13 May 1978	Overdue (was due on 30 June 2003)	
115. Serbia and Montenegro	12 March 2001		
116. Seychelles	5 August 1982		
117. Sierra Leone	23 November 1996		
118. Slovakia	28 May 1993		
119. Slovenia	6 July 1992		
120. Solomon Islands	17 March 1982		
121. Somalia	24 April 1990		
122. Spain	27 July 1977	E/1994/104/Add.5 (E/C.12/1996/SR.3 and 5-7)	E/C.12/4/Add.11 (Pending consideration)
123. Sri Lanka	11 September 1980		
124. Sudan	18 June 1986		
125. Suriname	28 March 1977		
126. Sweden	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.1 (E/C.12/1995/SR.13, 15-16)	E/C.12/4/Add.4 (E/C.12/2001/SR.61-62) Fifth periodic report due on 30 June 2006
127. Switzerland	18 September 1992		
128. Syrian Arab Republic	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.23 (E/C.12/2001/SR.34-35)	Due on 30 June 2006
129. Tajikistan	4 April 1999		
130. Thailand	5 December 1999		
131. The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	17 September 1991		

Annex I (*continued*)

State party	*Date of entry into force*	*Third periodic reports*	*Fourth periodic reports*
132. Timor-Leste	16 July 2003		
133. Togo	24 August 1984		
134. Trinidad and Tobago	8 March 1979	Due on 30 June 2007	
135. Tunisia	3 January 1976	Due on 30 June 2004	
136. Turkey	23 December 2003		
137. Turkmenistan	1 August 1997		
138. Uganda	21 April 1987		
139. Ukraine	3 January 1976	E/1994/104/Add.4 (E/C.12/1995/SR.42, 44 and 45)	E/C.12/4/Add.2 (E/C.12/2001/SR.40-41; E/C.12/1/Add.65); fifth periodic report due on 30 June 2006
140. United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland	20 August 1976	E/1994/104/Add.10 (Hong Kong) (E/C.12/1996/SR.39, 41, 42 and 44) E/1994/104/Add.11 (E/C.12/1997/SR.36-38) received on 13 April 2000)	E/C.12/4/Add.5 (dependent territories) E/C.12/4/Add.7; E/C.12/4/Add.8 (E/C.12/2002/SR.11-13) Fifth periodic report due on 30 June 2007
141. United Republic of Tanzania	11 September 1976		
142. Uruguay	3 January 1976		
143. Uzbekistan	28 December 1995		
144. Venezuela	10 August 1978	Due on 30 June 2006	
145. Viet Nam	24 December 1982		
146. Yemen	9 May 1987		
147. Zambia	10 July 1984		
148. Zimbabwe	13 August 1991		

---

* The Committee considered the situation in Kenya, without a report, at its eighth session (3rd meeting). It examined the initial report of Kenya (E/1990/5/Add.17) at its tenth session (12th meeting) and requested the State party to submit a new complete report by the end of 1994.

ANNEX II

Members of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

Name of member	*Country of nationality*	Term expires on 31 December
Mr. Clément ATANGANA	Cameroon	2006
Ms. Rocío BARAHONA RIERA	Costa Rica	2004
Ms. Virginia BONOAN-DANDAN	Philippines	2006
Ms. Maria Virginia BRAS GOMES	Portugal	2006
Mr. Dumitru CEAUSU	Romania	2004
Mr. Abdessatar GRISSA	Tunisia	2004
Ms. Chokila IYER	India	2006
Mr. Azzouz KERDOUN	Algeria	2006
Mr. Yuri KOLOSOV	Russian Federation	2006
Mr. Giorgio MALINVERNI	Switzerland	2004
Mr. Jaime MARCHÁN ROMERO	Ecuador	2006
Mr. Sergei MARTYNOV	Belarus	2004
Mr. Ariranga Govindasamy PILLAY	Mauritius	2004
Mr. Kenneth Osborne RATTRAY	Jamaica	2004
Mr. Eibe RIEDEL	Germany	2006
Mr. Waleed M. SADI	Jordan	2004
Mr. Philippe TEXIER	France	2004
Mr. Álvaro TIRADO MEJÍA	Colombia	2006

ANNEX III

A. Agenda of the thirtieth session of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (5-23 May 2003)

1. Opening of the session.
2. Election of officers.
3. Adoption of the agenda.
4. Organization of work.
5. Substantive issues arising in the implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.
6. Consideration of reports:
   - (*a*) Reports submitted by States parties in accordance with articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant;
   - (*b*) Reports submitted by specialized agencies in accordance with article 18 of the Covenant.
7. Submission of reports by States parties in accordance with articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant.
8. Relations with United Nations organs and other treaty bodies.
9. Follow-up to the consideration of reports under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant.
10. Formulation of suggestions and recommendations of a general nature based on the consideration of reports submitted by States parties to the Covenant and by the specialized agencies.
11. Miscellaneous matters.

B. Agenda of the thirty-first session of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (10-28 November 2003)

1. Adoption of the agenda.
2. Organization of work.
3. Substantive issues arising in the implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.
4. Follow-up to the consideration of reports under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant.
5. Relations with United Nations organs and other treaty bodies.

6. Consideration of reports:

   (*a*) Reports submitted by States parties in accordance with articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant;

   (*b*) Reports submitted by specialized agencies in accordance with article 18 of the Covenant.

7. Submission of reports by States parties in accordance with articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant.

8. Formulation of suggestions and recommendations of a general nature based on the consideration of reports submitted by States parties to the Covenant and by the specialized agencies.

9. Adoption of the report.

10. Miscellaneous matters.

ANNEX IV

Recommendations of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights[*] on reform of the treaty body system and the Secretary-General's proposals

A single consolidated report on all human rights treaties

1. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights has come to a consensus that the Secretary-General's proposal[a] of having a single consolidated report on all human rights treaties would not be the appropriate manner of addressing the problems presently faced by the treaty system and the States parties to the various human rights instruments at this time.

2. Some of the Committee's objections are, inter alia, that in a single report important treaty-specific issues could be neglected or marginalized and that such a report would fail to comprise the level of detail presently encountered in reports received by specific committees. The adoption of a single report might furthermore give rise to legal difficulties regarding the individual treaties, which are not easily overcome. In addition, the Committee is concerned that the length of such a single report, were it to cover adequately all substantive issues under all human rights treaties, would be unmanageable for treaty bodies and pose challenges to the secretariat including with respect to processing and translation. These objections concur with some of the objections enumerated in the secretariat's background note on the Secretary-General's proposals on the reform of the treaty body system.

3. Although the idea of a single report is not supported by the Committee, it would merit consideration in the long term, were the United Nations to consider moving towards a mechanism consisting of one single committee for monitoring State compliance with respect to all human rights instruments, which would meet on a permanent basis.

Expanded core document

4. An alternative suggestion that is feasible and viable in the short and midterm emerged from the deliberations, i.e. that the existing core document could be utilized in a more effective manner, and could be expanded to include information that is required under most or all human rights treaties, in addition to what is already required in the core document guidelines. Examples of such overlapping information concern the general human rights legal framework, the issue of non-discrimination and equality, and the situation of specific groups, in particular those which are vulnerable, marginalized or disadvantaged.

---

[*] Adopted by the Committee on 22 May 2003.

[a] Report of the Secretary-General (A/57/387 and Corr.1, para. 54).

Periodic reports

5. As for the periodic reports, the Committee is of the opinion that these should remain treaty-specific, as they would be the primary means of guarding against the objection mentioned above of marginalization of treaty-specific issues and the loss of valuable detailed information.

6. The Committee identified at least three types of information that could be included in the periodic reports:

(*a*) Follow-up to the previous concluding observations of a treaty body;

(*b*) Supplementary information to be provided on the basis of a list of issues or at the specific request of the Committee; and

(*c*) Information on new developments since the consideration of the previous report.

7. Such a structure of periodic reports would avoid repetitions and voluminous documents, which put a heavy burden on both States parties and the United Nations Secretariat.

Follow-up

8. With regard to the follow-up procedure, the Committee would like to explore specific suggestions to improve the present arrangements of the treaty bodies, such as the appointment of a rapporteur on follow-up to concluding observations (a practice adopted by the Committee on Human Rights).

Enhanced coordination and harmonization of working methods of treaty bodies

9. With regard to the Secretary-General's proposal of adopting a more coordinated approach to their activities and standardizing their varied reporting requirements,[a] the Committee agrees that there is an urgent need for such coordination and harmonization of working methods. Various recommendations have been adopted to this end by the meetings of chairpersons of treaty bodies over the years, as well as having been the primary theme of discussion at the first Inter-Committee meeting held in June 2002.

10. The Committee wishes to draw particular attention to the report of the first Inter-Committee meeting of the human rights treaty bodies, which contains valuable recommendations to the various actors in the United Nations treaty system. Specifically on the issue of cooperation between the treaty bodies, the Committee recalls and reaffirms the following recommendations adopted at the first Inter-Committee meeting:[b]

(*a*) Taking account of the universality, indivisibility and interdependence of human rights, treaty bodies should work together in a complementary way in order to underline the holistic nature of the human rights treaty framework;

---

[b] See the Report of the first Inter-Committee meeting (HRI/ICM/2002/3), paras. 50, 52 and 69.

(*b*) Treaty bodies should devise a framework to provide States parties whose reporting obligations under several human rights treaties are almost simultaneous with the option of staggering the dates of their appearance before the different treaty bodies;

(*c*) Treaty bodies should develop procedures for follow-up on concluding observations or comments.

11. The Committee expresses the hope that its aforementioned proposals on an expanded core document and the periodic reports will contribute to further deliberations on the harmonization of the various treaty reporting procedures.

ANNEX V

List of general comments adopted by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

The general comments adopted to date by the Committee appear in the following relevant reports:*

No. 1 (1989): on reporting by States parties (third session; E/1989/22-E/C.12/1989/5, annex III);

No. 2 (1990): on international technical assistance measures (art. 22 of the Covenant) (fourth session; E/1990/23-E/C.12/1990/3 and Corr.1, annex III);

No. 3 (1990): on the nature of States parties' obligations (art. 2, para. 1, of the Covenant) (fifth session; E/1991/23-E/C.12/1990/8 and Corr.1, annex III);

No. 4 (1991): on the right to adequate housing (art. 11, para. 1, of the Covenant) (sixth session; E/1992/23-E/C.12/1991/4, annex III);

No. 5 (1994): on persons with disabilities (eleventh session; E/1995/22-E/C.12/1994/20 and Corr.1, annex IV);

No. 6 (1995): on the economic, social and cultural rights of older persons (thirteenth session; E/1996/22-E/C.12/1995/18, annex IV);

No. 7 (1997): on the right to adequate housing (art. 11, para. 1, of the Covenant): forced evictions (sixteenth session; E/1998/22-E/C.12/1997/10, annex IV);

No. 8 (1997): on the relationship between economic sanctions and respect for economic, social and cultural rights (seventeenth session; E/1998/22-E/C.12/1997/10, annex V);

No. 9 (1998): on domestic application of the Covenant (eighteenth session; E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26, annex IV);

No. 10 (1998): on the role of national human rights institutions in the protection of economic, social and cultural rights (nineteenth session; E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26, annex V);

No. 11 (1999): on plans of action for primary education (art. 14 of the Covenant) (twentieth session; E/2000/22-E/C.12/1999/11 and Corr.1, annex IV);

---

* Published as *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council.*

No. 12 (1999): on the right to adequate food (art. 11 of the Covenant) (twentieth session; E/2000/22-E/C.12/1999/11 and Corr.1, annex V);

No. 13 (1999): on the right to education (art. 13 of the Covenant) (twenty-first session; E/2000/22-E/C.12/1999/11 and Corr.1, annex VI);

No. 14 (2000): on the right to the highest attainable standard of health (art. 12 of the Covenant) (twenty-second session; E/2001/22-E/C.12/2000/22, annex IV);

No. 15 (2002): on the right to water (arts. 11 and 12 of the Covenant) (twenty-ninth session; E/2003/22-E/C.12/2002/13, annex IV).

ANNEX VI

List of statements adopted by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

The statements and recommendations, adopted by the Committee to date, appear in its relevant reports:*

1. Preparatory activities relating to the World Conference on Human Rights: recommendations to the Preparatory Committee for the World Conference (sixth session; E/1992/23-E/C.12/1991/4, chap. IX);

2. Statement to the World Conference on Human Rights on behalf of the Committee (seventh session; E/1993/22-E/C.12/1992/2, annex III);

3. The World Summit for Social Development and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Statement of the Committee (tenth session; E/1995/22-E/C.12/1994/20 and Corr.1, annex V);

4. Economic, social and cultural rights in the context of the World Summit for Social Development: Statement of the Committee (eleventh session; E/1995/22-E/C.12/1994/20 and Corr.1, annex VI);

5. Fourth World Conference on Women: Action for Equality, Development and Peace - Statement by the Committee (twelfth session; E/1996/22-E/C.12/1995/18, annex-VI);

6. United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II); Statement of the Committee (thirteenth session; E/1996/22-E/C.12/1995/18, annex VIII);

7. Globalization and its impact on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights (eighteenth session; E/1999/22-E/C.12/1998/26; chap. VI, sect. A, para. 515);

8. Statement of the Committee to the Third Ministerial Conference of the World Trade Organization (twenty-first session; E/2000/22-E/C.12/1999/11 and Corr.1, annex VII);

9. Statement of the Committee to the Convention to draft a Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union (twenty-second session; E/2001/22-E/C.12/2000/21, annex VIII);

10. Poverty and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights: Statement of the Committee to the Third United Nations Conference on the Least Developed Countries (twenty-fifth session; E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17, annex VII);

---

* Published as *Official Records of the Economic and Social Council.*

11. Statement of the Committee to the special session of the General Assembly for an overall review and appraisal of the implementation of the decisions taken at the United Nations Conference on Human Settlements (Habitat II) (New York, 6 to 8 June 2001) (twenty-fifth session; E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17, annex XI);

12. Statement of the Committee to the International Consultative Conference on School Education in Relation to Freedom of Religion and Belief, Tolerance and Non-Discrimination (twenty-seventh session; E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17, annex XII);

13. Statement of the Committee on human rights and intellectual property (twenty-seventh session; E/2002/22-E/C.12/2001/17, annex XIII);

14. Statement of the Committee to the Commission on Sustainable Development acting as the Preparatory Committee for the World Summit for Sustainable Development (Bali, Indonesia, 27 May-7 June 2002) (twenty-eighth session; E/2003/22-E/C.12/2002/13, annex VI);

15. The Millennium Development Goals and economic, social and cultural rights: joint statement by the Committee and the Special Rapporteurs on economic, social and cultural rights of the Commission on Human Rights (twenty-ninth session; E/2003/22-E/C.12/2002/13, annex VII).

ANNEX VII

Days of general discussion held by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

The following issues have been the focus of discussion:

1. The right to food (third session, 1989);
2. The right to housing (fourth session, 1990);
3. Economic and social indicators (sixth session, 1991);
4. The right to take part in cultural life (seventh session, 1992);
5. The rights of the ageing and elderly (eighth session, 1993);
6. The right to health (ninth session, 1993);
7. The role of social safety nets (tenth session, 1994);
8. Human rights education and public information activities (eleventh session, 1994);
9. The interpretation and practical application of the obligations incumbent on States parties (twelfth session, 1995);
10. A draft optional protocol to the Covenant (thirteenth session, 1995, and fourteenth and fifteenth sessions, 1996);
11. Revision of the general guidelines for reporting (sixteenth session, 1997);
12. The normative content of the right to food (seventeenth session, 1997);
13. Globalization and its impact on the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights (eighteenth session, 1998);
14. The right to education (nineteenth session, 1998);
15. The right of everyone to benefit from the protection of the moral and material interests resulting from any scientific, literary or artistic production of which he is the author (twenty-fourth session, 2000);
16. International consultation on economic, social and cultural rights in development activities of international institutions, organized in cooperation with the High Council for International Cooperation (France) (twenty-fifth session, 2001);
17. Equal right of men and women to the enjoyment of economic, social and cultural rights (art. 3 of the Covenant) (twenty-eighth session, 2002);
18. The right to work (art. 6 of the Covenant) (thirty-first session, 2003).

ANNEX VIII

A. List of States parties' delegations which participated in the consideration of their respective reports by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights at its thirtieth session

GRAND DUCHY OF LUXEMBOURG	*Representative*:	Mr. Alphonse Berns Ambassador Permanent Representative of the Grand Duchy of Luxembourg to the United Nations Office at Geneva
	Advisers:	Mr. Joseph Faber Senior Adviser Ministry of Labour and Employment
		Ms. Mady Kries Senior Inspector Legal and International Affairs, Legal Documentation and Publications Social Security Inspectorate
		Mr. Patrick Thoma Government Attaché Ministry of the Family, Social Solidarity and Youth
		Ms. Anne Goedert Legation Secretary Political Affairs Department Ministry of Foreign Affairs, External Trade, Cooperation, Humanitarian Action and Defence
BRAZIL	*Representative*:	Mr. Antonio Carlos do Nascimento Pedro Head of the Human Rights Division Ministry of External Relations
	Advisers:	Mr. Alexandre Peña Ghisleni Second Secretary Permanent Mission of Brazil to the United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Cláudia de Borba Maciel
Second Secretary
Permanent Mission of Brazil to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

NEW ZEALAND *Representative*: Mr. Tim Caughley
Ambassador
Permanent Representative of New Zealand
to the United Nations Office at Geneva

Advisers: Mr. John Paki
Deputy Chief Executive
Te Puni Kokiri
(Ministry of Maori Development)

Mr. Ross Judge
General Manager
Strategic Social Policy
Ministry of Social Development

Mr. Blair Badcock
Policy Manager
Housing New Zealand Corporation
Ministry of Housing

Ms. Petra Butler
Adviser
Permanent Mission of New Zealand to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Jillian Dempster
First Secretary
Permanent Mission of New Zealand to
the United Nations Office at Geneva

ICELAND *Representative*: Mr. Stefán Haukur Jóhannesson
Ambassador
Permanent Representative of Iceland to
the United Nations Office at Geneva

Advisers: Ms. Björg Thorarensen
Professor
Faculty of Law
University of Iceland

Ms. Hanna Sigrídur Gunnsteinsdóttir
Legal Adviser
Ministry of Social Affairs

Ms. Vilborg Hauksdóttir
Head of Division
Department of Legal Affairs
Ministry of Health and Social Security

Ms. Ingibjörg Davídsdóttir
First Secretary
Permanent Mission of Iceland to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Hildur Björns Vernudóttir
Trainee
Permanent Mission of Iceland to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

ISRAEL *Representative*: Mr. Yaakov Levy
Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary
Permanent Representative of Israel to
the United Nations Office at Geneva

Advisers Ms. Osnat Mandel
Adviser and Director
High Court of Justice Division
State Attorney's Office
Ministry of Justice

Mr. Boaz Oren
Adviser and Deputy Director
Department for International Agreements and
International Litigation
Ministry of Justice

Ms. Eynav Golomb
Adviser and Senior Assistant to the
State Attorney
Ministry of Justice

Mr. Michael Atlan
Adviser and Senior Deputy Legal Adviser
Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs

Ms. Ilana Zailer
Director of Educational Institutions
Administration
Ministry of Education

Mr. Avishai Cohen
Head of Division for Policy
Implementation
Prime Minister's Office

Mr. Guy Bar-Natan
Head of Division for Policy
Implementation
Prime Minister's Office

Ms. Ady Schonmann
Legal Officer
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Mr. Tuvia Israeli
Deputy Permanent Representative
Permanent Mission of Israel to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Teizu Guluma
Adviser
Permanent Mission of Israel to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

B. List of States parties' delegations which participated in the consideration of their respective reports by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights at its thirty-first session

REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA	*Representative*:	Mr. Vitalie Slonovschi Vice-Minister Ministry of Foreign Affairs
	Advisers	Mr. Dumitru Croitor Ambassador Permanent Representative of the Republic of Moldova to the United Nations Office at Geneva

Mr. Vitalie Urechean
First Secretary
Permanent Mission of the
Republic of Moldova to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Rodica Postu
Third Secretary
General Department for International Law and Treaties
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

YEMEN *Representative*: Mr. Mohamed Alfil
Deputy Minister
Ministry of Legal Affairs

Advisers: Mr. Sulaiman Tabrizi
Department of International Reports
Ministry of Human Rights

Mr. Abdullatif Mohamed Alduraibi
Third Secretary
Permanent Mission of Yemen to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Mr. Hamoud Al-Najjar
Attaché
Permanent Mission of Yemen to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

GUATEMALA *Representative*: Mr. Alfonso Fuentes
Chairman, Presidential Human Rights Committee (COPREDEH)

Advisers: Ms. Catalina Soberanis
Office of the Secretary for Peace of
the Presidency

Mr. Mynor Cordón
Deputy Minister of Public Health and
Social Assistance

Mr. Ricardo Alvarado
Ambassador
Permanent Mission of Guatemala to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Angela Chávez
Minister Counsellor
Permanent Mission of Guatemala to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Stephanie Hochstetter
Counsellor
Permanent Mission of Guatemala to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Leslie Corzo
Adviser, COPREDEH

Mr. Lionel Figueredo
Adviser, Office of the Secretary for Peace
of the Presidency

Ms. Blanca Rosa González
Adviser, Office of the Secretary for Peace
of the Presidency

RUSSIAN FEDERATION

Representative

Mr. Alexander Pochinok
Minister of Labour and Social Development

Advisers:

Mr. Leonid Skotnikov
Ambassador
Permanent Representative of the
Russian Federation to the United Nations
Office at Geneva

Mr. Yuri Lub'in
First Deputy Minister
Ministry of Labour and Social Development

Mr. Vladimir Parshikov
Director
Department of International Humanitarian
Cooperation and Human Rights
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Ms. Ludmila Vasilyeva
Head
Department of Social and Civil Legislation
Ministry of Justice

Mr. Alexander Bavykin
Minister Plenipotentiary Deputy Permanent
Representative of the Russian Federation to the
United Nations Office at Geneva

Mr. Svyatoslav Lukyanenko
Head
Division of International Cooperation
Ministry of Labour and Social Development

Ms. Olga Samarina
Head
Division of Socio-Demographic Policy and
Development of Social Security
Ministry of Labour and Social
Development

Ms. Irina Ilyina
Head
Legal Division
Ministry of Culture

Ms. Tatyana Gorbacheva
Head
Labour Statistics Division
State Statistics Committee

Mr. Alexander Ananyev
Deputy Head
Department of Social Policy
Ministry of Economic Development

Ms. Ekaterina Lycheva
Deputy Head
Division of International Cooperation
Ministry of Labour and Social Development

Ms. Tatyana Maximova
Assistant to the Prime Minister

Mr. Sergey Kondratyev
Attaché
Department of International
Humanitarian Cooperation and Human Rights
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Ms. Natalia Arkhipova
Expert
Department of International
Humanitarian Cooperation and Human Rights
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Mr. Yuri Boychenko
Senior Counsellor
Permanent Mission of the Russian
Federation to the United Nations Office
at Geneva

Mr. Sergey Chumarev
First Secretary
Permanent Mission of the Russian
Federation to the United Nations Office
at Geneva

Mr. Alexey Akzhigitov
Second Secretary
Permanent Mission of the Russian Federation
to the United Nations Office
at Geneva

Ms. Yulia Gusynina
Second Secretary
Permanent Mission of the Russian Federation
to the United Nations Office at Geneva

Ms. Zhanna Kharkhan
Second Secretary
Permanent Mission of the Russian Federation
to the United Nations Office at Geneva

DEMOCRATIC PEOPLE'S REPUBLIC OF KOREA

Representative: Mr. Ri Tcheul
Ambassador
Permanent Representative of the
Democratic People's Republic of Korea
to the United Nations Office at Geneva

Advisers: Mr. Jong Chol Won
Deputy Director
Legislation Department
Presidium of the Supreme People's Assembly

Mr. Sim Hyong Il
Legal Councillor of the Central Court

Mr. So Se Pyong
Deputy Permanent Representative of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea to the United Nations Office at Geneva

Mr. Pak Dok Hun
Director
Division on Human Rights
Department of International Organizations
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Mr. Jong Yong Duk
Section Chief of the Legislation Bureau
Presidium of the Supreme People's Assembly

Mr. Kim Won Ho
Adviser on Public Health Administration Policy
Ministry of Health

Mr. Kim Song Chol
Counsellor
Permanent Mission of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea to the United Nations Office at Geneva

Mr. Chae Ryang Il
Counsellor
Embassy of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea to the People's Republic of China

Mr. Kim Yong Ho
Second Secretary Permanent Mission of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea to the United Nations Office at Geneva

ANNEX IX

A. List of documents of the Committee at its thirtieth session

E/1990/5/Add.53	Initial reports submitted by States parties to the Covenant: Brazil
E/1990/6/Add.32	Second periodic reports submitted by States parties to the Covenant: Israel
E/1990/6/Add.33	Idem: New Zealand
E/1994/104/Add.24	Third periodic reports by States parties to the Covenant: Luxembourg
E/1994/104/Add.25	Idem: Iceland
E/2003/22-E/C.12/2002/13	Report of the Committee on its twenty-eighth and twenty-ninth sessions
E/C.12/1	Concluding observations of the Committee on reports submitted by States parties in accordance with articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/1989/L.3/Rev.3	Note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/1990/4/Rev.1	Rules of procedure of the Committee
E/C.12/1993/3/Rev.5	Status of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and reservations, withdrawals, declarations and objections under the Covenant: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/2003/1	Provisional agenda and annotations: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/2003/2	States parties to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the status of the submission of reports in accordance with the programme established by the Economic and Social Council in its resolution 1988/4 and article 58 of the rules of procedure of the Committee: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/2003/3	Follow-up to the consideration of reports under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant: note by the secretariat
E/C.12/2003/4	Programme of work: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/2003/SA/1	Note by the Secretary-General: thirty-first report of the International Labour Organization
E/C.12/2003/L.1	Draft programme of work: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/Q/BRA/1	List of issues: Brazil
E/C.12/Q/ICE/2	Idem: Iceland
E/C.12/Q/ISR/2	Idem: Israel
E/C.12/Q/LUX/2	Idem: Luxembourg

E/C.12/Q/NZE/1	Idem: New Zealand
E/C.12/1/Add.86	Concluding observations of the Committee: Luxembourg
E/C.12/1/Add.87	Idem: Brazil
E/C.12/1/Add.88	Idem: New Zealand
E/C.12/1/Add.89	Idem: Iceland
E/C.12/1/Add.90	Idem: Israel
E/C.12/2003/SR.1-29 and E/C.12/2003/SR.1-29/ Corrigendum	Summary records of the thirtieth session (1st to 29th meetings) of the Committee

B. List of documents of the Committee at its thirty-first session

E/1990/5/Add.52	Initial reports submitted by States parties to the Covenant: Republic of Moldova
E/1990/5/Add.54	Idem: Yemen
E/1990/6/Add.34/Rev.1	Second periodic reports submitted by States parties to the Covenant: Guatemala
E/1990/6/Add.35	Idem: Democratic People's Republic of Korea
E/C.12/4/Add.10	Fourth periodic reports by States parties to the Covenant: Russian Federation
E/2003/22-E/C.12/2002/13	Report of the Committee on its twenty-eighth and twenty-ninth sessions
E/C.12/1	Concluding observations of the Committee on reports submitted by States parties in accordance with articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/1989/L.3/Rev.3	Note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/1990/4/Rev.1	Rules of procedure of the Committee
E/C.12/1993/3/Rev.5	Status of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and reservations, withdrawals, declarations and objections under the Covenant: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/2003/3	Follow-up to the consideration of reports under articles 16 and 17 of the Covenant: note by the secretariat
E/C.12/2003/5	Provisional agenda and annotations: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/2003/6	States parties to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and the status of the submission of reports in accordance with the programme established by the Economic and Social Council in its resolution 1988/4 and article 58 of the rules of procedure of the Committee: note by the Secretary-General

E/C.12/2003/7	Discussion paper submitted by Philippe Texier, member of the Committee: "General comment on the right to work (art. 6) of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights"
E/C.12/2003/8	Background paper submitted by Mr. Richard Siegel, Professor, Department of Political Science, and Faculty Associate, Grant Sawyer Centre for Justice, University of Nevada, United States of America: "Towards a general comment on the right to work: core elements"
E/C.12/2003/9	Background paper submitted by Ms. Elena Gerasimova, Director, Centre for Social and Labour Rights, Moscow, and Ms. Anna Govzditskikh and Ms. Olga Krylova: "The right to work: regulatory content"
E/C.12/2003/10	Background paper submitted by Mr. Akmal Saidov, Director, National Human Rights Centre of Uzbekistan, Tashkent: "The right to work: towards a general comment on article 6 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights"
E/C.12/2003/11	Background paper submitted by Mr. Vassil Mratchkov, Professor, Institute for Legal Studies at the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences, Sofia, and former member of the Committee: "Comments on the draft general comment on the right to work (art. 6 of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights)"
E/C.12/2003/12	Background paper submitted by Ms. Machteld Inge Van Dooren, Researcher, Human Rights Office, Amersfoort, The Netherlands: "The right to work"
E/C.12/2003/13	Programme of work: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/2003/SA/2	Note by the Secretary-General: thirty-second report of the International Labour Organization
E/C.12/2003/L.2	Draft programme of work: note by the Secretary-General
E/C.12/2003/NGO/1	Joint written statement submitted by the Russian non-governmental organizations Patients' Defenders League, Independent Psychiatric Association of Russia, Independent Institute for Social Policy, Centre for Educational Monitoring and Statistics, International Helsinki Federation and the Network of Russian NGOs to promote and protect social and economic rights in the Russian Federation using international instruments
E/C.12/Q/DPRK/1	List of issues: Democratic People's Republic of Korea
E/C.12/Q/GTM/1	Idem: Guatemala
E/C.12/Q/MOL/1	Idem: Republic of Moldova

E/C.12/Q/RUS/2	Idem: Russian Federation
E/C.12/Q/YEM/1	Idem: Yemen
E/C.12/1/Add.91	Concluding observations of the Committee: Republic of Moldova
E/C.12/1/Add.92	Idem: Yemen
E/C.12/1/Add.93	Idem: Guatemala
E/C.12/1/Add.94	Idem: Russian Federation
E/C.12/1/Add.95	Idem: Democratic People's Republic of Korea
E/C.12/2003/SR.30-56 and E/C.12/2003/SR.30-56/ Corrigendum	Summary records of the thirty-first session (30th to 56th meetings) of the Committee

-----